

No. 21-1272

In The
Supreme Court of the United States

MONSANTO COMPANY,

Petitioner,

v.

ALBERTA PILLIOD AND ALVA PILLIOD,

Respondents.

On Petition for a Writ of Certiorari to the
Court of Appeal of California

**BRIEF OF WASHINGTON LEGAL FOUNDATION
AND ALLIED EDUCATIONAL FOUNDATION AS
AMICI CURIAE SUPPORTING PETITIONER**

John M. Masslon II

Counsel of Record

Cory L. Andrews

WASHINGTON LEGAL FOUNDATION

2009 Massachusetts Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20036

(202) 588-0302

jmasslon@wlf.org

April 19, 2022

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act preempts state-law failure-to-warn claims where the warning cannot be added to a product without Environmental Protection Agency approval and EPA has repeatedly rejected the warning.

2. Whether a punitive-damages award that is four times a substantial compensatory-damages award violates the Fourteenth Amendment's Due Process Clause when the defendant acted reasonably.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
QUESTIONS PRESENTED	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iv
INTERESTS OF <i>AMICI CURIAE</i>	1
INTRODUCTION	2
STATEMENT	3
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	5
ARGUMENT	7
I. WHETHER STATE-LAW FAILURE-TO-WARN CLAIMS OVER GLYPHOSATE ARE PREEMPTED BY FIFRA IS AN ISSUE OF NATIONAL IMPORTANCE	7
A. The Process For Listing Glyphosate As Dangerous To Humans Was Unscientific Rent Seeking	7
B. Companies Will Not Invest In Pesticides If They Will Face Liability For Complying With Federal Law	12
II. THIS CASE COULD RESOLVE UNCERTAINTY ABOUT IMPLIED PREEMPTION IN OTHER AREAS	14
III. REVIEW IS NEEDED TO CLARIFY THE LIMITS ON PUNITIVE-DAMAGES AWARDS	15
CONCLUSION	19

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>A.Y. v. Janssen Pharms. Inc.</i> , 224 A.3d 1 (Pa. Super. 2019)	15
<i>Bach v. First Union Nat. Bank</i> , 486 F.3d 150 (6th Cir. 2007).....	16
<i>Bates v. Dow Agrosciences LLC</i> , 544 U.S. 431 (2005).....	4
<i>BMW of N. Am., Inc. v. Gore</i> , 517 U.S. 559 (1996).....	15
<i>Bristol-Myers Squibb Co. v. Superior Ct. of Cal., S.F. Cnty.</i> , 137 S. Ct. 1773 (2017).....	7
<i>Byrd v. Janssen Pharm., Inc.</i> , 333 F. Supp. 3d 111 (N.D.N.Y. 2018)	14, 15
<i>Cote v. Philip Morris USA, Inc.</i> , 985 F.3d 840 (11th Cir. 2021).....	16
<i>DIRECTV, Inc. v. Imburgia</i> , 577 U.S. 47 (2015).....	7
<i>Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker</i> , 554 U.S. 471 (2008).....	17, 18
<i>Honda Motor Co. v. Oberg</i> , 512 U.S. 415 (1994).....	15
<i>Jones v. United Parcel Serv., Inc.</i> , 674 F.3d 1187 (10th Cir. 2012).....	16
<i>Merck Sharp & Dohme Corp. v. Albrecht</i> , 139 S. Ct. 1668 (2019).....	14

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

(continued)

	Page(s)
<i>Monsanto Co. v. Off. of Env't Health Hazard Assessment, 22 Cal. App. 5th 534 (2018)</i>	1
<i>PLIVA, Inc. v. Mensing, 564 U.S. 604 (2011)</i>	14
<i>Saccameno v. U.S. Bank Nat'l Ass'n, 943 F.3d 1071 (7th Cir. 2019)</i>	16
<i>State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co. v. Campbell, 538 U.S. 408 (2003)</i>	15, 16, 17
<i>Wyeth v. Levine, 555 U.S. 555 (2009)</i>	14
Constitutional Provision	
U.S. Const. art. VI, § 2.....	7
Statutes	
7 U.S.C.	
§136a(a).....	4
§136a(c).....	4
§ 136a(c)(1).....	4
§ 136j(a)(1)(B).....	4
Cal. Health & Saf. Code § 25249.6.....	3
Cal. Health & Saf. Code § 25249.8(a).....	3
Cal. Labor Code § 6382(b)(1).....	3

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.