

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
SHERMAN DIVISION**

IMPLICIT, LLC

Plaintiff,

v.

TARGET CORPORATION

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 4:21-cv-408

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

COMPLAINT FOR PATENT INFRINGEMENT

Plaintiff Implicit, LLC (“Implicit” or “Plaintiff”), for its Complaint against Defendant Target Corporation, (referred to herein as “Defendant”), alleges the following:

NATURE OF THE ACTION

1. This is an action for patent infringement arising under the Patent Laws of the United States, 35 U.S.C. § 1 *et seq.*

THE PARTIES

2. Plaintiff Implicit is a limited liability company organized under the laws of the State of Washington with a place of business at 101 E Park Blvd, Suite 600, Plano, TX 75074.

3. Upon information and belief, Defendant is a corporation organized under the laws of the State of Minnesota with retail stores in this District, including stores at 120 W Parker Rd, Plano, TX 75075-2331 and 2200 Dallas Pkwy, Plano, TX 75093-4300. Upon information and belief, Defendant sells, offers to sell, and/or uses products and services throughout the United States, including in this judicial district, and introduces infringing products and services into the stream of commerce knowing that they would be sold and/or used in this judicial district and elsewhere in the United States.

Page 1 of 67

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

4. This is an action for patent infringement arising under the Patent Laws of the United States, Title 35 of the United States Code.

5. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1338(a).

6. Venue is proper in this judicial district under 28 U.S.C. § 1400(b).

7. This Court has personal jurisdiction over the Defendant under the laws of the State of Texas, due at least to its substantial business in Texas and in this judicial district, directly or through intermediaries, including regularly doing or soliciting business, engaging in other persistent courses of conduct and/or deriving substantial revenue from goods and services provided to individuals in the State of Texas. Venue is also proper in this district because Defendant has a regular and established place of business in this district. For instance, as noted above, Defendant has several stores in this district, including stores at 120 W Parker Rd, Plano, TX 75075-2331 and 2200 Dallas Pkwy, Plano, TX 75093-4300. (*See* <https://www.target.com/sl/plano/67>.)

BACKGROUND

The Invention

8. Edward Balassanian is the inventor of U.S. Patent No. 8,856,185 (“the ’185 patent”). A true and correct copy of the ’185 patent is attached as Exhibit A.

9. The ’185 patent resulted from the pioneering efforts of Mr. Balassanian (hereinafter “the Inventor”) in the area of computer systems and methods to manage access to information using object attributes. These efforts resulted in the development of a novel method and system for attribute management in a namespace in 2002. At the time of these pioneering efforts, the most widely implemented technology used to access various data structures to locate the object and return its reference relied on namespaces utilizing predefined attributes

associated with their objects and logical views of objects that corresponded to the physical organization of the namespace. The Inventor conceived of the inventions claimed in the '185 patent as a way to improve upon these shortcomings and allow for more flexible handling of object attributes and more flexible views into the namespace.

10. For example, as recited in claim 1 of the '185 patent, the Inventor developed a method comprising:

storing, at a computer system, information that implements a namespace having a plurality of objects, wherein the stored information includes data for various ones of the plurality of objects that is indicative of attribute values for one or more of a plurality of object attributes;

receiving, by the computer system, an object associated with a user-defined attribute value;

adding, by the computer system, the object associated with the user-defined attribute value to the namespace;

receiving, by the computer system, first and second queries of the namespace that respectively indicate one or more attribute values and organization of query results, wherein the first query indicates relative levels of object attributes within a first hierarchy of object attributes and wherein the second query indicates relative levels of object attributes within a second hierarchy of object attributes;

generating, by the computer system in response to the first and second queries, respective first and second sets of access data usable to access objects in the namespace that have one or more attribute values that match the one or more attribute values specified by the respective first and second queries; and

transmitting, by the computer system, the first and second sets of access data to one or more second computer systems associated with the first and second queries;

wherein the first and second sets of access data are organized using the respective first and second hierarchies, and wherein the second hierarchy includes a given attribute at a level that is different from a level of the given attribute in the first hierarchy.

11. Because of the aforementioned advantages that can be achieved through the use of the patented invention, the '185 patent presents significant commercial value for companies like Defendant. Indeed, Defendant's website ranked 256th of all websites globally in Alexa's "90 Day Trend" for global internet engagement as reported on Alexa.com, visited shortly before the filing of this complaint. (*See* <https://www.alexa.com/siteinfo/target.com> (last visited May 26, 2021).)

12. The patented invention disclosed in the '185 patent resolves technical problems related to managing access to data structures to locate the object, particularly problems related to flexibility in the handling of object attributes and views into the namespace

13. The claims of the '185 patent do not merely recite the performance of some well-known business practice from the pre-Internet world along with the requirement to perform it on the Internet. Instead, the claims of the '185 patent recite inventive concepts that are deeply rooted in engineering technology, and overcome problems specifically arising out of how to manage attributes for and views of objects within a namespace wherein multiple queries may be used to access a data structure in a computer system at various levels of hierarchy.

14. The claims of the '185 patent recite inventive concepts that are not merely routine or conventional use of the aforementioned computer systems, but provide a new and novel solution to specific problems related to improving data management and access therein.

15. And finally, the patented invention disclosed in the '185 patent does not preempt all the ways that computer systems may be organized to improve data access, nor does the '185 patent preempt any other well-known or prior art technology.

16. Accordingly, the claims in the '185 patent recite a combination of elements sufficient to ensure that the claim in substance and in practice amounts to significantly more than a patent-ineligible abstract idea.

COUNT I – INFRINGEMENT OF U.S. PATENT NO. 8,856,185

17. The allegations set forth in the foregoing paragraphs are incorporated into this Count I.

18. On October 7, 2014, the '185 patent was duly and legally issued by the United States Patent and Trademark Office under the title “method and system for attribute management in a namespace”.

19. Implicit is the assignee and owner of the right, title and interest in and to the '185 patent, including the right to assert all causes of action arising under said patent and the right to any remedies for infringement of it.

20. Upon information and belief, Defendant has and continues to directly infringe one or more claims of the '185 patent by using its website, specifically its e-commerce platform and the computer systems therein (the “Accused Instrumentalities”).

21. Upon information and belief, the Accused Instrumentalities performs a method for storing information that implements a namespace having a plurality of objects. Exemplary infringement analysis showing infringement of all elements of the method recited in claim 1 of the '185 patent is set forth in Exhibit B. This infringement analysis is necessarily preliminary, as it is provided in advance of any discovery provided by Defendant with respect to the '185 patent. Implicit reserves all rights to amend, supplement and modify this preliminary infringement analysis. Nothing in the attached chart should be construed as any express or implied contention or admission regarding the construction of any term or phrase of the claims of the '185 patent.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.