

No. 23-430

In the
Supreme Court of the United States

RICHARD R. FINCH,
Petitioner,

v.

HARRY WAYNE CASEY AND
HARRICK MUSIC, INC.,
Respondents.

**On Petition for a Writ of Certiorari to the United
States Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit**

BRIEF IN OPPOSITION

FRANKLIN L. ZEMEL
Counsel of Record
SAUL EWING LLP
200 East Las Olas Boulevard
Suite 1000
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
954.713.7600
franklin.zemel@saul.com
Counsel for Respondents

Becker Gallagher · Cincinnati, OH · Washington, D.C. · 800.890.5001

QUESTION PRESENTED

The Petitioner's¹ characterization of the question presented (*i.e.*, the application of the “discovery accrual rule”) was not raised, discussed, or applied in any of the underlying proceedings. Contrary to the Petitioner's statement, the issue in the proceedings below was simple and straightforward: Whether Casey's statute of limitations defense was itself time-barred. The *per curiam* decision below is unexceptional and, contrary to the Petitioner's contention, does not present a question of “national significance” or contravene the purposes of Section 203 of the Copyright Act. Indeed, the Eleventh Circuit referred to the Petitioner's appeal as “push[ing] the boundary” of frivolousness. (Pet. App. A, 4a).

¹ The Petitioner, Richard Finch, will be referred to herein as the “Petitioner” or “Finch.” The Respondent, Harry Wayne Casey, will be referred to as “Casey.” The Respondent, Harrick Music, Inc., will be referred to as “Harrick.”

RULE 29.6 STATEMENT

There is no parent corporation of Respondent, Harrick Music, Inc., nor is there any publicly held corporation or entity owning 10% or more of Harrick.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

QUESTION PRESENTED..... i

RULE 29.6 STATEMENT ii

STATUTORY PROVISIONS.....1

INTRODUCTION.....1

STATEMENT OF THE CASE3

REASONS FOR DENYING THE PETITION12

A. THE PETITIONER SEEKS REVIEW ON A QUESTION NOT PRESENTED BY THIS CASE.....12

B. THE DECISION BELOW IS A ROUTINE APPLICATION OF WELL-SETTLED LAW.....14

C. THE PETITION DOES NOT RAISE ANY ISSUES THAT WARRANT THIS COURT’S REVIEW.....17

 1. *The Petitioner’s Claim of Alleged “Error” in the Holdings Below is Not a Compelling Reason to Grant Certiorari Review*17

 2. *The Eleventh Circuit (and the District Court) Properly Applied Settled Law*.....18

CONCLUSION21

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

<i>Estate of Hogarth v. Edgar Rice Burroughs, Inc.</i> , 342 F.3d 149 (2d Cir. 2003).....	15
<i>Garza v. Everly</i> , 59 F.4th 876 (6th Cir 2023).....	18, 19, 20
<i>Nealy v. Warner Chappel Music, Inc.</i> , 60 F.4th 1325 (11th Cir. 2023), <i>cert. granted</i> , -- S. Ct. --, 2023 WL 6319656 (Mem) (September 29, 2023)	13, 14
<i>United States v. W. Pac. R. Co.</i> , 352 U.S. 59 (1956)	14

STATUTES

17 U.S.C. § 203	1, 2, 9, 10, 12, 13, 15, 16, 17
17 U.S.C. § 410(c)	1
17 U.S.C. § 507(b).....	2, 8, 10, 15

RULES

Sup. Ct. R. 10.....	3, 12, 17, 21
---------------------	---------------

OTHER AUTHORITIES

S. Shapiro, K. Geller, T. Bishop, E. Hartnett, & D. Himmelfarb, <i>Supreme Court Practice</i> (10th ed. 2013)	17, 18
---	--------

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.