

CAUSE NO. 13-23-00272-CV

IN THE THIRTEENTH DISTRICT COURT OF APPEALS
CORPUS CHRISTI - EDINBURG, TEXAS

FILED IN
CORPUS CHRISTI/EDINBURG, TEXAS
8/21/2023 3:31:07 PM

KATHY S. MILLS
Clerk

Novus Prime Properties, LLC v. Space Exploration Technologies Corp.

APPELLANT'S BRIEF

**ON APPEAL FROM THE 107th JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF
CAMERON COUNTY, TEXAS
HONORABLE BENJAMIN EURESTI, JR., JUDGE PRESIDING**

Gustavo A. Grajales

Attorney
State Bar No. 24104715
THE LAW OFFICES OF
GUSTAVO A. GRAJALES, PLLC.
905 E. Los Ebanos Blvd. Suite D
Brownsville, Texas 78520
P: (956) 280-5787
E: gusgrajaleslaw@gmail.com

Tomas Tijerina

Attorney
State Bar No. 24070746
MARTINEZ/TIJERINA, PLLC.
1201 E. Van Buren
Brownsville, TX 78520
P: (956) 546-7159
F: (956) 544-0602
E: ttijerina@mbmtlawfirm.com

Benigno (Trey) Martinez

Attorney
State Bar No. 00797011
MARTINEZ/TIJERINA, PLLC
1201 E. Van Buren
Brownsville, Texas 78520
P: (956) 546-7159
F: (956) 544-0602
E: trey@mbmtlawfirm.com

Counsel for Appellant

ARGUMENT REQUESTED

IDENTIFICATION OF THE PARTIES AND COUNSEL

Appellant: NOVUS PRIME PROPERTIES, LLC.

Appellant's Trial Counsel: Hon. Tomas F. Tijerina
State Bar No. 2407046
MBMT LAW FIRM
1201 E. Van Buren
Brownsville, TX 78520
P: (956) 550-4868
F: (956) 621-0135
ttijerina@mbmtlawfirm.com

Hon. Benigno "Trey" Martinez
State Bar No. 00797011
MBMT LAW FIRM
1201 E. Van Buren
Brownsville, TX 78520
P: (956) 550-4868
F: (956) 621-0135
trey@mbmtlawfirm.com

Appellant's Appellate Counsel: Hon. Gustavo A. Grajales
State Bar No. 24104715
THE LAW OFFICES OF
GUSTAVO A. GRAJALES, PLLC.
905 E. Los Ebanos Blvd. Suite D.
Brownsville, TX 78520
(956) 280-5787
gusrajaleslaw@gmail.com

Hon. Tomas F. Tijerina
State Bar No. 2407046
MBMT LAW FIRM
1201 E. Van Buren
Brownsville, TX 78520
P: (956) 550-4868
F: (956) 621-0135
ttijerina@mbmtlawfirm.com

Hon. Benigno “Trey” Martinez
State Bar No. 00797011
MBMT LAW FIRM
1201 E. Van Buren
Brownsville, TX 78520
P: (956) 550-4868
F: (956) 621-0135
trey@mbmtlawfirm.com

Appellee:

SPACE EXPLORATION
TECHNOLOGIES CORP.

Appellee’s Trial Counsel:

Hon. Francisco J. Orozco, Jr.
State Bar No. 24088162
SANCHEZ, WHITTINGTON, WOOD
& OROZCO, LLC.
3505 Boca Chica Blvd. Suite D.
Brownsville, TX 78520
P: (956) 546-3731
F: (956) 546-3765 or (956) 546-3766
E: forozco@southtexaslegal.com

Appellee’s Appellate Counsel:

Hon. Francisco J. Orozco, Jr.
State Bar No. 24088162
SANCHEZ, WHITTINGTON, WOOD
& OROZCO, LLC.
3505 Boca Chica Blvd. Suite D.
Brownsville, TX 78520
P: (956) 546-3731
F: (956) 546-3765 or (956) 546-3766
E: forozco@southtexaslegal.com

...

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

IDENTIFICATION OF THE PARTIES AND COUNSEL	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
INDEX OF AUTHORITIES	vi
STATEMENT OF THE CASE	x
STATEMENT REGARDING ORAL ARGUMENT	xi
ISSUES PRESENTED	xii
1. <i>May a court order a constructive trust imposed upon a property where the party seeking the equitable remedy never owned a res which is traceable to the property at issue?</i>	xii
2. <i>May a court grant an application for temporary injunction which is:</i>	xii
a. <i>unsupported by sworn affidavit and or insufficient evidence; and or</i>	xii
b. <i>the applicant’s right to relief is either legally impossible and or where an irreparable harm is undemonstrated within the trial record?</i>	xii
3. <i>May a court grant an application for temporary injunction where an equitable remedy is sought more than three (3) years after the incident which gave rise to applicant’s claim occurred?</i>	xii
SALUTATION	1
STATEMENT OF FACTS	2
1. <i>NOVUS’ January 13, 2020 Purchase of the Dopak Property and NOVUS’ January 16, 2020 Agreement with SPACEX.</i>	2
2. <i>SPACEX’s Lawsuit, NOVUS’ Counter Lawsuit, and the Parties’ Motions for Summary Judgment.</i>	5
3. <i>SPACEX’s Motion for Temporary Injunction and NOVUS Response.</i>	7
4. <i>The Hearing on SPACEX’s Application for Temporary Injunction, the Trial Courts Ruling and Order.</i>	10
SUMMARY OF THE ARGUMENT.....	16
ARGUMENT.....	17
1. <i>The trial court abused its discretion by ordering a constructive trust be placed upon the Dopak Property because SPACEX cannot trace its requested equitable relief to the res.</i>	17
a. <i>Standard of Review: Abuse of Discretion.</i>	17
b. <i>Applicable Law: KCM Fin. LLC & SCOTEX’s Three Element Test for Constructive Trusts.</i>	

c. <i>SPACEX’s desire for the Dopak Property does not equate to legal and or equitable ownership to secure a constructive trust.</i>	21
2. <i>The trial abused its discretion in granting SPACEX’s application for temporary injunction because it was both unsworn and unsupported by sufficient evidence to establish both a probable right to relief and or irreparable harm.</i>	31
a. <i>Standard of Review: Abuse of Discretion.</i>	31
b. <i>Applicable Law: Butnaru v. Ford Motor Co., Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 628, and Texas Business & Commerce Code Section 15.50.</i>	33
c. <i>SPACEX’s unverified petition, deficient affidavit and arguments are insufficient to demonstrate either irreparable harm and or a probable right to relief against NOVUS.</i>	36
3. <i>The trial court abused its discretion in granting SPACEX’s application for a temporary injunction because the request was barred by laches.</i>	50
a. <i>Standard of Review: Abuse of Discretion.</i>	50
b. <i>Applicable Law: In Re Laibe Corp.</i>	50
c. <i>SPACEX’s three year wait to request injunctive relief demonstrates it slept on its rights.</i>	51
PRAYER	55
APPENDIX	58

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.