

No. 20-74

---

---

IN THE  
**Supreme Court of the United States**

---

UNITED STATES,

*Petitioner,*

*v.*

IMAGE PROCESSING TECHNOLOGIES LLC, *et al.*,

*Respondents.*

---

ON PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED  
STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FEDERAL CIRCUIT

---

---

**BRIEF IN OPPOSITION OF RESPONDENT  
BOLORO GLOBAL LIMITED**

---

---

CARLOS VILLAMAR  
THE VILLAMAR FIRM, PLLC  
3424 Washington Drive  
Falls Church, Virginia 22041  
(703) 623-4122

MICHAEL R. CASEY  
*Counsel of Record*  
JAMES R. LOVE  
ROBERT TARCU  
OBLON, McCLELLAND, MAIER  
& NEUSTADT, LLP  
1940 Duke Street  
Alexandria, Virginia 22314  
(703) 413-3000  
mcasey@oblon.com

*Counsel for Respondent Boloro Global Limited*

---

---

298145



COUNSEL PRESS

(800) 274-3321 • (800) 359-6859

## QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether, for purposes of the Appointments Clause, U.S. Const. Art. II, § 2, Cl. 2, administrative patent judges of the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office are principal officers who must be appointed by the President with the Senate’s advice and consent, or “inferior Officers” whose appointment Congress has permissibly vested in a department head.

2. Whether the court of appeals erred by adjudicating Appointments Clause challenges brought by litigants that had not presented such a challenge to the agency.

**CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

Pursuant to this Court's Rule 29.6, respondent Boloro Global Limited ("Boloro") states that it has no parent corporation and that no publicly held company owns 10% or more of its stock.

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<i>Page</i>
QUESTIONS PRESENTED .....	i
CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT .....	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	iii
TABLE OF CITED AUTHORITIES .....	iv
STATEMENT .....	1
I. STATUTORY AND PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND .....	1
II. PROCEEDINGS BELOW.....	1
ARGUMENT.....	2
I. ADMINISTRATIVE PATENT JUDGES OF THE U.S. PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE ARE UNCONSTITUTIONALLY APPOINTED PRINCIPAL OFFICERS.....	2
II. EVEN IF APJS ARE FOUND TO BE CONSTITUTIONAL APPOINTED GENERALLY, RESPONDENT’S PTAB PANEL DECIDING ISSUES UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 101 WERE NOT .....	4
III. THE APPOINTMENTS CLAUSE CHALLENGE WAS TIMELY RAISED .....	5
CONCLUSION .....	7

TABLE OF CITED AUTHORITIES

Page

CASES

*Arthrex, Inc. v. Smith & Nephew, Inc.*,  
941 F.3d 1320 (Fed. Cir. 2019), *reh'g denied*,  
953 F.3d 760 (Fed. Cir. 2020), *petitions for*  
*cert. pending*, Nos. 19-1434 (filed June 25,  
2020), 19-1452 (filed June 29, 2020), and  
19-1458 (filed June 30, 2020). . . . . *passim*

*Buckley v. Valeo*,  
424 U.S. 1 (1976). . . . . 3

*Jones Bros., Inc. v. Sec'y of Labor*,  
898 F.3d 669 (6th Cir. 2018). . . . . 6

*Thunder Basin Coal Co. v. Reich*,  
510 U.S. 200 (1994). . . . . 6

STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 101 . . . . . 4, 5, 7

35 U.S.C. § 318(a). . . . . 3

35 U.S.C. § 6(b)(1) . . . . . 4

35 U.S.C. § 6(c). . . . . 4

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.