

Filed: November 12, 2021

Filed on behalf of:

Patent Owner Masimo Corporation
By: Joseph R. Re (Reg. No. 31,291)
Stephen W. Larson (Reg. No. 69,133)
Jarom D. Kesler (Reg. No. 57,046)
Jacob L. Peterson (Reg. No. 65,096)
KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON & BEAR, LLP
2040 Main Street, Fourteenth Floor
Irvine, CA 92614
Tel.: (949) 760-0404
Fax: (949) 760-9502
E-mail: AppleIPR2020-1521-628@knobbe.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.

Petitioner,

v.

MASIMO CORPORATION,

Patent Owner.

Case IPR2020-01521
U.S. Patent 10,292,628

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY TO REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page No.
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. ARGUMENT.....	2
A. Grounds 1A-1E.....	2
1. Petitioner’s New Evidence And Arguments Address An Argument Masimo Never Made	2
a) The Principle Of Reversibility Is Irrelevant To Petitioner’s Proposed Combination.....	7
b) Petitioner’s Other New Theories Are Similarly Misplaced.....	10
2. Petitioner Does Not Establish A Motivation To Modify Aizawa’s Sensor To Include Both Multiple Detectors And Multiple LEDs	14
3. Ground 1B: Ohsaki Would Not Have Motivated A POSITA To Add A Convex Protrusion To Aizawa’s Sensor.....	17
B. Grounds 2A-2B	21
1. A POSITA Would Not Have Added A Convex Surface To Mendelson-1988’s Sensor	21
2. Petitioner’s Proposed Combination Does Not Include A “Cover”	21
3. Petitioner’s Proposed Combination Does Not Include The Claimed “Circular Housing”	24

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd)

	Page No.
4. Petitioner Uses Nishikawa As Far More Than A “Supporting Reference”	24
III. CONCLUSION.....	25

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page No(s).

<i>DePuy Spine, Inc. v. Medtronic Sofamor Danek, Inc.</i> , 567 F. 3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2009)	19
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005) (<i>en banc</i>)	22

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description
2001	Reserved
2002	Reserved
2003	Reserved
2004	Declaration of Dr. Vijay K. Madiseti
2005	Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Vijay K. Madiseti
2006	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Thomas W. Kenny in <i>Apple Inc. v. Masimo Corp.</i> , IPR2020-01520, IPR2020-01537, IPR2020-01539 (April 22, 2021)
2007	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Thomas W. Kenny in <i>Apple Inc. v. Masimo Corp.</i> , IPR2020-01520, IPR2020-01537, IPR2020-01539 (April 23, 2021)
2008	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Thomas W. Kenny in <i>Apple Inc. v. Masimo Corp.</i> , IPR2020-01536, IPR2020-01538 (April 24, 2021)
2009	Deposition Transcript of Dr. Thomas W. Kenny in <i>Apple Inc. v. Masimo Corp.</i> , IPR2020-01536, IPR2020-01538 (April 25, 2021)
2010	Frank H. Netter, M.D., Section VI Upper Limb, Atlas of Human Anatomy (2003), Third Edition (“Netter”)
2011	Declaration of Dr. Thomas W. Kenny in <i>Apple Inc. v. Masimo Corp.</i> , IPR2020-01536
2012	Webster, Design of Pulse Oximeters (1997)
2013	Reserved
2014	Reserved

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.