

By: Andrew O Larsen, Ph.D., Esq. Christopher J. Sorenson, Esq.
Reg. No. 59,315 *Pro Hac Vice*
MERCHANT & GOULD P.C. MERCHANT & GOULD P.C.
500 Fifth Avenue, Suite 4100 150 South Fifth Street, Suite 2200
New York, NY 10110 Minneapolis, MN 55402
Main Telephone: (212) 223-6658 Main Telephone: (612) 336-4645
Main Facsimile: (212) 223-6521 Main Facsimile: (612) 332-9081
alarsen@merchantgould.com csorenson@merchantgould.com

Melissa Hayworth, Esq.
Registration No. 45,774
MERCHANT & GOULD P.C.
1900 Duke Street, Suite 600
Alexandria, VA 22314
Main Telephone: (703) 684-2522
Main Facsimile: (612) 332-9081
mhayworth@merchantgould.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MSN LABORATORIES PRIVATE LTD. AND MSN PHARMACEUTICALS INC.
Petitioners

v.

BAUSCH HEALTH IRELAND LIMITED,
Patent Owner

IPR2023-00016
Patent No. 7,041,786

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
UNDER 35 U.S.C. §§ 311-319 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.100 *ET SEQ.***

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. MANDATORY NOTICES UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.8.....	1
A. Real Parties-In-Interest under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1).....	1
B. Related Matters under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2).....	2
C. Lead and Backup Counsel under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3).....	2
D. Service Information under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(4).....	3
E. Power of Attorney under 37 C.F.R. §42.10(b).....	3
II. REQUIREMENTS FOR IPR UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.104.....	3
A. Grounds For Standing Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(a)	3
B. Identification of Challenge and Precise Relief Requested, 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b).....	4
III. SUMMARY OF THE SHAILUBHAI PATENT.....	6
A. Specification	6
B. Challenged Claims 1–6.....	13
C. Prosecution History	14
IV. LEVEL OF SKILL AND KNOWLEDGE IN THE ART.....	15
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	16
VI. PRIOR ART.....	17
A. Background.....	17
B. Currie (EX1005).....	24
C. Li (EX1006).....	26
D. Narayani (EX1007).....	28
E. Campieri (EX1008)	29
F. Ekwuribe (EX1009).....	30
VII. GROUNDS FOR UNPATENTABILITY.....	33
A. Legal Standards	33
B. Ground 1: Claim 1 Is Obvious Over Currie and Li.....	34
1. Claim 1	34
2. Reason to Modify	36

C. Ground 2: Claims 2, 4, and 5 Are Obvious Over Currie, Li, and Narayani.....	42
1. Claim 2	42
2. Claims 4 and 5	44
D. Ground 3: Claims 3-5 Are Obvious Over Currie, Li, Narayani, and Campieri.....	46
E. Ground 4: Claim 6 Is Obvious Over Currie, Li, and Ekwuribe (1994)	52
VIII. THERE ARE NO SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS.....	55
IX. THE BOARD SHOULD NOT DECLINE TO INSTITUTE BASED ON ITS DISCRETIONARY AUTHORITY UNDER 35 U.S.C. §§ 314(a) or 315(d)	56
A. Co-pending Litigation	56
B. Prior Office Consideration	58
X. PAYMENT OF FEES UNDER 37 C.F.R. §§ 42.15(A) AND 42.103.....	60

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Amneal Pharms. v. Supernus Pharms.</i> , IPR2013-00368 (PTAB Dec. 17, 2013)	55
<i>Apple v. Fintiv</i> , IPR2020-00019	57, 58
<i>Bausch Health Ireland Limited et al v. Mylan Laboratories Ltd. et al.</i> , 1-21-cv-00611 (DDE)	2, 64
<i>Bausch Health Ireland Ltd. et al v. Mylan Laboratories Limited et al.</i> , 2-21-cv-00573 (WDPA)	2
<i>Bayer Pharma AG v. Watson Labs., Inc.</i> , 874 F.3d 1316 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	40
<i>CRFD Research, Inc. v. Matal</i> , 876 F.3d 1330 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	41
<i>In re Diamond</i> , 360 F.2d 214 (CCPA 1966)	51
<i>In re Dillon</i> , 919 F.2d 688 (Fed. Cir. 1990) (<i>en banc</i>)	33, 34, 55
<i>In re Fout</i> , 675 F.2d 297 (Fed. Cir. 1982)	41
<i>In re Fulton</i> , 391 F.3d 1195 (Fed. Cir. 2004)	41
<i>Google LLC v. Koninklijke Philips N.V.</i> , 795 Fed. Appx. 840 (Fed. Cir. 2020)	41
<i>In re Harris</i> , 409 F.3d 1339 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	34, 55

<i>Intel Corp. v. VLSI Tech. LLC</i> , IPR2022-00366, Paper No. 14 (PTAB Jun. 8, 2022)	60
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007).....	33, 40
<i>Merck & Co. v. Biocraft Labs.</i> , 874 F.2d 804 (Fed. Cir. 1989)	41
<i>In re Mouttet</i> , 686 F.3d 1322 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	41
<i>Par Pharm. v. TWI Pharm.</i> , 773 F.3d 1186 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	41
PTAB— <i>Mylan Pharmaceuticals Inc. v. Bausch Health Ireland Ltd.</i> IPR2022-00722	2, 63
<i>Spectrum Pharm. v. Sandoz Inc.</i> , 802 F.3d 1326 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	41
<i>Tyco Healthcare Group v. Ethicon Endo-Surgery</i> , 774 F.3d 968 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	41
<i>Uber Tech., Inc. v. X One, Inc.</i> , 957 F.3d 1334 (Fed. Cir. 2020)	46
<i>Valeant Pharmaceuticals Ireland Ltd. et al v. MSN Laboratories Private Limited et al.</i> , 2-21-cv-10057 (DNJ).....	2, 56
<i>Valeant Pharmaceuticals Ireland Ltd. et al v. Mylan Laboratories Limited et al.</i> , 2-21-cv-10403 (DNJ).....	2
Statutes	
35 U.S.C. § 102(b)	<i>passim</i>
35 U.S.C. § 103	4, 5, 40
35 U.S.C. § 112	<i>passim</i>
35 U.S.C. §§ 311-319	63

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.