

Filed on behalf of Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation  
by:

Gary J. Gershik  
Cooper & Dunham LLP  
845 Third Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
(212)278-0400  
ggershik@cooperdunham.com

**UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

---

**BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD**

---

COMMONWEALTH SCIENTIFIC AND INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH  
ORGANISATION,  
Petitioner,

v.

BASF PLANT SCIENCE GMBH,  
Patent Owner.

---

U.S. Patent No. 10,533,183

Issued: January 14, 2020

---

**PETITION FOR POST-GRANT REVIEW**

**PURSUANT TO 35 U.S.C. §§ 321-328 AND C.F.R. § 42.200 *et seq.***

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Mandatory Notices Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(A)(1).....	4
	A. Real Party-In-Interest Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(1).....	4
	1. Related parties .....	5
	B. Related Matters Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(2).....	6
	1. Continuation applications.....	6
	2. Post-grant review trials .....	6
	3. Disputes between the parties .....	6
	C. Lead and Back Up Counsel Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(3).....	7
	D. Service Information Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.8(b)(4).....	7
III.	Additional Requirements .....	8
	A. Payment of fees under 37 C.F.R. § 42.15 .....	8
	B. Timing under 37 C.F.R. § 42.202.....	8
	C. Grounds for standing under 37 C.F.R. § 42.204(a).....	8
IV.	Technology Background.....	9
	A. Fatty acid nomenclature .....	9
	B. Fatty acid biosynthesis .....	10
	C. Triacylglycerides and the fatty acid composition of plants .....	10
	1. Positional distribution of fatty acids in different lipid species .....	11
V.	Summary of the ‘183 Patent .....	13
	A. The disclosure of the ‘183 Patent and its priority applications.....	13
	1. The disclosure of the ‘183 Patent.....	13
	2. The disclosure of the priority applications.....	17
	B. The disclosure of the ‘183 Patent compared to the disclosure of WO 2005/083093 A2 .....	17
	1. Binary vectors used for transformation of plant cells.....	20
	2. The codon-optimized $\Delta 5$ elongase used in examples 4-13 of the ‘183 Patent was disclosed in the earlier ‘093 publication.....	22

3.	Lipids produced by transformed plants.....	22
C.	Examination of the ‘837 application .....	23
1.	PO did not provide a specific statement of support for the claims at any point during prosecution.....	23
2.	There is no record of the Examiner analyzing the Written Description or Enablement of the claims during prosecution.....	24
3.	The Examiner’s statement of reasons for allowance reflect the Examiner’s confusion regarding the scope of the claims .....	25
VI.	Statement of the Precise Relief Requested and the Reasons Therefor Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.22(A) and 37 C.F.R. § 42.204(b).....	26
A.	Claim construction (37 C.F.R. § 42.204(b)(3)).....	29
B.	Person of ordinary skill in the art .....	32
VII.	The ‘183 Patent is PGR Eligible.....	33
A.	The ‘638 Patent contains claims that are not entitled to a pre-AIA filing date.....	35
B.	The claims lack written description support .....	36
1.	Legal standard for written description .....	36
2.	Ground 1: No written description for “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 25% to 40% by weight of eicosapentaenoic (EPA) based on the total EPA” recited in claim 1 .....	38
3.	Ground 2: No written description for “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 40% to 60% by weight of docosapentaenoic acid (DPA) based on the total DPA” recited in claim 2 .....	40
4.	Ground 3: No written description for “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 15% to 35% by weight of docosahexanoic acid (DHA) based on the total DHA” recited in claim 3 .....	42
5.	Ground 4: No written description for “at least 20% by weight of EPA”, “at least 2% by weight of DPA”, or “at least 4% by weight of DHA”, “based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic	

[ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant in the form of triacylglycerides” alone or in combination, recited in claim 4.....	43
6. Ground 5: No written description for “at least 20% long chain polyunsaturated fatty acids (LCPUFAs) based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant” recited in claim 5 .....	48
7. Ground 6: No written description for “at least about 25% by weight of EPA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant” recited in claim 6 ...	51
8. Ground 7: No written description for “at least about 30% by weight of EPA and DHA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant” recited in claim 7 .....	51
9. Ground 8: No written description for oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least 54% by weight of polyunsaturated $\omega$ 3-fatty acids” recited in claim 8.....	52
C. The claims are not enabled.....	57
1. Legal standard for enablement.....	57
2. Ground 9: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 25% to 40% by weight of eicosapentaenoic (EPA) based on the total EPA” recited in claim 1 are not enabled .....	59
3. Ground 10: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 40% to 60% by weight of docosapentaenoic acid (DPA) based on the total DPA” recited in claim 2 are not enabled .....	60
4. Ground 11: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant “wherein said oils, lipids and/or fatty acids comprise in the sn-2 position 15% to 35% by weight of docosahexanoic acid (DHA) based on the total DHA” recited in claim 3 are not enabled .....	61

5.	Ground 12: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least 20% by weight of EPA”, “at least 2% by weight of DPA”, or “at least 4% by weight of DHA”, “based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant in the form of triacylglycerides” recited in claim 4 are not enabled .....	62
6.	Ground 13: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least 20% long chain polyunsaturated fatty acids (LCPUFAs) based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant,” recited in claim 5 are not enabled .....	67
7.	Ground 14: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least about 25% by weight of EPA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant,” recited in claim 6, are not enabled .....	68
8.	Ground 15: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least about 30% by weight of EPA and DHA in the form of triacylglycerides based on the total fatty acids in the transgenic [ <i>Brassica</i> ] plant,” recited in claim 7 are not enabled .....	69
9.	Ground 16: Oils, lipids and/or fatty acids produced by a transgenic <i>Brassica</i> plant comprising “at least 54% by weight of polyunsaturated $\omega$ 3-fatty acids,” recited in claim 8, are not enabled .....	70
VIII.	Claims 1-9 of the ‘183 Patent are unpatentable.....	73
A.	Grounds 1-8: Claims 1-9 lack written description in the ‘183 Patent for the same reasons that the claims lack entitlement to the priority applications.....	73
B.	Grounds 9-16: Claims 1-9 lack enablement in the ‘183 Patent for the same reasons that the claims lack entitlement to the priority applications.....	74
C.	Ground 17: Claims 1-3 and 5-9 are anticipated by Wu et al. (2005) Nat. Biotech. 1013-1017 .....	76

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.