UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

PARUS HOLDINGS, INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2020-00686
U.S. Patent No. 7,076,431

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY TO
PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. LADD DOES NOT TEACH OR DISCLOSE LIMITATION 1(C): "SPEAKER-INDEPENDENT SPEECH RECOGNITION DEVICE" 2

A. Parus's Construction of "Speaker-Independent Speech Recognition Device" is Consistent with the District Court's Construction and the Intrinsic Record 3

1. Parus's construction is consistent with the District Court's construction. 4

2. The plain and ordinary meaning should be afforded to the term "voice pattern" 4

B. The Plain Disclosure of Ladd Demonstrates that Speech Recognition in Ladd is Dependent on Voice Patterns 6

1. Apple's identified speech recognition device operates in a manner proscribed by the '431 Patent 7

2. Ladd's use of a speech to text unit further undermines Apple's argument 8

C. Apple's Attempt to Conflate Speech Recognition with Natural Language Processing is Not Tenable 10

1. Speech Recognition does not include natural language processing 10

2. Mr. Occhiogrosso's testimony does not support Apple's two-step speech recognition theory 13

D. Ladd's Disclosed "Voice Patterns" Are The Same "Voice Patterns" Excluded By The District Court's Construction 15

III. MR. OCCHIOGROSSO'S OPINIONS SHOULD BE GIVEN GREATER WEIGHT THAN DR. TERVEEN'S 18

IV. CLAIM LIMITATION 1(K) 19

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

V. MOTIVATION TO COMBINE.....21

VI. CLAIMS 5-6.....23

VII. CONCLUSION.....23

DOCKET ALARM Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

ATD Corp. v. Lydall, Inc.,
159 F.3d 534 (Fed. Cir. 1998) 22

In re Enhanced Security Research, LLC,
739 F.3d 1347 (Fed. Cir. 2014) 22

In re Fine,
837 F.2d 1071 (Fed. Cir. 1988) 22

In re Gorman,
983 F.2d 982 (Fed. Cir. 1991) 22

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit	Description
2001	Order Denying Motion to Stay Pending *Inter Partes* Review, C.A. No. 6:18-cv-00207-ADA
2002	Exhibit A3 Ladd Claim Chart 7076431
2003	Exhibit C Obviousness Claim Chart 7076431 (Corrected)
2004	Reserved
2005	Reserved
2006	Standing Order Regarding Scheduled Hearings in Civil Cases, 6:19-cv-00432-ADA
2007	Claim Construction Order, 1:20-cv-00351-ADA
2008	Claim Construction Order, 6:19-cv-00532-ADA
2009	Claim Construction Order, 6:18-cv-00308-ADA
2010	U.S. Patent No. 6,157,705 (Perrone)
2011	"instruction set" excerpt from 1997 Novell's Dictionary of Networking
2012	Defendants' Opening Claim Construction Brief, 6:19-cv-00432-ADA
2013	Excerpt of Case Docket Sheet, 6-19-cv-00278-ADA
2014	Excerpt of Case Docket Sheet, 6-19-cv-00514-ADA
2015	Excerpt of Case Docket Sheet, 6-19-cv-00515-ADA
2016	Excerpt of Case Docket Sheet, 7-18-cv-00147-ADA
2017	Markman Hearing Transcript, 6:19-CV-00432-ADA
2018	10/2/2020 Email to Court
2019	Excerpt of Case Docket Sheet, 6:18-cv-00308-ADA
2020	5/30/2019 Order Denying Stay, C.A. No. 6:18-cv-00207
2021	6/23/2020 Order Denying Stay, C.A. No. 6:19-cv-00514
2022	6/23/2020 Order Denying Stay, C.A. No. 6:19-cv-00515
2023	7/22/2020 Order Denying Stay, C.A. No. 7:18-cv-00147
2024	December 16, 2020 Deposition Transcript of Loren Terveen, Ph.D.
2025	Declaration of Benedict Occhiogrosso in Support of Patent Owner's Response to *Inter Partes* Review of U.S. Patent No. 7,076,431
2026	Dragon Naturally Speaking v.12 User Guide
2027	Declaration of Benedict Occhiogrosso in Support of Patent Owner's Sur-Reply to Petitioner's Reply to Patent Owner's Response

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.