

No. 15-537

IN THE
Supreme Court of the United States

JUAN BRAVO-FERNANDEZ AND
HECTOR MARTÍNEZ-MALDONADO,
Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
Respondent.

**On Writ of Certiorari to the
United States Court of Appeals
for the First Circuit**

BRIEF FOR PETITIONERS

ABBE DAVID LOWELL
CHRISTOPHER D. MAN
CHADBOURNE & PARKE LLP
1200 New Hampshire Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 974-5600

*Counsel for Hector
Martínez-Maldonado*

LISA S. BLATT
Counsel of Record
ANTHONY J. FRANZE
R. STANTON JONES
ELISABETH S. THEODORE
ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
601 Massachusetts Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20001
(202) 942-5000
lisa.blatt@aporter.com

*Counsel for Juan
Bravo-Fernandez*

June 10, 2016

WILSON-EPES PRINTING CO., INC. – (202) 789-0096 – WASHINGTON, D. C. 20002

QUESTION PRESENTED

Whether, under *Ashe v. Swenson*, 397 U.S. 436 (1970), and *Yeager v. United States*, 557 U.S. 110 (2009), a vacated, unconstitutional conviction can strip an acquittal of its preclusive effect under the collateral estoppel prong of the Double Jeopardy Clause.

(i)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
QUESTION PRESENTED.....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	v
INTRODUCTION.....	1
OPINIONS BELOW.....	4
JURISDICTION.....	4
CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISION INVOLVED....	4
STATEMENT.....	5
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT.....	11
ARGUMENT.....	15
I. A Jury's Acquittal Retains Preclusive Effect Under the Double Jeopardy Clause Regardless of an Inconsistent Vacated Conviction.....	15
A. <i>Ashe</i> Bars Re-Litigation of an Issue That an Acquittal Already Decided in the Defendant's Favor.....	15
B. Under <i>Yeager</i> , a Vacated Conviction Does Not Strip an Acquittal of Preclusive Effect.....	18
1. <i>Yeager</i> Holds That Hung Counts Are Irrelevant in the <i>Ashe</i> Analysis.....	19
2. Vacated Convictions Are Equally Irrelevant in the <i>Ashe</i> Analysis.....	20

TABLE OF CONTENTS—Continued

	Page
C. <i>Powell</i> Confirms That a Vacated Conviction Cannot Strip an Acquittal of Preclusive Effect	30
1. <i>Powell</i> Holds That One Valid Verdict Cannot Impugn Another Valid Verdict	31
2. <i>A Fortiori</i> , an Invalid Conviction Cannot Impugn a Valid Acquittal .	32
3. The Government Cannot Attribute Irrationality to Jury Acquittals	35
II. A Vacated, Unconstitutional Conviction Cannot Deprive a Defendant of an Otherwise Applicable Constitutional Right	38
III. The Decision Below Invites Prosecutorial Abuse	43
A. Overcharging and Overbroad Interpretations of Criminal Statutes Are Rampant	44
B. The Decision Below Exacerbates Government Overreaching	50
CONCLUSION	52

v
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES	Page(s)
<i>Alabama v. Smith</i> , 490 U.S. 794 (1989).....	27
<i>Arizona v. Fulminante</i> , 499 U.S. 279 (1991).....	23
<i>Ashe v. Swenson</i> , 397 U.S. 436 (1970).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Blockburger v. United States</i> , 284 U.S. 299 (1932).....	45
<i>Bond v. United States</i> , 134 S. Ct. 2077 (2014).....	48
<i>Boston Mun. Court v. Lydon</i> , 466 U.S. 294 (1984).....	26
<i>Brady v. Maryland</i> , 373 U.S. 83 (1963).....	23
<i>Bullington v. Missouri</i> , 451 U.S. 430 (1981).....	22, 26, 39, 41
<i>Burks v. United States</i> , 437 U.S. 1 (1978).....	43
<i>Butler v. Eaton</i> , 141 U.S. 240 (1891).....	39
<i>Chambers v. United States</i> , 555 U.S. 122 (2009).....	48
<i>Cleveland v. United States</i> , 531 U.S. 12 (2000).....	49
<i>Dodrill v. Ludt</i> , 764 F.2d 442 (6th Cir. 1985).....	39

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.