

No. 21-1079

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT

FARMWORKER ASSOCIATION OF FLORIDA, et al.,
Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY,
Respondent.

On Petition for Review of Final Agency Action of the
United States Environmental Protection Agency

**RESPONDENT'S MOTION FOR REMAND WITHOUT VACATUR
AND RESPONSE TO PETITIONERS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY
VACATUR; MOTION FOR STAY PENDING EXPEDITED
REVIEW**

Of Counsel:
Erin Koch
Alyssa Gsell
U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency

JEAN E. WILLIAMS
Acting Assistant Attorney General
Mark Arthur Brown
Sarah Izfar
Hubert Lee
Attorneys
Environment and Nat. Resources Div.
U.S. Department of Justice
150 M Street, N.E.
Washington, D.C. 20002
(202) 305-0490
Sarah.izfar@usdoj.gov

**CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS, AND RELATED
CASES**

A. Parties and Amici

Except for the following, all parties, intervenors, and amici appearing in this court are listed in the Petitioners' Motion for Summary Vacatur; Motion for Stay Pending Expedited Review:

- 1) AgLogic Chemical, LLC has moved to intervene.

B. Rulings Under Review

References to the rulings at issue appear in Petitioners' motion.

C. Related Cases

There are no related cases within the meaning of Circuit Rule 28(a)(1)(C).

Dated: April 19, 2021

/s/ Sarah Izfar

SARAH IZFAR

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS, AND RELATED CASES.....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	iv
GLOSSARY.....	ix
INTRODUCTION.....	1
BACKGROUND.....	2
A. Legal Background.....	2
1. Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act.....	2
2. Endangered Species Act.....	4
B. Historical Background.....	7
C. Procedural History.....	9
1. The January 2021 Decision.....	9
2. Petition for Review and Procedural History.....	11
ARGUMENT.....	12
STANDARD OF REVIEW.....	13
ARGUMENT.....	15
I. EPA’s Acknowledgment That It Did Not Make an ESA Effects Determination Provides a Proper Basis to Remand This Action.....	15
II. Vacatur of the Conditional Registration Approval Is Not Required During the Pendency of the Remand.....	18

A.	Based on the Record Before the Court, the ESA Error Here Is Not So Serious a Deficiency That Vacatur is Compelled.....	20
1.	The Lack of an Effects Determination Does Not Require Vacatur.....	20
2.	EPA Satisfied Its Obligations Under FIFRA.....	24
a.	Substantial Record Support Exists for the Conditional Registration Approval.....	24
b.	EPA Reasonably Weighed the Risks and Benefits of the Proposed Use of Aldicarb.....	29
B.	Equitable Considerations Weigh Against Vacatur of the Conditional Registration Approval.....	34
III.	A Stay Is Not Warranted	39
	CONCLUSION	42
	CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE	44

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES***CASES**

<i>*Allied-Signal, Inc. v. U.S. Nuclear Regulat. Comm'n,</i> 988 F.2d 146 (D.C. Cir. 1993)	13, 18, 19, 39
<i>A.L. Pharma, Inc. v. Shalala,</i> 62 F.3d 1484 (D.C. Cir. 1995)	35, 36
<i>American Textile Manufacturers Institute, Inc. v. Donovan,</i> 452 U.S. 490 (1981).....	15
<i>B.J. Alan Co. v. ICC,</i> 897 F.2d 561 (D.C. Cir. 1990)	15, 16
<i>Baltimore Gas & Elec. Co. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.,</i> 462 U.S. 87 (1983)	15
<i>California Communities Against Toxics v. EPA,</i> 688 F.3d 989 (9th Cir. 2012).....	36
<i>Cascade Broadcasting Group Ltd. v. FCC,</i> 822 F.2d 1172 (D.C. Cir. 1987)	29
<i>*Center for Biological Diversity v. EPA,</i> 861 F.3d 174 (D.C. Cir. 2017)	2, 16, 20, 21, 23, 36, 37, 42
<i>Cottonwood Environmental Law Center v. U.S. Forest Serv.,</i> 789 F.3d 1075 (9th Cir. 2015).....	7
<i>Ethyl Corp. v. Browner,</i> 989 F.2d 522 (D.C. Cir. 1993)	13, 15, 16
<i>Fertilizer Inst. v. EPA,</i> 935 F.2d 1303 (D.C. Cir. 1991)	18, 34, 35

* Authorities upon which we chiefly rely are marked with asterisks.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.