

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
WACO DIVISION**

Cub Club Investment, LLC,

Plaintiff,

v.

Apple Inc.,

Defendant.

§
§
§
§
§
§
§

Civil Action No. 6:20-CV-856-ADA-JCM

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

DEFENDANT APPLE INC.'S MOTION TO DISMISS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. BACKGROUND	2
A. Factual Background	2
B. Procedural History	4
III. LEGAL STANDARD.....	5
IV. ARGUMENT	5
A. Cub Club has not stated a claim for copyright infringement (Count I).	5
1. Copyright does not protect the idea of applying skin tones to emoji.....	7
2. Copyright does not protect human features or color variations.....	9
3. Cub Club does not state a claim for copyright infringement of any protectable element of its copyrighted works.	11
B. Cub Club fails to state a claim for trade dress infringement (Count II).	14
1. “The insertion of emoji into messages” is a functional task that cannot qualify for trade dress protection.	15
2. Cub Club has not alleged secondary meaning.	19
C. Cub Club’s state law claims (Counts III, IV, and V) should be dismissed.....	19
V. CONCLUSION.....	20

..

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**Page(s)****CASES**

<i>Abdin v. CBS Broad. Inc.</i> , 971 F.3d 57 (2d Cir. 2020).....	10
<i>Allied Mktg. Grp., Inc. v. CDL Mktg., Inc.</i> , 878 F.2d 806 (5th Cir. 1989)	15
<i>Am. Greetings Corp. v. Dan-Dee Imports, Inc.</i> , 807 F.2d 1136 (3d Cir. 1986).....	17
<i>Amazing Spaces, Inc. v. Metro Mini Storage</i> , 608 F.3d 225 (5th Cir. 2010)	20
<i>Apple Computer, Inc. v. Microsoft Corp.</i> , 35 F.3d 1435 (9th Cir. 1994)	12
<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 556 U.S. 662 (2009).....	5
<i>Matter of ATP Oil & Gas Corp.</i> , 888 F.3d 122 (5th Cir. 2018)	5
<i>Aurora World, Inc. v. Ty Inc.</i> , No. 09-cv-08463, 2011 WL 13176413 (C.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2011).....	20
<i>Bayco Prod., Inc. v. Lynch</i> , No. 10-cv-1820, 2011 WL 1602571 (N.D. Tex. Apr. 28, 2011)	14, 16, 18
<i>Blehm v. Jacobs</i> , 702 F.3d 1193 (10th Cir. 2012)	10
<i>Busti v. Platinum Studios, Inc.</i> , No. 11-cv-1029, 2013 WL 12121116 (W.D. Tex. Aug. 30, 2013).....	6
<i>Cat & Dogma, LLC v. Target Corp.</i> , No. 19-cv-1002, 2020 WL 4810962 (W.D. Tex. July 23, 2020).....	6
<i>Chhim v. Univ. of Texas at Austin</i> , 836 F.3d 467 (5th Cir. 2016) (per curiam).....	5
<i>Cory Van Rijn, Inc. v. Cal. Raisin Advisory Bd.</i> , 697 F. Supp. 1136 (E.D. Cal. 1987).....	13, 14

...

<i>Deckers Outdoor Corp. v. Fortune Dynamic, Inc.</i> , No. 15-cv-769, 2015 WL 12731929 (C.D. Cal. May 8, 2015).....	15
<i>Enchant Christmas Light Maze & Mkt. Ltd. v. Glowco, LLC</i> , 958 F.3d 532 (6th Cir. 2020)	12
<i>Ets-Hokin v. Skyy Spirits, Inc.</i> 323 F.3d 763 (9th Cir. 2003)	12
<i>Express Lien, Inc. v. Handle, Inc.</i> , No. 19-cv-10156, 2020 WL 1030847 (E.D. La. Mar. 3, 2020).....	15, 18, 19
<i>Feist Publications, Inc. v. Rural Tel. Serv. Co.</i> , 499 U.S. 340 (1991).....	5, 6
<i>Fernandez-Montez v. Allied Pilots Assoc.</i> , 987 F.2d 278 (5th Cir. 1993)	5
<i>Fin. Info. Inc. v. Moody's Investors Serv., Inc.</i> , 808 F.2d 204 (2nd Cir. 1986).....	9
<i>Folkens v. Wyland Worldwide, LLC</i> , 882 F.3d 768 (9th Cir. 2018)	8
<i>Harvey Cartoons v. Columbia Pictures Indus., Inc.</i> , 645 F. Supp. 1564 (S.D.N.Y. 1986).....	14
<i>ID7D Co. v. Sears Holding Corp.</i> , No. 11-cv-1054, 2012 WL 1247329 (D. Conn. Apr. 13, 2012).....	17
<i>Interlink Prod. Int'l, Inc. v. HDS Trading Corp., Inc.</i> , No. 15-cv-1642, 2015 WL 12840378 (D.N.J. Oct. 14, 2015)	14
<i>Kaisha v. Lotte Int'l Am. Corp.</i> , No. 15-5477, 2019 WL 8405592 (D.N.J. July 31, 2019), <i>aff'd sub nom. Ezaki Glico Kabushiki Kaisha v. Lotte Int'l Am. Corp.</i> , 977 F.3d 261 (3d Cir. 2020).....	17
<i>Kepner-Tregoe, Inc. v. Leadership Software, Inc.</i> , 12 F.3d 527 (5th Cir. 1994)	6
<i>U.S. ex rel. Lam v. Tenet Healthcare Corp.</i> , 481 F. Supp. 2d 673 (W.D. Tex. 2006).....	3
<i>Laney Chiropractic & Sports Therapy, P.A. v. Nationwide Mut. Ins. Co.</i> , 866 F.3d 254 (5th Cir. 2017)	14, 15, 18
<i>Lennar Homes of Tex. Sales & Mktg., Ltd. v. Perry Homes, LLC</i> , 117 F. Supp. 3d 913 (S.D. Tex. 2015)	12

<i>Mattel, Inc. v. MGA Entm't, Inc.</i> , 616 F.3d 904 (9th Cir. 2010), as amended on denial of reh'g (Oct. 21, 2010)	8, 10, 11, 12
<i>McGee v. Benjamin</i> , No. 08-cv-11818, 2012 WL 959377 (D. Mass. Mar. 20, 2012)	11, 13
<i>Nola Spice Designs, L.L.C. v. Haydel Enters., Inc.</i> , 783 F.3d 527 (5th Cir. 2015)	5, 6, 7, 10
<i>Parker & Parsley Petroleum Co. v. Dresser Indus.</i> , 972 F.2d 580 (5th Cir. 1992)	20
<i>Pretty in Plastic, Inc. v. Bunn</i> , 793 F. App'x 593 (9th Cir. 2020)	12
<i>Profade Apparel, LLC v. Rd. Runner Sports, Inc.</i> , No. 18-cv-1254, 2020 WL 5230490 (S.D. Cal. Sept. 2, 2020).....	17
<i>Progressive Lighting, Inc. v. Lowe's Home Centers, Inc.</i> , 549 F. App'x 913 (11th Cir. 2013)	12
<i>Randolph v. Dimension Films</i> , 630 F. Supp. 2d 741 (S.D. Tex. 2009), <i>aff'd</i> , 381 F. App'x 449 (5th Cir. 2010) 6, 8, 11, 13, 14	
<i>Roxtec, Inc., v. Wallmax S.R.L.</i> , No. 17-cv-2105, 2018 WL 3870013 (S.D. Tex. Aug. 15, 2018)	17
<i>Rucker v. Harlequin Enters., LTD.</i> , No. 12-cv-1135, 2013 WL 707922 (S.D. Tex. Feb. 26, 2013).....	10
<i>Sno-Wizard Mfg., Inc. v. Eisemann Prod. Co.</i> , 791 F.2d 423 (5th Cir. 1986)	15
<i>Streetwise Maps, Inc. v. VanDam, Inc.</i> , 159 F.3d 739 (2d Cir. 1998).....	11
<i>Sybersound Records, Inc. v. UAV Corp.</i> , 517 F.3d 1137 (9th Cir. 2008)	20
<i>Taylor v. IBM</i> , 54 F. App'x 794, 2002 WL 31845220 (5th Cir. 2002).....	6
<i>Test Masters Educ. Servs., Inc. v. State Farm Lloyds</i> , 791 F.3d 561 (5th Cir. 2015)	14, 15
<i>Traffix Devices, Inc. v. Mktg. Displays, Inc.</i> , 532 U.S. 23 (2001).....	16

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.