

In The
Supreme Court of the United States

ELSA HALL, As personal representative of the
Estate of Ethlyn Louise Hall and as Successor
Trustee of the Ethlyn Louise Hall Family Trust,

Petitioner,

v.

SAMUEL H. HALL, JR. and HALL & GRIFFITH, P.C.,

Respondents.

**On Petition For Writ Of Certiorari
To The United States Court Of Appeals
For The Third Circuit**

**OPPOSITION TO
PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI**

MARIE E. THOMAS GRIFFITH
HALL & GRIFFITH, P.C.
No. 91B Estate Solberg
Post Office Box 305587
St. Thomas, U.S. Virgin Islands
00803
Telephone: (340) 715-2945
Email: marie@hallgriffith.com

*Counsel of Record
for Respondents*

QUESTION PRESENTED

The Third Circuit Court of Appeals determined that the case before it is not separately appealable absent certification under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 54(b) because it had been consolidated for trial and pre-trial administration with a related case. The question presented by the petition is:

Should the Court grant certiorari to consider, absent certification pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 54(b), whether cases scheduled and tried together should be appealable separately?

CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

There is no parent or publicly held corporation owning 10% or more of the stock of Respondent, Hall & Griffith, P.C. which is a professional corporation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | Page |
|--|------|
| QUESTION PRESENTED | i |
| CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT | ii |
| TABLE OF CONTENTS | iii |
| TABLE OF AUTHORITIES | iv |
| RESPONDENTS' OPPOSITION TO PETITION FOR CERTIORARI | 1 |
| INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| STATEMENT OF THE CASE | 1 |
| REASONS FOR DENYING THE WRIT | 4 |
| I. There Is Unanimity Among The Circuits Regarding The Lack Of Jurisdiction Over A Separate Appeal Of A Case Consolidated, Scheduled And Tried Together With An- other | 5 |
| First and Sixth Circuits | 5 |
| Federal, Ninth, and Tenth Circuits | 6 |
| Second Circuit | 7 |
| Third, Fourth, Fifth, Seventh, Eighth and Eleventh Circuits | 7 |
| II. There Is Unanimity Among All Circuit Courts That Rule 54(b) Certification Satis- fies The Jurisdictional Prerequisite For Ap- peal | 8 |
| CONCLUSION | 10 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

CASES

| | |
|--|-------|
| <i>Beil v. Lakewood Eng'g & Mfg. Co.</i> , 15 F.3d 546 (6th Cir. 1994)..... | 5 |
| <i>Elliott v. Archdiocese of N.Y.</i> , 682 F.3d 213 (3d Cir. 2012) | 8, 10 |
| <i>FDIC v. Caledonia Inv. Corp.</i> , 862 F.2d 378 (1st Cir. 1988) | 5 |
| <i>Hall v. Wilkerson</i> , 926 F.2d 311 (3d Cir. 1991)..... | 7, 9 |

RULE

| | |
|-----------------------------|---------------|
| Fed. R. Civ. P. 54(b) | <i>passim</i> |
| S. Ct. Rule 10 | 4 |

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.