

SORAZAM BETHUNE,

*Petitioner,*

v.

MTA LONG ISLAND BUS,

*Respondent.*

---

On Petition for Writ of Certiorari to the  
New York State Court of Appeals

---

**BRIEF IN OPPOSITION**

---

MICHAEL J. PAGLINO, ESQ.

*COUNSEL OF RECORD*

ARMIENTI, DEBELLIS,

GUGLIELMO & RHODEN,

LLP

39 Broadway, Suite 520

New York, New York

10006

(212) 809-7074

mpaglino@adgrlaw.com

Counsel for Respondent

---

resort in the forum state – that is, the New York State Court of Appeals – and any court of last resort of any other state or the United States Court of Appeals.

Indeed petitioner makes no such claim.

Rather, in the state court proceedings petitioner sought to recover for personal injuries she claimed to have sustained by reason that the local commuter bus on which she was a passenger allegedly drove in an unsafe manner. An action was brought against the public authority bus company on a theory that its bus operator was negligent in the manner in which he drove the bus, *but the jury found otherwise*. A judgment was entered after a jury verdict in respondent's favor and plaintiff's (petitioner's) complaint thereby dismissed. Petitioner failed to timely appeal the judgment, a circumstance she attributes to the fault of her then trial counsel. But such is collateral to the subject matter of the personal injury action she brought, and this is *not* the forum to seek redress from, or as a result of, any action or inaction of her former counsel.

formerly a wholly owned subsidiary of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority, a public benefit corporation created by New York State Public Authorities Law §1263. MTA Long Island Bus ceased operations as of December 31, 2011.

QUESTIONS PRESENTED .....	i
CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT.....	ii
SUMMARY OF BASES FOR DENIAL OF A <i>WRIT OF CERTIORARI</i> .....	1
OBJECTION TO JURISDICTION OF THIS COURT.....	3
STATEMENT OF THE CASE .....	4
ARGUMENT.....	11
PETITIONER'S STATED REASONS FOR SEEKING REVIEW BY THIS COURT ARE OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF RULE 10 OF THE RULES OF THIS COURT .....	15
THIS COURT SHOULD DENY PETITIONER'S APPLICATION TO PROCEED <i>IN FORMA PAUPERIS</i> IN THIS COURT .....	18
GENERAL OBJECTIONS TO PETITIONER'S MISUSE OF COURT PROCEEDINGS.....	21
CONCLUSION .....	22

Plaintiff's verified summons and Complaint .....	1
Defendant's Answer .....	2
Defendant's Notice of Motion dated April 14, 2015 .....	3
Order of Hon. Angela A. Iannacci dated July 6, 2015 .....	4
Relevant pages of the trial transcript .....	5
Defendant's Affirmation dated January 7, 2016.....	6
Order of Hon. Thomas Feinman dated March 1, 2016 .....	7
Judgment with Notice of Entry .....	8
Order of Appellate Division, Second Department dated June 30, 2016 .....	9
Notice of Appeal dated July 14, 2016 from plaintiff.....	10
A copy of the letter brief filed by defense counsel dated August 3, 2016.....	11
Order of the Appellate Division, Second Department dated June 30, 2016 to the New York State Court of Appeals .....	12
Order of the New York State Court of Appeals dated and entered September 8, 2016 .....	13
Plaintiff's Notice of Appeal dated September 18, 2016.....	14
Defendant's Notice of Motion dated March 6, 2017.....	15
Reply Affirmation of defense counsel dated March 29, 2017 .....	16
Order of the Appellate Division, Second Department dated May 10, 2017.....	17
Defendant's letter brief dated June 28, 2017.....	18
Affirmation in Opposition dated June 23, 2017.....	19

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.