## UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

AXON ENTERPRISE, INC., Petitioner

v.

DIGITAL ALLY, INC., Patent Owner

Case PGR2018-00052 Patent 9,712,730 B2

## **PETITION FOR POST-GRANT REVIEW**

#### Mail Stop "PATENT BOARD"

Patent Trial and Appeal Board U.S. Patent & Trademark Office P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

DOCKET

A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

## Petition for Post-Grant Review Patent 9,712,730 B2

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

| I.   | Introduction1   |  |  |  |  |  |
|------|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| II.  | Grounds For Standing (37 C.F.R. § 42.204(a))2   |  |  |  |  |  |
| III. | Statement of Relief Requested and Identification of the Challenge (37 C.F.R. § 42.204(b))   |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | A. Citation of prior art7   |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | B. Statutory grounds for the challenge  |  |  |  |  |  |
| IV.  | Background11  |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | A. Overview of the '730 patent  |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | B. Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art   |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | C. Claim Construction   |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | D. Summary of the Asserted Prior Art14  |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | <ol> <li>Smith discloses a wearable video system for law<br/>enforcement officers that records and documents incidents14</li> </ol> |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | 2. Strub discloses a wearable video system that marks video files with location information   |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | 3. O'Donnell discloses a wearable video system with a versatile mount to secure a camera to various surfaces16                      |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | 4. Haler discloses a vehicle-mounted system that triggers a video recording while a police officer is in the vehicle17              |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | 5. Guzik discloses a wearable video system that marks files with metadata about time, location, and the event                       |  |  |  |  |  |
|      | 6. Balardeta discloses that devices with a camera, processor,<br>memory, and GPS components were compact                            |  |  |  |  |  |
| V.   | Ground 1: Claims 1-21 lack written-description support19  |  |  |  |  |  |
| VI.  | Ground 2: Smith renders claims 1, 4, 7, and 9 obvious   |  |  |  |  |  |

## Petition for Post-Grant Review Patent 9,712,730 B2

| A. | Independent claim 1. |  |     |  |  |  |
|----|----------------------|--|-----|--|--|--|
|    | 1.                   | Smith teaches or suggests "[a] portable video and imaging system for law enforcement."   | .23 |  |  |  |
|    | 2.                   | Smith teaches or suggests "a portable housing configured<br>to be mounted on a body of a law enforcement officer, on a<br>device carried by the law enforcement officer, or in a law<br>enforcement vehicle."  | .25 |  |  |  |
|    | 3.                   | Smith teaches or suggests "a camera component housed within the housing and configured to capture video of an event."  | .27 |  |  |  |
|    | 4.                   | Smith teaches or suggests "a memory element housed<br>within the housing and configured to record the captured<br>video of the event, wherein said captured and recorded<br>video comprises a plurality of video frames of a video file."  | .29 |  |  |  |
|    | 5.                   | Smith teaches or suggests "an input mounted on the housing and configured to be actuated by the law enforcement officer in the field and in response to being actuated, generate an activation signal."  |     |  |  |  |
|    | 6.                   | Smith teaches or suggests "a processing element associated with the memory element and the input."   | .33 |  |  |  |
|    | 7.                   | Smith teaches or suggests that the processing element is configured to "receive said activation signal generated in response to the law enforcement officer actuating the input.".   | .34 |  |  |  |
|    | 8.                   | Smith teaches or suggests that the processing element is<br>configured to " <i>in response to the activation signal, store a</i><br><i>mark in the video file for at least one of the plurality of</i><br><i>video frames to thereby identify a point in time or location</i><br><i>in the video file.</i> " | .34 |  |  |  |
|    | 9.                   | Smith teaches or suggests "wherein said mark in the video file of the at least one of the plurality of video frames  |     |  |  |  |

DOCKET

|       |      | enables the processing element to perform the following:<br>upon playback of the video file and in response to receipt<br>from a user request, automatically advance the video file<br>to the marked at least one video frame representing the<br>point in time or location in the video file at which the law<br>enforcement officer actuated the input." | 38 |
|-------|------|--|----|
|       | B.   | Dependent claim 4  | 39 |
|       | C.   | Dependent claim 7  | 40 |
|       | D.   | Dependent claim 9  | 42 |
| VII.  | Grou | nd 3: Smith in view of Strub renders claims 2 and 3 obvious.   | 44 |
|       | A.   | Dependent claim 2  | 44 |
|       | B.   | Dependent claim 3  | 47 |
| VIII. |      | nd 4: Smith in view of O'Donnell renders claims 5, 6, and 8<br>ous   | 49 |
|       | A.   | Dependent claim 5  | 49 |
|       | B.   | Dependent claim 6  | 54 |
|       |      | 1. Smith in view of O'Donnell teaches or suggests " <i>a universal mount coupled to or integral with the portable housing</i> ."   | 54 |
|       |      | 2. Smith in view of O'Donnell teaches or suggests "a first mounting assembly including a first coupler for coupling the first mounting assembly to the universal mount, wherein the first mounting assembly is configured for mounting the portable housing to the law enforcement officer's body.".   | 56 |
|       |      | 3. Smith in view of O'Donnell teaches or suggests "a second mounting assembly including a second coupler for coupling the second mounting assembly to the universal mount, wherein the second mounting assembly is   |    |

|     |   |          | configured for mounting the portable housing in the law enforcement vehicle."   | 58 |  |
|-----|---|----------|---|----|--|
|     |   | 4.       | Smith in view of O'Donnell teaches or suggests that the portable housing "may selectively and interchangeably be mounted on the law enforcement officer's body via the first mounting assembly and the law enforcement vehicle via the second mounting assembly."   | 59 |  |
|     |   | 5.       | Smith in view of O'Donnell teaches or suggests "wherein<br>the first mounting assembly and the second mounting<br>assembly are selectively and interchangeably mounted to<br>the portable housing by coupling the respective first<br>coupler or second coupler to the universal mount."  | 61 |  |
|     | C.  | Depe     | ndent claim 8   | 62 |  |
| IX. | Ground 5: Smith in view of Haler renders claims 10 and 12 obvious64 |          |   |    |  |
|     | A.  | Depe     | ndent claim 10  | 64 |  |
|     | B.  | Depe     | ndent claim 12  | 67 |  |
| X.  | Grou  | ind 6: S | mith in view of Guzik renders claims 11 and 22 obvious  | 70 |  |
|     | A.  | Depe     | ndent claim 11  | 70 |  |
|     |   | 1.       | Smith teaches or suggests "wherein the plurality of video<br>frames is associated with metadata."   | 70 |  |
|     |   | 2.       | Smith in view of Guzik teaches or suggests "wherein the<br>metadata includes a geographical location of at least one<br>component of the system when at least some of the<br>plurality of video frames was captured, a time or date of<br>when at least some of the plurality of video frames was<br>captured, and any triggering event that initiated capturing<br>of at least some of the plurality of video frames." | 71 |  |
|     | B.  | Indep    | endent claim 22.  | 75 |  |

## DOCKET A L A R M



# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

### E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.