

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

REALTEK SEMICONDUCTOR CORP.,  
Petitioner,

v.

ATI TECHNOLOGIES ULC  
Patent Owner.

---

Case No. IPR2023-00564  
U.S. Patent No. 7,742,053

---

**PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE  
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.107(A)**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
II. Graphics Processing.....	3
A. Vertex and Pixel Processing.....	3
B. Vertex and Pixel Command Threads .....	4
III. '053 PATENT.....	4
IV. EXEMPLARY CLAIM.....	6
V. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....	7
A. Storage of “command threads” .....	7
B. “at least one memory device . . . operative to store a plurality of pixel command threads and . . . operative to store a plurality of vertex command threads” .....	8
C. “select a command thread from either of the plurality of pixel command threads and the plurality of vertex command threads”.....	10
D. “command processing engine” .....	11
VI. PETITIONER HAS FAILED TO ESTABLISH THE REQUIRED REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF SUCCESS FOR ANY GROUND.....	14
A. Ground 1: Stuttard In View of the Knowledge Of A POSITA.....	14
1. All Claims: Stuttard Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious a Memory Device That Stores a Plurality of Pixel Command Threads and Vertex Command Threads at the Same Time in First and Second Portions.....	20
a. Stuttard Operates in a Phased Manner.....	21
b. Stuttard Executes One Instruction at a Time.....	26
c. Stuttard Does Not Care About Command Thread Type .....	31
d. The Claims Require More Than Mere Possibility, Happenstance, or Capability.....	32
2. All Claims: Stuttard Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious Storing Complete Command Threads.....	33

3.	All Claims: Stuttard Does Not Disclose Or Render Obvious an Arbiter That Selects A Command Thread From The Plurality Of Pixel Command Threads Vertex Command Threads .....	36
4.	Claim 7: Stuttard Does Not Disclose Or Render Obvious a Texture Processing Engine.....	39
B.	Ground 2: Stuttard In View Of Williams and The Knowledge Of A POSITA .....	40
1.	All Claims: Williams Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious Storing Vertex and Pixel Command Threads in First And Second Portions of Memory .....	45
a.	There Is No Motivation to Modify the Memory in Williams.....	45
b.	There Is No Motivation to Include the Modified Version of Williams’s Memory In Stuttard.....	51
2.	All Claims: Williams Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious Storing “Command Threads” .....	52
a.	Williams’ Graphics Commands Are Not Pixel and Vertex Command Threads.....	53
b.	Williams Does Not Store Complete Command Threads .....	55
3.	All Claims: Stuttard Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious the Claimed Arbiter .....	59
4.	Claims 3, 8: Williams Does Not Disclose a “Second Memory Device”.....	59
5.	Claim 7: Stuttard Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious a Texture Processing Engine.....	60
6.	No Motivation to Combine or Reasonable Expectation of Success .....	60
C.	Ground 3: Williams In View Of Whittaker and the Knowledge Of A POSITA .....	62
1.	All Claims: Ground 3 Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious Storing Vertex or Pixel Command Threads .....	65

2.	All Claims: Williams’ Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious the Claimed Arbitrator .....	66
3.	Claims 2, 5-9: Williams Does Not Disclose Or Render Obvious the Claimed Command Processing Engines .....	68
4.	Claims 3, 8: Williams Does Not Disclose A “Second Memory Device” .....	69
5.	Claim 6: Williams Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious Arithmetic Logic Unit.....	69
6.	Claim 7: Williams Does Not Disclose or Render Obvious a Texture Processing Engine.....	70
7.	No Motivation to Combine or Reasonable Expectation of Success .....	70
VII.	CONCLUSION.....	72

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	<b>Page(s)</b>
<b>Federal Cases</b>	
<i>Aspex Eyewear, Inc. v. Marchon Eyewear, Inc.</i> , 672 F.3d 1335 (Fed. Cir. 2012) .....	33
<i>ATI Techs. ULC ATI Techs. ULC v. Iancu</i> , 920 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2019) .....	12
<i>Gemalto S.A. v. HTC Corp.</i> , 754 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2014) .....	13
<i>In re Magnum Oil Tools Int’l, Ltd.</i> , 829 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2016) .....	35, 57
<i>Oren Techs., LLC v. Proppant Express Invs. LLC</i> , No. 2019-1778, 2021 U.S. App. LEXIS 21859 (Fed. Cir. July 23, 2021) .....	57
<i>Persion Pharms. LLC v. Alvogen Malta Operations LTD.</i> , 945 F.3d 1184 (Fed. Cir. 2019) .....	40
<i>Retractable Techs., Inc. v. Becton</i> , 653 F.3d 1296 (Fed. Cir. 2011) .....	13
<i>TQ Delta, LLC v. Commscope Holding Co.</i> , No. 2:21-CV-310-JRG, 2022 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 102577 (E.D. Tex. June 8, 2022).....	32
<i>Wasica Fin. GmbH v. Cont’l Auto. Sys.</i> , 853 F.3d 1272 (Fed. Cir. 2017) .....	70
<b>Regulations</b>	
37 C.F.R. § 42.24(d) .....	73

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.