

ORAL ARGUMENT NOT YET SCHEDULED

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

FARMWORKER ASSOCIATION OF
FLORIDA, et al.

Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES
ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION AGENCY,

Respondent.

No. 21-1079

**PROPOSED OPPOSITION OF MOVANT-INTERVENOR AGLOGIC TO
PETITIONERS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY VACATUR AND STAY**

Elbert Lin
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP
951 East Byrd Street, East Tower
Richmond, Virginia 23219
elin@HuntonAK.com
(804) 788-8200

Erica N. Peterson
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20037-1701
epeterson@huntonAK.com
(202) 955-1500

Counsel for AgLogic Chemical, LLC

**CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS,
AND RELATED CASES**

A. Parties and Amici

Except for the following, all parties, intervenors, and amici appearing in this court are listed in the Petitioners' Motion for Summary Vacatur; Motion for Stay Pending Expedited Review:

- 1) AgLogic Chemical, LLC has moved to intervene.

B. Rulings Under Review

References to the rulings at issue appear in Petitioners' motion.

C. Related Cases

There are no related cases within the meaning of Circuit Rule 28(a)(1)(C).

DATED: April 19, 2021

s/ Elbert Lin

Elbert Lin

Counsel for AgLogic Chemical, LLC

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iv
INTRODUCTION	1
BACKGROUND	2
I. Citrus Greening Disease and Aldicarb	2
II. History of Aldicarb	2
III. EPA’s Conditional Registration	3
IV. Florida Regulatory Approvals	5
ARGUMENT	6
I. Summary Vacatur is Not Warranted.	6
A. This case does not meet the high standards for summary vacatur.	6
B. In all events, the Allied-Signal analysis favors remand without vacatur.	8
1. As in Center for Biological Diversity, the Allied-Signal factors support remand without vacatur.	9
a) EPA can correct its ESA failure on remand.	9
b) The consequences of vacatur also support remand instead.	11
2. This Court could remand without vacatur.	13
II. Petitioners’ Request for a Stay Should Be Denied.	13
A. Petitioners’ request is premature.	14
B. Petitioners have not shown the need for a stay beginning on November 15.	16
1. Petitioners have not made a clear showing of likelihood of success on the merits.	16

..

a) Petitioners are unlikely to obtain vacatur based on EPA’s
ESA failure. 16

b) The conditional registration is lawful under FIFRA. 16

2. Petitioners will not suffer irreparable harm. 19

3. The public interest and balance of equities do not favor a
stay. 21

CONCLUSION..... 21

...

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>*Allied-Signal, Inc. v. U.S. Nuclear Regul. Comm’n</i> , 988 F.2d 146 (D.C. Cir. 1993).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Amoco Prod. Co. v. Vill. of Gambell</i> , 480 U.S. 531 (1987).....	22, 23
<i>Cascade Broad. Grp. Ltd. v. F.C.C.</i> , 822 F.2d 1172 (D.C. Cir. 1987).....	8
<i>Chaplaincy of Full Gospel Churches v. England</i> , 454 F.3d 290 (D.C. Cir. 2006).....	17, 21
<i>*Ctr. for Biological Diversity v. Env’t Prot. Agency</i> , 861 F.3d 174 (D.C. Cir. 2017).....	10
<i>Ctr. for Biological Diversity v. Env’t Prot. Agency</i> , No. 11-CV-00293-JCS, 2013 WL 1729573 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 22, 2013)	13
<i>Cuomo v. U.S. Nuclear Regul. Comm’n</i> , 772 F.2d 972 (D.C. Cir. 1985).....	16
<i>Davis v. Pension Ben. Guar. Corp.</i> , 571 F.3d 1288 (D.C. Cir. 2009).....	17
<i>Heartland Reg’l Med. Ctr. v. Sebelius</i> , 566 F.3d 193 (D.C. Cir. 2009).....	11
<i>League of Women Voters of U.S. v. Newby</i> , 838 F.3d 1 (D.C. Cir. 2016).....	22
<i>Mexichem Specialty Resins, Inc. v. E.P.A.</i> , 787 F.3d 544 (D.C. Cir. 2015).....	22

* Authorities on which we chiefly rely.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.