

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

AMAZON.COM, INC.
Petitioner

v.

VOCALIFE LLC,
Patent Owner

Patent No. RE47,049
Filing Date: October 14, 2016
Date of Reissued Patent: September 18, 2018
Title: MICROPHONE ARRAY SYSTEM

**VOCALIFE LLC'S
PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

Case No. IPR2020-00864

IPR PETITION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	3
II.	THE '049 PATENT	4
III.	THE PETITION SHOULD BE DENIED IN THE DISCRETION OF THE DIRECTOR UNDER EITHER 35 U.S.C. § 314(A).....	9
A.	The Parallel District Court Proceeding and the Petition Involve the Same Parties	11
B.	The Parallel District Court Proceeding and the Petition Involve the Same References, Same Arguments, and “Substantially Identical” Claims.....	12
C.	Proximity of The District Court’s Trial Date.....	17
D.	Significant Investment and Petitioner’s Delay in Filing the Petition .	20
E.	No Stay of the Parallel District Court Proceeding	25
F.	Other Factors Favor Discretionary Denial	25
IV.	PETITIONER HAS NOT DEMONSTRATED A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF SUCCESS FOR THE GROUNDS ADVANCED IN THE PETITION, AND THE PETITION SHOULD BE DENIED.	26
A.	Requirements for Showing Obviousness Under 35 U.S.C. § 103.	26
B.	Saric Does Not Disclose The Digital Signal Processor Limitations...	27
C.	Li Does Not Disclose The Digital Signal Processor Limitations	30
V.	CONCLUSION.....	32

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases:

<i>Apple Inc. v. Fintiv, Inc.</i> , IPR2020-00019, Paper 11 (P.T.A.B. Mar. 20, 2020).....	13, 15, 23, 30
<i>Bell Atl. Corp. v. Twombly</i> , 550 U.S. 544, 570, 127 S.Ct. 1955, 167 L.Ed.2d 929 (2007)	18, 31
<i>Bumble Trading Inc. v. Match Group, LLC</i> , IPR2019-01538, Paper 13 (P.T.A.B. Mar. 11, 2020).....	19, 20
<i>Cisco Sys., Inc. v. Ramot at Tel Aviv Univ. Ltd.</i> , IPR2020-00123, Paper 14 (P.T.A.B. May 15, 2020)	22, 25
<i>Edward Life Scis. Corp. v. Evalve, Inc.</i> , IPR2019-01479, Paper 7 (P.T.A.B. Feb. 26, 2020)	24
<i>Ericsson Inc. v. Intellectual Ventures II LLC</i> , IPR2018-01689, Paper 15 (P.T.A.B. Apr. 16, 2019)	20, 21
<i>Gen. Plastic Indus. Co., Ltd. v. Canon Kabushiki Kaisha</i> , IPR2016-01357, Paper 19 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 6, 2017)	16
<i>K-Tech Telecomms., Inc. v. Time Warner Cable, Inc.</i> , 714 F.3d 1277 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	18, 31
<i>Next Caller Inc. v. TrustID, Inc.</i> , IPR2019-00961, -00962, Paper 10 (P.T.A.B. Oct. 16, 2019)	24, 30
<i>NHK Spring Co., Ltd. v. Intri-Plex Techs., Inc.</i> , IPR2018-00752, Paper 8 (P.T.A.B. Sept. 12, 2018)	15
<i>Optis Wireless Tech., LLC v. Apple Inc.</i> , Case No. 2:19-cv-00066-JRG, Dkt. 387 (E.D. Tex. July 21, 2020)	25
<i>Samsung Elecs. Am., Inc. v. Uniloc 2017 LLC</i> , IPR2019-01218, Paper 7 (P.T.A.B. Jan. 7, 2020)	24

<i>Supercell Oy v. Gree, Inc.</i> , IPR2020-00215, Paper 10 (P.T.A.B. June 10, 2020)	24, 26, 29
<i>Vocalife LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com LLC</i> , Case No. 2:19-cv-00123-JRG, Dkt. 83 (E.D. Tex. Apr. 6, 2020).....	28
<i>Vocalife LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com, LLC</i> , Case No. 2:19-cv-00123-JRG, Dkt. 87 (E.D. Tex. Apr 17, 2020).....	23, 27

Statutes:

35 U.S.C. § 314(a)	passim
35 U.S.C. §§ 314(b)(1).....	23
35 U.S.C. § 316(a)(11).....	23

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description of Document
2001	Correspondence from Defendants Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com, LLC Regarding Asserted Claims, dated January 7, 2020 from <i>Vocalife LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com LLC</i> , No. 2:19-cv-00123-JRG (E.D. Tex.)
2002	Correspondence from Plaintiff Vocalife LLC Regarding Reduction of Prior Art References, dated May 21, 2020 from <i>Vocalife LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com LLC</i> , No. 2:19-cv-00123-JRG (E.D. Tex.)
2003	Defendants Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com LLC's Second Supplemental Invalidity Contentions from <i>Vocalife LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com LLC</i> , No. 2:19-cv-00123-JRG (E.D. Tex.)
2004	Second Amended Docket Control Order from <i>Vocalife LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com LLC</i> , No. 2:19-cv-00123-JRG, Dkt. 87 (E.D. Tex. Apr. 17, 2020)
2005	Order on Motion to Continue Trial from <i>Optis Wireless Technology, LLC et al. v. Apple Inc.</i> , No. 2:19-cv-00066, Dkt. 287 (E.D. Tex. July 21, 2020)
2006	Siegal, Daniel, <i>Why Gilstrap Is Getting Ready for Trial—And Not On Zoom</i> , Law360 (May 15, 2020 6:04 p.m.), https://www.law360.com/articles/1273188/print?section=corporate
2007	Plaintiff Vocalife LLC's Second Amended Disclosure of Asserted Claims and Infringement Contentions, dated May 6, 2020 from <i>Vocalife LLC v. Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com LLC</i> , No. 2:19-cv-00123-JRG (E.D. Tex.)



Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.