

No. 20-11179

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE FIFTH CIRCUIT

DATA MARKETING PARTNERSHIP, L.P., *et al.*,
PLAINTIFFS-APPELLEES,

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR, *et al.*,
DEFENDANTS-APPELLANTS.

ON APPEAL FROM A JUDGMENT OF THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT
COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS

**BRIEF OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA AND
THE STATES OF CALIFORNIA, COLORADO, CONNECTICUT,
DELAWARE, ILLINOIS, MAINE, MARYLAND, MASSACHUSETTS,
MICHIGAN, MINNESOTA, NEVADA, NEW JERSEY, NEW MEXICO,
NEW YORK, NORTH CAROLINA, PENNSYLVANIA, RHODE ISLAND,
VERMONT, VIRGINIA, WASHINGTON, AND WISCONSIN
AS AMICI CURIAE IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS-APPELLANTS**

KARL A. RACINE
Attorney General for the District of Columbia

LOREN L. ALIKHAN
Solicitor General

CAROLINE S. VAN ZILE
Principal Deputy Solicitor General

ASHWIN P. PHATAK
Deputy Solicitor General

HARRISON M. STARK
Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General
400 6th Street, NW, Suite 8100
Washington, D.C. 20001
(202) 724-6609
caroline.vanzile@dc.gov

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION AND STATEMENT OF INTEREST OF AMICI CURIAE	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	3
ARGUMENT	6
I. Questions Over ERISA’s Scope Are Foundationally Questions About State Versus Federal Authority	6
A. States have long regulated the business of insurance under their police power.....	7
B. Where applicable, ERISA preempts state regulation	11
II. All Three Branches Of The Federal Government Have Worked To Ensure That ERISA Preserves States’ Historic Police Power Over Insurance	13
III. The District Court’s Interpretation Trammels States’ Police Power By Expanding ERISA’s Scope And Aggrandizing Federal Authority	19
CONCLUSION	22

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Brown v. Hotel & Rest. Emps. & Bartenders Int’l Union Loc. 54</i> , 468 U.S. 491 (1984).....	14
<i>Cal. Div. of Lab. Standards Enf’t v. Dillingham Constr., N.A., Inc.</i> , 519 U.S. 316 (1997).....	17
<i>Cal. State Auto. Ass’n Inter-Ins. Bureau v. Maloney</i> , 341 U.S. 105 (1951).....	8
<i>Country-Wide Ins. Co. v. Harnett</i> , 426 F. Supp. 1030 (S.D.N.Y.), <i>aff’d</i> , 431 U.S. 934 (1977)	7
<i>De Buono v. NYSA-ILA Med. & Clinical Servs. Fund</i> , 520 U.S. 806 (1997).....	17
<i>Emps. of Dep’t of Pub. Health & Welfare v. Dep’t of Pub. Health & Welfare</i> , 411 U.S. 279 (1973).....	13
<i>FMC Corp. v. Holliday</i> , 498 U.S. 52 (1990)	15
<i>Massachusetts v. Morash</i> , 490 U.S. 107 (1989)	17
<i>MDPhysicians & Assocs., Inc. v. State Bd. of Ins.</i> , 957 F.2d 178 (5th Cir. 1992)	20
<i>Meredith v. Time Ins. Co.</i> , 980 F.2d 352 (5th Cir. 1993)	20
<i>N.Y. Life Ins. Co. v. Deer Lodge Cty.</i> , 231 U.S. 495 (1913).....	9
<i>N.Y. State Conf. of Blue Cross & Blue Shield Plans v. Travelers Ins. Co.</i> , 514 U.S. 645 (1995).....	3, 17, 18, 19
<i>Nationwide Mut. Ins. Co. v. Darden</i> , 503 U.S. 318 (1992)	19
<i>Noble State Bank v. Haskell</i> , 219 U.S. 104 (1911).....	8
<i>Paul v. Virginia</i> , 75 U.S. 168 (1868)	9
<i>Rush Prudential HMO, Inc. v. Moran</i> , 536 U.S. 355 (2002).....	16, 17

<i>Rutledge v. Pharm. Care Ass’n</i> , 141 S. Ct. 474 (2020)	17
<i>Schwartz v. Gordon</i> , 761 F.2d 864 (2d Cir. 1985)	11
<i>Sec. & Exch. Comm’n v. Variable Annuity Life Ins. Co. of Am.</i> , 359 U.S. 65 (1959).....	7
<i>United States v. Se. Underwriters Ass’n</i> , 322 U.S. 533 (1944)	9

Statutes and Regulations

1851 N.H. Laws 1072	8
29 C.F.R. § 2510.3-40.....	18
29 U.S.C. § 1001	11
29 U.S.C. § 1002	19
29 U.S.C. § 1003	12
29 U.S.C. § 1144.....	passim
Pub. L. No. 97-473, 96 Stat. 2605 (1983).....	16
Pub. L. No. 79-15, 59 Stat. 33 (1945).....	10

Executive and Legislative Materials

128 Cong. Rec. 30,356 (1982)	16
DOL Op. No. 2020-01A (Jan. 24, 2020)	20
S. Rep. No. 93-127 (1974), <i>as reprinted in</i> 1974 U.S.C.C.A.N. 4838.....	11
U.S. Dep’t of Labor, <i>MEWAs Multiple Employer Welfare Arrangements Under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA): A Guide to Federal and State Regulation</i> (Aug. 2013)	18

U.S. Gov't Accountability Off., GAO-04-312, <i>Private Health Insurance: Employers and Individuals are Vulnerable to Unauthorized or Bogus Entities Selling Coverage</i> (2004).....	13, 15
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------

Other Authorities

Christopher C. French, <i>Dual Regulation of Insurance</i> , 64 Vill. L. Rev. 25 (2019).....	8
Spencer L. Kimball & Barbara P. Heaney, <i>Federalism and Insurance Regulation: Basic Source Materials</i> (1995).....	8
Mila Kofman & Karen Pollitz, <i>Health Insurance Regulation by States and the Federal Government: A Review of Current Approaches and Proposals for Change</i> , J. of Ins. Reg., Summer 2006	10
Nat'l Ass'n of Ins. Comm'rs, <i>Health and Welfare Plans Under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act: Guidelines for State and Federal Regulation</i> (2019)	15, 16
Nat'l Ass'n of Ins. Comm'rs & Ctr. for Ins. Pol'y Rsch., <i>State Insurance Regulation</i> (2011)	9
Nat'l Conf. of State Legs., <i>Health Innovations State Law Database</i> (Jan. 31, 2021).....	10
Eric Nordman, <i>The Relevance of the McCarran-Ferguson Act</i> , CIPR Newsletter (Ctr. for Ins. Pol'y Rsch., Kansas City, Mo.), Aug. 2017	10
Christen Linke Young, USC-Brookings Schaeffer Initiative for Health Pol'y, <i>Taking A Broader View of "Junk Insurance"</i> (July 2020).....	10

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.