

**Docket No. 20-15742**

---

*In the*  
**United States Court of Appeals**  
*For the*  
**Ninth Circuit**

---

In re: COCA-COLA PRODUCTS MARKETING  
AND SALES PRACTICES LITIGATION (NO. II):

GEORGE ENGURASOFF, et al.,

*Plaintiffs-Appellees,*

v.

COCA-COLA REFRESHMENTS USA, INC., et al.,

*Defendants-Appellees.*

---

*Appeal from a Decision of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California,  
No. 4:14-md-02555-JSW · Honorable Jeffrey S. White*

---

**BRIEF OF APPELLEES**

---

JOHN W. (“DON”) BARRETT, ESQ.  
RICHARD BARRETT, ESQ.  
BARRETT LAW GROUP, P.A.  
Post Office Box 927  
Lexington, Mississippi 39095  
(662) 834-2488 Telephone  
(662) 834-2628 Facsimile

KEITH M. FLEISCHMAN, ESQ.  
JOSHUA D. GLATTER, ESQ.  
FLEISCHMAN BONNER & ROCCO LLP  
81 Main Street, Suite 515  
White Plains, New York 10601  
(914) 278-5100 Telephone  
(917) 591-5245 Facsimile

*Attorneys for Appellees Rachel Dube, George Engurasoff, Yocheved Lazaroff,  
Michelle Marino, Paul Merritt, Joshua Ogden, Ronald Sowizrol and Thomas Woods*

*Additional Counsel Listed Inside Cover*

---



COUNSEL PRESS · (213) 680-2300

PRINTED ON RECYCLED PAPER



BEN F. PIERCE GORE, ESQ.  
PRATT & ASSOCIATES  
1871 The Alameda, Suite 425  
San Jose, California 95126  
(408) 429-6506 Telephone

DAVID SHELTON, ESQ.  
SHELTON DAVIS  
1223 Jackson Avenue East, Suite 202  
Oxford, Mississippi 38655  
(662) 281-1212 Telephone  
(662) 281-1312 Facsimile

*Attorneys for Appellees Rachel Dube, George Engurasoff, Yocheved Lazaroff,  
Michelle Marino, Paul Merritt, Joshua Ogden, Ronald Sowizrol and Thomas Woods*

**CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

Pursuant to Rule 26.1(a) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure, Appellees-Plaintiffs hereby state that no Plaintiff in this matter is a corporate entity that requires disclosure under Rule 26.1(a) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure.

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT .....i

TABLE OF CONTENTS..... ii

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ..... ..

INTRODUCTION ..... 1

COUNTERSTATEMENT OF ISSUES PRESENTED.....4

STANDARD OF REVIEW .....5

COUNTERSTATEMENT OF FACTS .....6

SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT .....14

ARGUMENTS.....15

    I.    PLAINTIFFS HAVE STANDING TO OBTAIN INJUNCTIVE  
          RELIEF ON THE CLASS’S BEHALF .....15

        A.    The District Court Correctly Interpreted *Davidson* .....15

        B.    Post-*Davidson* Jurisprudence Confirms That The District  
              Judge Correctly Analyzed and Applied *Davidson* in  
              Determining Article III Standing .....21

        C.    Defendants’ Cited Authorities Are Inapposite .....28

        D.    The District Judge’s Holding that Plaintiffs Had Not  
              Demonstrated That Phosphoric Acid Would Likely Be  
              Removed From Coke Was Not Material to His Class  
              Certification Decision .....31

        E.    Plaintiffs Seek to Vindicate More Than Merely Abstract  
              Procedural or Regulatory Violations .....33

        F.    Plaintiffs Adequately Established The Likelihood of  
              Future Purchases or Consumption of Coke .....36

II. THE DISTRICT COURT PROPERLY EXERCISED ITS DISCRETION IN FINDING COMMONALITY .....	38
CONCLUSION .....	45
Form 8. Certificate of Compliance for Briefs	
Form 17. Statement of Related Cases Pursuant to Circuit Rule 28-2.6	
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.