

Nos. 19-1434, 19-1452, 19-1458

IN THE
Supreme Court of the United States

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
Petitioner,

v.

ARTHREX, INC., *et al.*,
Respondents.

**On Writs of Certiorari to
the U.S. Court of Appeals
for the Federal Circuit**

**BRIEF OF THE NEW CIVIL LIBERTIES ALLIANCE
AS *AMICUS CURIAE* URGING REVERSAL IN PART AND
SUPPORTING RESPONDENTS IN 19-1434 AND 19-1452**

Richard A. Samp
(Counsel of Record)
Mark Chenoweth
Jared McClain
Margaret A. Little
New Civil Liberties Alliance
1225 19th St. NW, Suite 450
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 869-5210
rich.samp@ncla.legal

December 30, 2020

SMITH & NEPHEW, INC., *et al.*,
Petitioners,

v.

ARTHREX, INC.,
Respondent.

ARTHREX, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

SMITH & NEPHEW, INC., *et al.*,
Respondent.

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether, for purposes of the Appointments Clause, U.S. Const., Art II, § 2, Cl. 2, administrative patent judges of the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office are principal officers who must be appointed by the President with the Senate’s advice and consent, or “inferior Officers” whose appointment Congress has permissibly vested in a department head.

2. Whether, if administrative patent judges are principal officers, the court of appeals properly cured any Appointments Clause defect in the current statutory scheme prospectively by severing the application of 5 U.S.C. § 7513(a) to those judges.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	vi
INTERESTS OF <i>AMICUS CURIAE</i>	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	2
ARGUMENT	6
 I. APJS ARE PRINCIPAL OFFICERS WHO MUST BE APPOINTED BY THE PRESIDENT WITH THE ADVICE AND CONSENT OF THE SENATE	 6
 A. Officers Are <i>Principal</i> Officers When, as Here, They Issue Adjudicative Decisions Not Reviewable by Any Superior Officer	 7
 1. Clear Line-Drawing Is Necessary; A Multi-Factor Balancing Test Provides Congress with Inadequate Guidance Regarding the Principal/ Inferior Distinction	 12
 2. Removal Power Is Central to Challenges Under the Take-Care Clause but of Limited Relevance to Appointments Clause Challenges ...	 13



Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.