

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SOUTHERN DIVISION - SANTA ANA

PINN, INC,) CASE NO: 8:19-CV-01805-DOC-JDE
)
Plaintiff,) CIVIL
)
vs.) Santa Ana, California
)
APPLE, INC,) Monday, March 16, 2020
) (9:10 a.m. to 9:57 a.m.)
Defendant.) (5:07 p.m. to 5:36 p.m.)
) (5:51 p.m. to 6:23 p.m.)

MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE

BEFORE THE HONORABLE DAVID O. CARTER,
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES: SEE PAGE 2

Court Reporter: Recorded; CourtSmart

Courtroom Deputy: Kelly Davis

Transcribed by: Exceptional Reporting Services, Inc.
P.O. Box 8365
Corpus Christi, TX 78468
361 949-2988

Proceedings recorded by electronic sound recording;
transcript produced by transcription service.

APPEARANCES FOR:

Plaintiff:

RYAN E. HATCH, ESQ.
Law Office of Ryan E. Hatch, PC
13323 Washington Blvd., Suite 100
Los Angeles, CA 90066

DAVID A. SKEELS, ESQ.
Whitaker Chalk Swindle & Schwartz
301 Commerce St., Suite 3500
Fort Worth, TX 76102

Defendant:

CHRISTOPHER S. MARCHESE, ESQ.
Fish & Richardson, PC
633 West 5th Street, 26th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071

SETH M. SPROUL, ESQ.
Fish & Richardson, PC
12390 El Camino Real
San Diego, CA 92130

RYAN M. NISHIMOTO, ESQ.
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer
777 S. Figueroa St., 44th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90014

JEFFREY M. BARRON, ESQ.
TODD G. VARE, ESQ.
Barnes & Thornburg
11 S. Meridian St.
Indianapolis, IN 46204

SETH A. GOLD, ESQ.
Barnes & Thornburg
2029 Century Park East, Suite 300
Los Angeles, CA 90067

1 Santa Ana, California; Monday, March 16, 2020; 9:10 a.m.

2 (Call to order)

3 **THE COURT:** First of all, if you'd be kind enough to
4 make your appearances. I know who you are but just for our
5 record. Let me start with the Plaintiff for just a moment.

6 **MR. SKEELS:** David Skeels on behalf of Plaintiff,
7 your Honor.

8 **THE COURT:** All right, now let's go slowly. You
9 represent Pinn of course. And you're David Skeels from Texas.

10 **MR. SKEELS:** Yes, sir.

11 **THE COURT:** Pleasure. And your hands are in your
12 pocket and you can take them out of your pocket now. And,
13 counsel, you should be -- is it Cabrach Connor?

14 **MR. HATCH:** No, I'm Ryan Hatch, local counsel.

15 **THE COURT:** Well where's Cabrach Connor? I don't
16 know who you are. You're not on my list.

17 **MR. SKEELS:** Ryan Hatch is our local counsel.

18 **THE COURT:** Okay.

19 **MR. SKEELS:** And when we were here --

20 **THE COURT:** Here, Tony, give this to counsel. I must
21 have missed your last time.

22 **MR. HATCH:** I've been here.

23 **THE COURT:** So it's my fault. So I'm going to turn
24 to -- yeah, no, that's not what I'm looking at, though. I'm
25 looking at this. All the underline is mine -- and would you

1 **THE COURT:** Just one.

2 **MR. SKEELS:** -- one was here --

3 **THE COURT:** Yeah, one. You're okay. I just want to
4 make sure is we start flip-flopping around.

5 **MR. SKEELS:** Yes, your Honor.

6 **THE COURT:** Okay.

7 **MR. SKEELS:** I've been identified on all the
8 pleadings as lead counsel --

9 **THE COURT:** Okay.

10 **MR. HATCH:** And we --

11 **THE COURT:** And then, sir, I apologize to you because
12 I remember you but I don't remember your name. So once again,
13 my apologies.

14 **MR. HATCH:** Ryan Hatch, your Honor.

15 **THE COURT:** Ryan Hatch, okay.

16 **MR. HATCH:** Yes.

17 **THE COURT:** Thank you very much. And is it R-Y-A-N?

18 **MR. HATCH:** Yes, your Honor.

19 **THE COURT:** Thank you so much.

20 **MR. SKEELS:** And our client, Mr. Sean Kim, is here in
21 the courtroom with us today as well, your Honor.

22 **THE COURT:** Okay. And where is that gentleman
23 located? Oh, thank you very much, sir. It's a pleasure to
24 meet you.

25 Then for Apple I should have Christopher is it

1 Marchese?

2 **MR. MARCHESE:** Marchese, your --

3 **THE COURT:** Marchese, I apologize --

4 **MR. MARCHESE:** That's fine, your Honor.

5 **THE COURT:** -- for the mispronouncing (indisc.) it's
6 nice to see you.

7 **MR. MARCHESE:** Nice to see you, too.

8 **THE COURT:** And Seth Sproul, and you're from San
9 Diego?

10 **MR. SPROUL:** Good morning, your Honor.

11 **THE COURT:** San Diego?

12 **MR. SPROUL:** Yes, that's right, your Honor.

13 **THE COURT:** Okay, thank you. It's nice to have you
14 here. And then I do have a -- and is -- are there any other
15 counsel who you think might be making an appearance now or in
16 the future on this case?

17 **MR. MARCHESE:** Your Honor, we may have on occasion
18 another, a lawyer at Fish and Richardson --

19 **THE COURT:** Who?

20 **MR. MARCHESE:** -- named Tucker Terhufen.

21 **THE COURT:** And where is that person located?

22 **MR. MARCHESE:** He's in San Diego, and he may be
23 appearing later in the case.

24 **THE COURT:** Well, --

25 **MR. MARCHESE:** He's on the pleadings currently.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.