

**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

---

**BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

---

COMMONWEALTH SCIENTIFIC AND INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH  
ORGANISATION,  
Petitioner,

v.

BASF PLANT SCIENCE GMBH,  
Patent Owner.

---

U.S. Patent No. 10,533,183

Issued: January 14, 2020

---

**DECLARATION OF NARENDRA YADAV, Ph.D.,  
IN SUPPORT OF PETITION FOR POST-GRANT REVIEW  
OF U.S. PATENT NO. 10,533,183**

Mail Stop: Patent Board  
Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Qualifications.....	1
III.	Materials Considered.....	3
IV.	Legal Standards.....	4
	A. Written description.....	4
	B. Enablement.....	4
	C. Entitlement of priority.....	5
	D. Anticipation.....	5
	E. Claim Construction.....	5
	F. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	6
V.	Summary of my opinions.....	6
VI.	Technology Background.....	10
	A. Fatty acid nomenclature.....	10
	B. Fatty acid biosynthesis.....	13
	1. The aerobic biosynthetic pathway.....	14
	2. Transformation of plants with binary vectors.....	16
	C. Triacylglycerides and the fatty acid composition of plants.....	16
	1. Positional distribution of fatty acids in different lipid species.....	19
VII.	Summary of the ‘183 Patent.....	21
	A. The description of the ‘183 Patent and its priority applications.....	21
	1. The description of the ‘183 Patent.....	21
	2. The description of the parent and priority applications.....	26
	B. The description of the ‘183 Patent compared to the description of Cirpus et al., PCT International Application Publication No. WO 2005/083093 A2, published September 9, 2005.....	28
	1. Binary vectors used for transformation of plant cells.....	31

Declaration of Narendra Yadav, Ph.D.,  
in Support of Petition for Post-Grant Review  
of U.S. Patent No. 10,533,183

2.	The ‘093 publication discloses the sequence of the codon-optimized $\Delta 5$ elongase used in examples 4-13 of the ‘183 Patent.....	33
3.	Lipids produced by transformed plants.....	35
VIII.	Detailed opinions .....	36
A.	Claim Construction.....	36
B.	Lack of entitlement to priority and unpatentability of the claims.....	39
1.	Lack of entitlement to priority .....	39
2.	Unpatentability of the claims .....	39
C.	Lack of written description of the claims.....	40
1.	Lack of Written Description for oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 25% to 40% by weight of eicosapentaenoic (EPA) based on the total EPA” recited in claim 1 .....	40
2.	Lack of Written Description for oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 40% to 60% by weight of docosapentaenoic acid (DPA) based on the total DPA” recited in claim 2 .....	42
3.	Lack of Written Description for oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 15% to 35% by weight of docosahexanoic acid (DHA) based on the total DHA” recited in claim 3 .....	44
4.	Lack of Written Description for “at least 20% by weight of EPA, at least 2% by weight of docosapentaenoic acid (DPA), and at least 4% by weight of docosahexanoic acid (DHA) based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant in the form of triacylglycerides,” recited in 1-8, and 17-23.....	46
5.	Lack of Written Description for “at least 20% long chain polyunsaturated fatty acids (LCPUFAs) based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant” recited in claim 5 .....	52

Declaration of Narendra Yadav, Ph.D.,  
in Support of Petition for Post-Grant Review  
of U.S. Patent No. 10,533,183

6. Lack of Written Description for “at least about 25% by weight of EPA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [*Brassica*] plant” recited in claim 6.....54
7. Lack of Written Description for “about 30% by weight of EPA and DHA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [*Brassica*] plant” recited in claim 7.....55
8. Lack of Written Description for oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic *Brassica* plant comprising “at least 54% by weight of polyunsaturated  $\omega$ 3-fatty acids” recited in claim 8 ...56
- D. Lack of Enablement of the Claims .....61
  1. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic *Brassica* plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 25% to 40% by weight of eicosapentaenoic (EPA) based on the total EPA” recited in claim 1 .....61
  2. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic *Brassica* plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 25% to 40% by weight of eicosapentaenoic (EPA) based on the total EPA” recited in claim 1 .....62
  3. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic *Brassica* plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 25% to 40% by weight of eicosapentaenoic (EPA) based on the total EPA” recited in claim 1 .....63
  4. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic *Brassica* plant comprising “at least 20% by weight of EPA”, “at least 2% by weight of DPA”, or “at least 4% by weight of DHA”, “based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [*Brassica*] plant in the form of triacylglycerides” recited in claim 4 .....64
  5. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic *Brassica* plant comprising “at least 20% long chain

Declaration of Narendra Yadav, Ph.D.,  
in Support of Petition for Post-Grant Review  
of U.S. Patent No. 10,533,183

polyunsaturated fatty acids (LCPUFAs) based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant”, recited in claim 5 .....	67
6. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least about 25% by weight of EPA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant”, recited in claim 6 .....	70
7. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at about 30% by weight of EPA and DHA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant”, recited in claim 7 ..	71
8. Lack of Enablement of oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least 54% by weight of polyunsaturated $\omega$ 3-fatty acids”, recited in claim 8.....	72
E. Anticipation of the claims .....	74
1. Claims 1-3 and 5-9 are Anticipated by Wu et al. (2005) Nat. Biotech. 1013-1017 .....	74
2. Claims 1-9 are Anticipated by, or obvious over, WO 2005/083093 (BASF Plant Science GmbH).....	81
3. Claims 1-9 are obvious over Wu et al. in view of the ‘093 publication.....	82
IX. Supplementation .....	83
X. Conclusion .....	84

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.