

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

ETHICON LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2019-00880
U.S. Patent No. 7,490,749

PATENT OWNER ETHICON LLC'S SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. ETHICON’S § 112(6) CONSTRUCTION OF RETRACTION ASSEMBLY SHOULD BE ADOPTED.....	3
III. THE CLAIMS OF THE 749 PATENT ARE NOT ANTICIPATED	6
A. A POSITA Would Not Immediately Envision Removal of Shelton II’s Retraction Spring.....	6
1. Paragraph [0154] Does Not Describe Removing Shelton II’s Retraction Spring.....	6
B. Shelton II Does Not Disclose That the Retraction Spring is Optional	9
C. Shelton II/Swayze Do Not Anticipate if the Retraction Spring Becomes Disconnected	11
1. Ethicon’s Litigation Position Does Not Support Petitioner’s Argument.....	12
2. Shelton II/Swayze Do Not Disclose Using the Instrument if the Spring Disconnects	13
D. Ground 3 Based on Shelton I is Moot.....	14
IV. SHELTON II/SWAYZE DO NOT RENDER CLAIMS 1 AND 3 OBVIOUS.....	15
A. Force to Fire Would Not Have Motivated a POSITA to Remove the Retraction Spring.....	15
B. Parts Count and Cost Would Not Have Motivated a POSITA to Remove the Retraction Spring	18

C. Conventional Wisdom Confirms that the Claims are Non-Obvious19

■ [REDACTED]

■ [REDACTED]

■ [REDACTED]

■ [REDACTED]

■ [REDACTED]

VI. CONCLUSION.....28

Exhibit List FOR IPR2019-00880

Exhibit #	Description
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
Ex. 2010	U.S. Patent No. 5,465,895 (1995)
Ex. 2011	U.S. Patent No. 5,632,432 (1997)
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
Ex. 2016	<i>In the Matter of Certain Reload Cartridges for Laparoscopic Surgical Staplers</i> , Inv. No. 337-TA-1167, Order 15: Construing the Terms of the Asserted Claims of the Patents at Issue (January 7, 2020)

Exhibit #	Description
[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
Ex. 2018	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Bryan Knodel (December 13, 2019)
Ex. 2019C	Declaration of Shorya Awtar
Ex. 2020	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Bryan Knodel (May 14, 2020)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.