

Oral Argument Held on April 21, 2020

No. 19-70115

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

NATIONAL FAMILY FARM COALITION, *et al.*,

Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, *et al.*,

Respondents,

and

MONSANTO COMPANY,

Intervenor-Respondent.

ON PETITION FOR REVIEW FROM THE UNITED STATES
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

**PETITIONERS' EMERGENCY MOTION TO ENFORCE THIS
COURT'S VACATUR AND TO HOLD EPA IN CONTEMPT
RELIEF REQUESTED BY EARLIEST POSSIBLE DATE**

CENTER FOR FOOD SAFETY
George A. Kimbrell
Sylvia Shih-Yau Wu
Amy van Saun
2009 NE Alberta St., Suite 207
Portland, OR 97211
T: (971) 271-7372
gkimbrell@centerforfoodsafety.org
swu@centerforfoodsafety.org
avansaun@centerforfoodsafety.org

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL
DIVERSITY
Stephanie M. Parent
PO Box 11374
Portland, OR 97211
T: (971) 717-6404
sparent@biologicaldiversity.org

Counsel for Petitioners

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
I. THE COURT HAS AUTHORITY TO ENFORCE ITS VACATUR.	3
II. THE COURT SHOULD ENFORCE ITS REMEDY.	7
A. EPA’s Administrative Order Flouts the Court’s Decision.	7
B. EPA Lacks Authority to Issue a “Cancellation” Order Reviving the Use Just Vacated by the Court.	12
C. The Entire Underlying Rationale for EPA’s Action Is False, Based on a Misinterpretation of This Court’s Decision.	15
III. THE COURT SHOULD HOLD EPA AND ADMINISTRATOR WHEELER IN CONTEMPT.	20
IV. TO PROTECT ENDANGERED SPECIES, THE COURT SHOULD REACH PETITIONERS’ ESA CLAIMS.	23
CONCLUSION	26

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Federal Cases	
<i>Aerojet-General Corp. v. The American Arbitration Assoc.</i> , 478 F.2d 248 (9th Cir.1973).....	4
<i>Cottonwood Envtl. Law Ctr. v. U.S. Forest Serv.</i> , 789 F.3d 1075 (9th Cir. 2015).....	24
<i>Dilley v. Alexander</i> , 627 F.2d 407 (D.C. Cir. 1980).....	4
<i>Donovan v. Mazzola</i> , 716 F.2d 1226 (9th Cir. 1983).....	21
<i>EEOC v. Commercial Office Prods.</i> , 486 U.S. 107 (1988).....	17
<i>Kokkonen v. Guardian Life Ins. Co.</i> , 511 U.S. 375 (1994).....	3
<i>Nat’l Family Farm Coal. v. EPA</i> , --- F.3d ---, 2020 WL 2901136 (9th Cir. June 3, 2020).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Nat’l Wildlife Fed’n v. Burford</i> , 835 F.2d 305 (D.C. Cir. 1987).....	24, 25
<i>Or. Natural Desert Ass’n v. Tidwell</i> , No. 07-1871-HA, 2010 WL 5464269 (D. Or. Dec. 30, 2010).....	25
<i>Pollinator Stewardship Council v. EPA</i> , 806 F.3d 520 (9th Cir. 2015).....	19
<i>Reno Air Racing Ass’n, Inc. v. McCord</i> , 452 F.3d 1126 (9th Cir. 2006).....	22
<i>Stone v. City & Cnty. of San Francisco</i> , 968 F.2d 850 (9th Cir. 1992).....	21

Federal Cases (Cont'd)	Page(s)
<i>U.S. v. Bright</i> , 596 F.3d 683 (9th Cir. 2010).....	20
<i>United States v. Goodner Bros. Aircraft</i> , 966 F.2d 380 (8th Cir. 1992).....	14
<i>Wolfard Glassblowing Co. v. Vanbragt</i> , 118 F.3d 1320 (9th Cir.1997).....	21, 22
<i>Zipfel v. Halliburton Co.</i> , 861 F.2d 565 (9th Cir. 1988).....	4
 Federal Statutes	
7 U.S.C. § 136(ee).....	20
7 U.S.C. § 136a(a)	16
7 U.S.C. § 136d(a)(1).....	14, 16
7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(F).....	20
7 U.S.C. § 136k(a)	17
7 U.S.C. § 136n	13
 Rules	
FRAP 41	9
Circuit Rule 27-3.....	1
 Regulations	
40 C.F.R. pt. 164	13
 Other Authorities	
56 Fed. Reg. at 29,362 (June 26, 1981).....	14

EPA, Press Release (June 5, 2020),
<https://www.epa.gov/newsreleases/epa-responds-ninth-circuit-vacatur-dicamba-registrations> 1

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.