No. 17-\_

## IN THE Supreme Court of the United States

R. J. REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY,

Petitioner,

v.

SHARON BLOCK, as personal representative of Lillian Kaplan, deceased,

Respondent.

### On Petition For A Writ Of Certiorari To The Florida District Court of Appeal for the Fourth District

### PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI

BENJAMIN M. FLOWERS JONES DAY 325 John H. McConnell Blvd., Suite 600 Columbus, OH 43215 (614) 469-3939

DOCKE

RM

MICHAEL A. CARVIN Counsel of Record YAAKOV ROTH JONES DAY 51 Louisiana Ave., N.W. Washington, D.C. 20001 (202) 879-3939 mcarvin@jonesday.com

Counsel for Petitioner R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Co.

#### **QUESTIONS PRESENTED**

This case presents questions also raised in the petition for a writ of certiorari filed September 15, 2017, in *R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co. v. Graham*, No. 17-415.

1. When there is no way to tell whether a prior jury found particular facts against a party, does due process permit those facts to be conclusively presumed against that party in subsequent litigation?

2. Are strict-liability and negligence claims based on the findings by the class-action jury in *Engle v. Liggett Group, Inc.* preempted by the many federal statutes that manifested Congress's intent that cigarettes continue to be lawfully sold in the United States?

### PARTIES TO THE PROCEEDING AND RULE 29.6 STATEMENT

The plaintiff below was Lillian Kaplan. After Ms. Kaplan passed away, respondent Sharon Block was substituted as personal representative of her estate.

The defendant below was petitioner R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company. The complaint also named as defendants Philip Morris USA Inc., Lorillard, Inc., Lorillard Tobacco Company, Liggett Group LLC, and Vector Group, Ltd., but those entities were dismissed before trial and were not parties to the appeal.

Petitioner R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company is a wholly owned subsidiary of R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Holdings, Inc., which is a wholly owned subsidiary of Reynolds American Inc. ("RAI"), which in turn is an indirect, wholly owned subsidiary of British American Tobacco p.l.c., a publicly held corporation.

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

	I	<b>Page</b>	
QUESTIONS PRESENTEDi			
	TO THE PROCEEDING AND LE 29.6 STATEMENT	ii	
PETITIO	N FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI	1	
OPINIO	IS BELOW	1	
JURISDICTION1			
	CUTIONAL PROVISIONS IN- LVED	1	
STATEMENT OF THE CASE2			
A.	The History Of The <i>Engle</i> Litiga- tion	4	
	1. The failed class action in <i>Engle</i>	4	
	2. The <i>Engle</i> -progeny litiga- tion	7	
B.	The Proceedings In This Case	9	
C.	The Eleventh Circuit's En Banc Decision In <i>Graham</i>	10	
REASO	S FOR GRANTING THE PETITION	13	
Pl in	e Florida Courts' Decision To Relieve intiffs Of The Burden Of Establish- Essential Elements Of Their Tort ims Violates Due Process	13	

**DOCKET A L A R M** Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

iii

### TABLE OF CONTENTS (continued)

### Page

II.	Federal Law Preempts The Engle	
	Strict-Liability And Negligence Find-	
	ings To The Extent They Indict All Cig-	
	arettes16	
III.	The Court Should Hold This Petition	
	Pending Resolution Of Graham19	
CONCLUSION		
APPE	NDIX A: Order of the Florida Fourth	
	District Court of Appeal (Apr. 27, 2017)1a	
APPE	NDIX B: Amended Final Judgment of	
	the 17th Circuit Court (Dec. 9, 2015)3a	

### iv

# DOCKET A L A R M



# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

# **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

# **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

### LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

### FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

### E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.