

Nos. 19-1434, 19-1452, and 19-1458

IN THE
Supreme Court of the United States

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
Petitioner,

v.

ARTHREX, INC., ET AL.,
Respondents.

**On Writ of Certiorari
to the United States Court of Appeals
for the Federal Circuit**

REPLY BRIEF FOR ARTHREX, INC.

ANTHONY P. CHO
DAVID J. GASKEY
JESSICA E. FLEETHAM
DAVID L. ATALLAH
CARLSON, GASKEY & OLDS, P.C.
400 West Maple Road, Suite 350
Birmingham, MI 48009
(248) 988-8360

CHARLES W. SABER
SALVATORE P. TAMBURRO
BLANK ROME LLP
1825 Eye Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006
(202) 420-2200

JOHN W. SCHMIEDING
TREVOR ARNOLD
ARTHREX, INC.
1370 Creekside Blvd.
Naples, FL 34108
(239) 643-5553

JEFFREY A. LAMKEN
Counsel of Record
ROBERT K. KRY
JAMES A. BARTA
MOLOLAMKEN LLP
The Watergate, Suite 500
600 New Hampshire Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20037
(202) 556-2000
jlamken@mololamken.com

JORDAN A. RICE
MOLOLAMKEN LLP
300 North LaSalle Street
Chicago, IL 60654
(312) 450-6700

Counsel for Arthrex, Inc.
(additional captions on inside cover)

WILSON-EPES PRINTING CO., INC. — (202) 789-0096 — WASHINGTON, D.C. 20002

SMITH & NEPHEW, INC., ET AL.,
Petitioners,

v.

ARTHREX, INC., ET AL.,
Respondents.

ARTHREX, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

SMITH & NEPHEW, INC., ET AL.,
Respondents.

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether, for purposes of the Appointments Clause, U.S. Const. art. II, § 2, cl. 2, administrative patent judges of the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office are principal officers who must be appointed by the President with the Senate’s advice and consent, or “inferior Officers” whose appointment Congress has permissibly vested in a department head.

2. Whether, if administrative patent judges are principal officers, the court of appeals properly cured any Appointments Clause defect in the current statutory scheme prospectively by severing the application of 5 U.S.C. § 7513(a) to those judges.

(i)

CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Pursuant to this Court's Rule 29.6, Arthrex, Inc. states that the corporate disclosure statement included in its opening brief remains accurate.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Preliminary Statement	1
Argument.....	3
I. The Court of Appeals’ Severance Remedy Was Insufficient To Cure the Violation	3
A. The Appointments Clause Requires Review of Administrative Patent Judges’ Decisions by Superior Executive Officers	3
B. Other Oversight Powers Are Not Substitutes for Review	11
II. The Court of Appeals’ Severance Remedy Defies Congressional Intent	14
A. Congress Would Not Have Enacted the Statute Without Tenure Protections	14
B. Congress Should Determine the Appropriate Remedy	16
C. Arthrex Is Entitled to Dismissal	19
III. Smith & Nephew’s Remaining Arguments Are Not Properly Before the Court.....	20
Conclusion.....	23

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.