

Nos. 19-1434, 19-1452, 19-1458

---

---

In the  
**Supreme Court of the United States**

---

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

*Petitioner,*

v.

ARTHREX, INC., ET AL.,

*Respondents.*

---

On Writs of Certiorari to the  
United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit

---

**BRIEF AMICUS CURIAE OF PACIFIC  
LEGAL FOUNDATION IN SUPPORT  
OF RESPONDENT ARTHREX, INC.,  
IN NOS. 19-1434 & 19-1452**

---

DAMIEN M. SCHIFF  
Pacific Legal Foundation  
930 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
916.419.7111  
dschiff@pacificallegal.org

OLIVER J. DUNFORD  
*Counsel of Record*  
Pacific Legal Foundation  
4440 PGA Blvd., Ste. 307  
Palm Beach Gardens, FL  
33410  
916.503.9060  
odunford@pacificallegal.org

*Counsel for Amicus Curiae  
Pacific Legal Foundation*

(Additional captions listed on inside cover)

---

---

---

SMITH & NEPHEW, INC., ET AL.,

*Petitioners,*

v.

ARTHREX, INC., ET AL.,

*Respondents.*

---

ARTHREX, INC.,

*Petitioner,*

v.

SMITH & NEPHEW, INC., ET AL.,

*Respondents.*

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Authorities .....	iii
Identity and Interest of Amicus Curiae .....	1
Introduction and Summary of Argument .....	2
Argument .....	4
I. All “Officers of the United States” Exercise Sovereign Authority .....	4
A. Officers of the United States exercise “significant” authority—properly defined .....	5
B. “Significant” authority denotes sovereign authority—of varying levels of importance .....	9
II. The Distinctions Among Officers Depend on the Importance and Scope of Their Authority .....	12
A. The Constitution recognizes that “Officers of the United States” exercise varying levels of sovereign authority .....	12
B. Long-settled practice confirms that superior officers—although not Heads of Departments—exercise important power and wield substantial discretion ...	15
1. The Department of Justice .....	15
2. Health and Human Services .....	19
3. The “inferior Courts” .....	20
C. <i>Edmond’s</i> direction-and-supervision standard is inadequate to distinguish between inferior and non-inferior officers .....	22

- D. The key distinction between superior and inferior officers is the nature and scope of their authority.....25
  - 1. The power to issue final decisions on behalf of the government may be exercised only by superior and principal officers .....25
  - 2. The authority to exercise substantial discretion in carrying out responsibilities of high importance may be exercised only by superior and principal officers .....26
- III. Administrative Patent Judges Are Superior Officers.....28
- Conclusion.....30

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**Cases**

<i>Ass'n of Am. R.R. v. Dep't of Transp.</i> , 821 F.3d 19 (D.C. Cir. 2016) .....	26
<i>Auffmordt v. Hedden</i> , 137 U.S. 310 (1890) .....	6–7
<i>Buckley v. Valeo</i> , 424 U.S. 1 (1976) .....	3–7, 26
<i>Butz v. Economou</i> , 438 U.S. 478 (1978) .....	29
<i>City of Arlington v. FCC</i> , 569 U.S. 290 (2013) .....	11
<i>Dietz v. Bouldin</i> , 136 S. Ct. 1885 (2016) .....	20–21
<i>Edmond v. United States</i> , 520 U.S. 651 (1997) .....	3, 5–6, 23, 25–27
<i>Ex parte Hennen</i> , 38 U.S. (13 Pet.) 230 (1839) .....	8
<i>Federal Maritime Comm'n v. S. Carolina State Ports Auth.</i> , 535 U.S. 743 (2002) .....	29–30
<i>Free Enterprise Fund v. PCAOB</i> , 561 U.S. 477 (2010) .....	10–11, 19
<i>Freytag v. Commissioner</i> , 501 U.S. 868 (1991) .....	5–7
<i>Hall v. Wisconsin</i> , 103 U.S. (13 Otto) 5 (1880).....	8
<i>INS v. Chadha</i> , 462 U.S. 919 (1983) .....	11–12
<i>King v. Burnell</i> , Carth. 478 (K.B. 1700) .....	10–11

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.