UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF PUERTO RICO

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,)
Plaintiff,)
v.) Civil Action No. 3:21-cv-01087
MUNICIPALITY OF TOA ALTA,)
PUERTO RICO,) COMPLAINT
Defendant.)))

The United States of America, by the authority of the Attorney General of the United States acting at the request of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), for its complaint against the Municipality of Toa Alta, Puerto Rico ("Toa Alta") alleges as follows:

NATURE OF THE ACTION

- 1. Toa Alta's Municipal Solid Waste Landfill ("Landfill") is in violation of the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act ("RCRA") and a 2017 administrative order issued by EPA under RCRA. The Landfill's continued operation and manner of operation endanger public health and the environment. Among other things, Toa Alta has and continues to: (a) create steep and unstable side slopes at the Landfill, which present an increased risk of collapse; (b) enable large quantities of leachate to be released from the Landfill threatening contamination of soils, surface waters, and groundwater and harm to nearby residents; and (c) contribute to a risk of spread of disease by not covering the solid waste it deposited at the Landfill.
- 2. The United States seeks civil penalties and an injunction requiring Toa Alta to address the hazardous conditions at the Landfill.



JURISDICTION, VENUE, AND NOTICE

- 3. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action under Sections 7003(a) and (b) of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973 (a) and (b), and 28 U.S.C. § 1331, 1345 and 1355.
- 4. Venue is proper in this District because the violations occurred and are continuing to occur in this District and Toa Alta is located in this District. 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b) and 1395(a).
- 5. The United States has given notice of this action to Puerto Rico as required by Section 7003(a) of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973(a).

THE DEFENDANT

- 6. Toa Alta owns the Landfill and has been the owner of the Landfill since approximately 1966.
- 7. Toa Alta operated the Landfill from 1966 to 1998 and from approximately

 April 2014 to November 2019. Since November 2019, a third-party contractor has operated the

 Landfill at the direction of and for the benefit of Toa Alta.

STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BACKGROUND

- 8. RCRA includes a comprehensive federal program that provides for the regulation of solid waste and hazardous waste. 42 U.S.C. § 6901, et seq.
- 9. "Solid waste" is defined to include garbage, refuse, and other discarded material including solid, liquid, semisolid, or contained gaseous material resulting from, aside from certain exclusions, industrial, commercial, mining, and agricultural operations, and community activities. 42 U.S.C. § 6093(27).
 - 10. Section 7003(a) of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973(a), provides, in pertinent part:



[U]pon receipt of evidence that the past or present handling, storage, treatment, transportation or disposal of any solid waste or hazardous waste may present an imminent and substantial endangerment to human health or the environment, the Administrator may bring a suit on behalf of the United States in the appropriate district court against any person (including ... past or present owner or operator of a treatment, storage or disposal facility) who has contributed or is contributing to such handling, storage, treatment, transportation or disposal to restrain such person from such handling, storage, treatment, transportation or disposal, to order such person to take such other action as may be necessary, or both. The Administrator may also ... take other action under this section including, but not limited to, issuing such orders as may be necessary to protect public health and the environment.

- 11. Section 7003(b) of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973(b), provides that any person who fails to comply with any EPA order issued under Section 7003(a) of RCRA may, in a civil action brought by the United States to enforce such order, be fined up to \$5,000 for each day of each violation.
- 12. The maximum daily civil penalty amount under Section 7003(b) of RCRA has been increased to \$15,352 for violations occurring after November 2, 2015. 40 C.F.R. § 19.4.

GENERAL ALLEGATIONS

THE LANDFILL AND ITS PRESENT CONDITION

- 13. The Landfill is located off the PR-165 thoroughfare, at Km 8.2, Barrio Contorno, Municipality of Toa Alta, Puerto Rico. The Landfill comprises approximately 32 acres.
- 14. More than 100 homes and businesses are located within 1,300 feet of the Landfill perimeter, including one home that is approximately 55 feet from the southwest side of the Landfill.
- 15. Toa Alta has not installed fencing or other controls limiting access to the Landfill by scavengers and others.
- 16. Toa Alta has disposed of its municipal solid waste at the Landfill since 1966. Toa Alta also accepts municipal solid waste from other municipalities for disposal at the Landfill.



- 17. Toa Alta constructed and filled the Landfill in four main stages: (a) the initial waste deposit into an approximately 11-acre sinkhole and in an area in the northeast section of the Landfill; (b) an expansion to the northwest of the initial waste deposit; (c) the newer, Southeast Cell; and (d) a combined waste deposit area overlaying the preexisting waste deposit areas.
- 18. The 11-acre sinkhole area, the northeast section, and the expansion in the northwest portion of the Landfill are not lined at the bottom with an impermeable membrane.

Leachate

- 19. Approximately 72 inches of rain fall per year in the region in which the Landfill is located.
 - 20. The surface of the Landfill is not capped with a low permeability cover.
- 21. Like all landfills without low permeability covers, rain that falls on the Landfill surface passes into and through the solid waste mass within the Landfill.
- 22. Like all landfills without low permeability covers, water passing through the Landfill's waste mass becomes contaminated with harmful constituents that are in the waste, including heavy metals and organic compounds, as well as pathogens, including viruses and microorganisms such as bacteria and protozoan parasites.
- 23. This contaminated water, or "leachate," is released from the bottom, sides, and "toe" of the Landfill.
 - 24. The Landfill releases an estimated 12 to 20 million gallons of leachate per year.
- 25. The Southeast Cell was constructed with a membrane liner at the bottom and a leachate collection system that was intended to remove the leachate that is captured by the liner.
 - 26. Waste was first deposited in the Southeast Cell in 2007.



- 27. Toa Alta ceased operating and maintaining the leachate collection system in approximately 2014.
 - 28. Toa Alta does not remove the leachate captured by the Southeast Cell's liner.
- 29. Leachate captured by the liner pools on top of the liner, overflows from the edges of the liner, and leaks through the liner.
- 30. The liner below the Southeast Cell accounts for approximately 15% of the waste disposal area of the Landfill. Leachate generated in the other 85% of the waste disposal area of the Landfill is not captured by any liner.
- 31. The Landfill is located above a highly permeable member of the Cibao Formation, which is a recharge area for the North Coast Limestone lower aquifer.
- 32. The North Coast Limestone lower aquifer is part of the North Coast Limestone aquifer system, which also includes an upper aquifer.
- 33. The North Coast Limestone aquifer system is a large and productive source of groundwater in Puerto Rico.
- 34. The U.S. Geological Service ("U.S.G.S") has designated the North Coast Limestone aquifer system as a "Principal Aquifer of the United States," i.e., an aquifer that the U.S.G.S. has determined is a regionally extensive aquifer or aquifer system that has the potential to be used as a source of potable water.
- 35. Groundwater is mostly extracted from the upper aquifer because it is more accessible for drilling and pumping. The groundwater in the upper aquifer has already been extensively contaminated, resulting in numerous well closures since 1987.



DOCKET

Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

