

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

DELL INC.,
ZTE (USA) INC.,
and
ZTE CORPORATION,
Petitioners

v.

3G LICENSING S.A.,
Patent Owner

Case IPR2020-01157

U.S. Patent No. 7,274,933

**PATENT OWNER'S MOTION FOR *PRO HAC VICE* ADMISSION
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.10(c)**

Mail Stop PATENT BOARD
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450
Submitted Electronically via PTAB E2E

I. STATEMENT OF THE PRECISE RELIEF REQUESTED

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.10(c) and 42.22, Patent Owner 3G Licensing S.A. (“3G”) respectfully requests that the Board recognize Neil Benchell of Devlin Law Firm LLC as backup counsel *pro hac vice* during this proceeding. The facts, supported by the attached Declaration of Neil Benchell in Support of Motion for Admission *Pro Hac Vice* (“Benchell Decl.”, Exhibit 2003), establish good cause to admit Mr. Benchell *pro hac vice* in this proceeding. Patent Owner conferred with Petitioners, and Petitioners confirmed that they do not oppose this Motion.

II. STATEMENT OF FACTS

The following statement of facts shows that there is good cause for the Board to recognize Mr. Benchell *pro hac vice*. Mr. Benchell is a litigation attorney and has an established familiarity with the subject matter at issue in this proceeding.

Lead counsel for Patent Owner, Timothy Devlin, is a registered practitioner (Reg. No. 41,706) and experienced in *inter partes* proceedings in the USPTO. Along with Timothy Devlin, Mr. Benchell represents 3G Licensing S.A. in connection with the pending district actions captioned *Sisvel International S.A. and 3G Licensing S.A. v. Cradlepoint, Inc.*, Case No. 19-1142-MN (D. Del.); *Sisvel International S.A. and 3G Licensing S.A. v. Dell, Inc.*, Case No. 19-01247-MN (D. Del.); *Sisvel International S.A. and 3G Licensing S.A. v. ZTE (USA) Inc. and ZTE Corporation*, Case No. 3:19-cv-01694-N (N.D. Tex.).

Neil Benchell joined Devlin Law Firm LLC as an intellectual property litigation attorney in 2018 and has been practicing in that capacity for 20 years at several other law firms. Mr. Benchell has primarily focused his practice on patent litigation. In that time, Mr. Benchell has gained experience conducting technical infringement and validity analysis, working with technical experts to prepare reports on infringement and validity issues, preparing for depositions of technical experts and fact witnesses, briefing claim construction issues, preparing for *Markman* hearings, and representing clients in patent litigation trials and hearings before district courts around the country. (Benchell Decl. ¶ 1.)

Mr. Benchell is a member in good standing of the Bar of Illinois. (*Id.* at ¶ 2.)

Mr. Benchell has never been suspended or disbarred from practice before any court or administrative body. (*Id.* at ¶ 3.) He has never had an application for admission to practice before any court or administrated body denied. (*Id.*) Nor has any court or administrative body imposed sanctions or contempt citations against him. (*Id.*)

Mr. Benchell has read and will comply with the Office Patent Trial Practice Guide and the Board's Rules of Practice for Trials set forth in part 42 of the C.F.R. (*Id.* at ¶ 4.) Mr. Benchell will be subject to the United States Patent and Trademark Office Code of Professional Responsibility set forth in 37 C.F.R. § 10.20 *et seq.* and disciplinary jurisdiction under 37 C.F.R. § 11.19(a). (*Id.* at ¶ 5.)

Mr. Benchell is concurrently applying for *pro hac vice* admission in the following proceedings: IPR2020-1158, IPR2020-1159, IPR2020-1160, IPR2020-1161, IPR2020-1162. He was previously admitted *pro hac vice* in IPR proceeding IPR2020-00451, IPR2020-1070, IPR2020-1071, IPR2020-1099, IPR2020-1102 and IPR2020-1103. (*Id.* at ¶ 6.)

Mr. Benchell is an experienced litigation attorney and has established familiarity with the subject matter at issue in this proceeding. (*Id.* at ¶¶ 7-8.) He is familiar with U.S. Patent No. 7,274,933 and all prior art references and alleged grounds of invalidity relied upon by Petitioners in this proceeding. (*Id.* at ¶ 8.) Mr. Benchell also participated in drafting the Patent Owner's Preliminary Response in this proceeding. (*Id.*) Moreover, Mr. Benchell has engaged and will continue to engage in extensive strategic and substantive discussions regarding this proceeding with Timothy Devlin, who is a registered practitioner and the lead counsel for 3G in this proceeding. (*Id.*)

Therefore, Patent Owner respectfully submits that there is good cause for the Board to recognize Mr. Benchell as counsel *pro hac vice* during this proceeding.

III. ANALYSIS

The facts contained in the Statement of Facts above and Mr. Benchell's Declaration establish that there is good cause to admit Mr. Benchell *pro hac vice* in this proceeding under 37 C.F.R. § 42.10 as backup counsel. Lead counsel Timothy

Devlin is a registered practitioner and experienced in *inter partes* proceedings in the USPTO. Mr. Benchell is an experienced patent litigation attorney and has an established familiarity with the subject matter at issue in this proceeding.

IV. CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, Patent Owner respectfully requests that the Board admit Neil Benchell *pro hac vice* in this proceeding.

Dated: May 7, 2021

DEVLIN LAW FIRM LLC

/s/ Timothy Devlin

Timothy Devlin

Registration No. 41,706

1526 Gilpin Avenue

Wilmington, DE 19806

(302)-449-9010

TD-PTAB@devlinlawfirm.com

Attorney for Patent Owner

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.