

Nos. 19-1434, 19-1452, 19-1458

In the Supreme Court of the United States

United States of America,

Petitioner,

v.

Arthrex, Inc., et al.,

Respondents.

On Writ of Certiorari to the United States Court
of Appeals for the Federal Circuit

**BRIEF *AMICUS CURIAE* OF TIVO
CORPORATION IN SUPPORT OF
RESPONDENT ARTHREX**

MICHAEL E. JOFFRE

Counsel of Record

JASON D. EISENBERG

WILLIAM H. MILLIKEN

STERNE, KESSLER, GOLDSTEIN & FOX, PLLC

1100 New York Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20005

(202) 772-8856

mjoffre@sternekessler.com

Counsel for Amicus Curiae TiVo Corporation

December 30, 2020

(Additional Captions Listed on Inside Cover)

Smith & Nephew, Inc., et al.,
Petitioners,

v.

Arthrex, Inc., et al.,
Respondents.

Arthrex, Inc.,
Petitioner,

v.

Smith & Nephew, Inc., et al.,
Respondents.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
INTEREST OF <i>AMICUS CURIAE</i>	1
INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	3
ARGUMENT	6
I. The inter partes review regime has failed to provide a satisfactory forum for adjudicating patent rights.	6
A. Patent infringers frequently abuse the inter partes review process to conduct multiple attacks on the validity of patents, thereby depriving patent owners of quiet title over their inventions.	6
B. The Board’s extraordinarily high claim- cancellation rates confirm that the inter partes review process is not a neutral alternative to adjudication of patent rights in federal court.....	13
1. Contrary to the suggestion of several amici, the Board’s claim-cancellation rates are much higher than those of district courts.	13
2. The high affirmance rate of Board decisions reflects the forgiving standard of review on appeal—not necessarily accuracy on the part of the Board.....	15

II. The Federal Circuit’s removal of administrative patent judges’ tenure protections exacerbates the problems inherent in the inter partes review regime..... 17

A. The court of appeals’ remedy undermines the independence of administrative patent judges, contravening longstanding principles of administrative adjudication..... 18

B. Subjecting administrative patent judges to at-will removal magnifies problematic structural biases already present in the inter partes review process..... 20

III. The task of remedying the Appointments Clause violation properly belongs with Congress, not the courts..... 26

CONCLUSION 27

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Aetna Life Ins. Co. v. Lavoie</i> , 475 U.S. 813 (1986).....	21
<i>Brown v. Vance</i> , 637 F.2d 272 (5th Cir. 1981).....	24, 25
<i>Butz v. Economou</i> , 438 U.S. 478 (1978).....	19
<i>Cain v. White</i> , 937 F.3d 446 (5th Cir. 2019).....	21
<i>Certain Digital Video Receivers and Related Hardware and Software Components</i> , Initial Determination, Inv. No. 337-TA-1103 (U.S.I.T.C. June 27, 2019)	7
<i>Chrimar Sys., Inc. v. ALE USA Inc.</i> , 785 F. App'x 854 (Fed. Cir. 2019).....	11
<i>Comcast Cable Commc'ns, LLC v. Rovi Guides, Inc.</i> , No. IPR2019-00231, Paper 44 (P.T.A.B. May 8, 2020).....	8

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.