

December 12, 2022

**VIA E-MAIL**

J. Stephen Ravel  
Kelly Hart & Hallman LLP  
303 Colorado St., Suite 2000  
Austin, TX 78701  
Phone: (512) 495-6400

**Re:      *Spacetime3D, Inc. v. Apple Inc., Case No. 6:22-cv-00149 (W.D. Tex.)***

Dear Counsel:

Apple Inc. (“**Apple**”) has filed an *inter partes* review (IPR) petition (IPR2023-00343) with the Patent Trial and Appeal Board (PTAB) to address the validity of claims 1-19 of U.S. Patent No. 9,304,654. The tables in attached Appendix A list all the grounds, challenged claims, and references asserted in IPR2023-00343.

I write to inform you that Apple hereby stipulates that if the PTAB institutes IPR2023-00343 based on the grounds and claims listed in the tables in Appendix A, Apple will not pursue in the District Court the specific grounds raised in IPR2023-00343 against claims 1-19 of U.S. Patent No. 9,304,654. *See Sand Revolution II, LLC v. Continental Intermodal Group – Trucking LLC*, IPR2019-01393, Paper No. 24 (PTAB June 16, 2020).

In so stipulating, Apple seeks to avoid multiple proceedings addressing the validity of the challenged claims based on the same grounds. Rather, through this stipulation, Apple expresses its intention to have only the PTAB address the Instituted Grounds of invalidity of these claims. But, for the sake of clarity and to avoid any doubt, if the PTAB declines to institute any of the grounds identified herein, Apple reserves the right to assert the denied grounds in the litigation. Apple also reserves its rights to continue to assert grounds other than the Instituted Grounds.

Sincerely,

*/s/Brian Rosenthal*

Attorney for Apple Inc.

cc: Counsel of record

**Appendix A – Grounds and Prior Art References Used in IPR2023-00343**

Ground	'654 Patent Claims	Basis for Rejection
1A	1-5, 7-8, 10-13, 15-17, 19	Anthony in view of Hanggie
1B	6, 9, 14, 18	Anthony in view of Hanggie and Matthews
2A	1-5, 7-8, 10-13, 15-17, 19	Hanggie in view of Anthony
2B	6, 9, 14, 18	Hanggie in view of Anthony and Matthews

**List of References**

Reference Name	Details
Anthony	US Patent Pub. No. 2005/0091596
Hanggie	US Patent Pub. No. 2005/0088447
Matthews	US Patent Pub. No. 2006/0107229