

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
HONORABLE DAVID O. CARTER, JUDGE PRESIDING

- - - - -

PINN, INC.,)
) **CERTIFIED**
Plaintiff/Counter defendant,)
)
vs.) No. 8:19-CV-01805-DOC
) Volume I
APPLE, INC.,)
)
Defendant/Counter Claimant.)
_____)

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
COUNSEL APPEARING VIA ZOOM VIDEOCONFERENCE
Hearing on Motions/Claim Construction
Santa Ana, California
Tuesday, November 17, 2020

Debbie Gale, CSR 9472, RPR, CCRR
Federal Official Court Reporter
United States District Court
411 West 4th Street, Room 1-053
Santa Ana, California 92701
(714) 558-8141

Certified for Fish & Richardson PC

1 **APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL:**

2 FOR PLAINTIFF/COUNTER DEFENDANT PINN, INC.:

3 Ryan E. Hatch (via Zoom videoconference)
4 LAW OFFICE OF RYAN E. HATCH PC
5 13323 Washington Boulevard
6 Suite 100
7 Los Angeles, California 90066
8 310-279-5076
9 ryan@ryanehatch.com

10 Cabrach J. Connor (via Zoom videoconference)
11 (pro hac vice)
12 CONNOR KUDLAC LEE PLLC
13 609 Castle Ridge Road
14 Suite 450
15 Austin, Texas 78746
16 512-777-1254
17 cab@connorkudlaclee.com

18 David A. Skeels (via Zoom videoconference)
19 (pro hac vice)
20 WHITAKER CHALK SWINDLE & SCHWARTZ PLLC
21 301 Commerce Street,
22 Suite 3500
23 Fort Worth, Texas 76102
24 817-878-0500
25 dskeels@whitakerchalk.com

Jennifer A. Tatum Lee (via Zoom videoconference)
(pro hac vice)
CONNOR KUDLAC LEE PLLC
609 Castle Ridge Road
Suite 450
Austin, Texas 78746
512-777-1254
jennifer@connorkudlaclee.com

Kevin S. Kudlac (via Zoom videoconference)
(pro hac vice)
CONNOR KUDLAC LEE PLLC
609 Castle Ridge Road
Suite 450
Austin, Texas 78746
512-777-1254
kevin@connorkudlaclee.com

Certified for Fish & Richardson PC

1 **APPEARANCES (continued):**

2 FOR DEFENDANT/COUNTER COMPLAINANT APPLE, INC.:

3 Christopher S. Marchese (via Zoom videoconference)
4 FISH & RICHARDSON PC
5 633 West 5th Street
6 26th Floor
7 Los Angeles, California 90071
8 213-533-4240
9 marchese@fr.com

10 John W. Thornburgh (via Zoom videoconference)
11 FISH & RICHARDSON PC
12 12860 El Camino Real
13 Suite 400
14 San Diego, California 92130
15 858-678-5070
16 thornburgh@fr.com

17 Joy B. Kete (via Zoom videoconference)
18 (pro hac vice)
19 FISH & RICHARDSON PC
20 One Marina Park Drive
21 Boston, Massachusetts 02210
22 617-542-5070
23 kete@fr.com

24 Seth M. Sproul (via Zoom videoconference)
25 FISH & RICHARDSON PC
12860 El Camino Real
Suite 400
San Diego, California 92130
858-678-5070
sproul@fr.com

Tucker Nephi Terhufen (via Zoom videoconference)
FISH & RICHARDSON PC
12860 El Camino Real,
Suite 400
San Diego, California 92130
858-678-5070
terhufen@fr.com

23 ALSO PRESENT:

24 David Keyzer, Technical Special Master

25

Certified for Fish & Richardson PC

	<u>I N D E X</u>	
	PROCEEDINGS	PAGE
1		
2		
3	<u>HEARING ON MOTIONS/CLAIM CONSTRUCTION</u>	
4	Initial remarks by the Court	5
5	Disputed Terms "Wireless Pairing," etc. (Terms 1, 5, 12)	6
6	Argument by Mr. Connor (Pinn)	8
7	Argument by Mr. Sproul (Apple)	12
8	Rebuttal by Mr. Connor (Pinn)	18
9	Rebuttal by Mr. Sproul (Apple)	20
10	Further rebuttal by Mr. Connor (Pinn)	21
11	Further rebuttal by Mr. Sproul (Apple)	23
12	Ruling by the Court	25
13	"Smartphone" (Terms 2, 7 13)	26
14	Argument by Mr. Hatch (Pinn)	28
15	Argument by Mr. Marchese (Apple)	31
16	Rebuttal by Mr. Hatch (Pinn)	35
17	Rebuttal by Mr. Marchese (Apple)	41
18	Court's Construction of "smartphone" (Terms 2, 7, 13)	43
19	"Mobile Application" (Terms 3, 9, 14)	44
20	Argument by Mr. Hatch (Pinn)	45
21	Argument by Mr. Marchese (Apple)	46
22	Court's Construction re "Mobile Application" (Terms 3, 9, 14)	46
23	"Response to pressing user button" (Term 6)	47
24		
25		

Certified for Fish & Richardson PC

1 **SANTA ANA, CALIFORNIA, TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 17, 2020**

2 **Volume I**

3 **HEARING ON MOTIONS/CLAIM CONSTRUCTION**

4 (10:59 a.m.)

10:59 5 THE COURT: Okay. Well, thank you.

10:59 6 Then we'll call the case to order, Pinn v. Apple.
7 It's Case Number 19-0105. And first, I hope all of you are
8 well and I hope your families are well, and we'll try this
9 with multiple parties; and if it doesn't work, then we'll
10 all get together. But we're trying to proceed in these
11 difficult times.

11:00 12 I've asked David Keyzer to join me. Hopefully,
13 he's viewable to you. He's right behind me. A multitude of
14 law clerks are also listening and in the Court, but you
15 can't see them at the present time.

11:00 16 **INITIAL REMARKS BY THE COURT**

11:00 17 THE COURT: By way of background, the
18 patents-in-suit involved the '491 patent, titled "Electronic
19 Device With Wireless Earbud" issued on October 31st of 2017.

11:00 20 (To court reporter:) And Deb, let me know if I go
21 too fast. Some of these will be technical terms.

11:00 22 The '066 patent titled "Mobile System With
23 Wireless Earbud" issued on October 22nd, 2019. The
24 '198 patent titled "Personal Media System Including Base
25 Station and Wireless Earbud" issued on March 31st, 2020.

Certified for Fish & Richardson PC

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.