

No. 20-16408

---

---

IN THE  
**United States Court of Appeals**  
**for the Ninth Circuit**

---

NSO GROUP TECHNOLOGIES LTD. ET AL.,

*Defendants-Appellants,*

v.

WHATSAPP INC. ET AL.,

*Plaintiffs-Appellees.*

---

On Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Northern District of California,  
No. 4:19-cv-07123-PJH

---

**APPELLANTS' PETITION FOR REHEARING OR  
REHEARING EN BANC**

---

Jeffrey S. Bucholtz  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
1700 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
2nd Floor  
Washington, DC 20006  
jbucholtz@kslaw.com

Joseph N. Akrotirianakis  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
633 W. 5th Street  
Suite 1600  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
jakro@kslaw.com

Matthew V.H. Noller  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
621 Capitol Mall, Suite 1500  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
mnoller@kslaw.com

*Counsel for Appellants*  
*NSO Group Tech. Ltd. et al.*

Dated: November 22, 2021

---

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Table of Authorities .....   | ii |
| Introduction and Rule 35 Statement .....   | 1  |
| Statement of the Case .....  | 3  |
| Argument .....   | 8  |
| I. This Case Presents an Issue of Exceptional Importance That<br>Has Divided the Courts of Appeals ..... | 8  |
| II. The Panel’s Decision Conflicts with the Supreme Court’s<br>Decision in <i>Samantar</i> .....         | 14 |
| Conclusion.....  | 17 |
| Certificate of Compliance .....  | i  |
| Certificate of Service .....   | ii |

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

|   | Page(s)       |
|---|---------------|
| <b>Cases</b>  |               |
| <i>Alicog v. Kingdom of Saudi Arabia</i> ,<br>79 F.3d 1145 (5th Cir. 1996).....                       | 8             |
| <i>Alicog v. Kingdom of Saudi Arabia</i> ,<br>860 F. Supp. 379 (S.D. Tex. 1994).....                  | 8             |
| <i>Belhas v. Ya’alon</i> ,<br>515 F.3d 1279 (D.C. Cir. 2008).....                                     | 10            |
| <i>Broidy Cap. Mgmt. LLC v. Muzin</i> ,<br>12 F.4th 789 (D.C. Cir. 2021) .....                        | 13            |
| <i>Butters v. Vance Int’l, Inc.</i> ,<br>225 F.3d 462 (4th Cir. 2000).....                            | 8, 10, 12, 13 |
| <i>Ivey ex rel. Carolina Golf Dev. Co. v. Lynch</i> ,<br>2018 WL 3764264 (M.D.N.C. Aug. 8, 2018)..... | 9, 13         |
| <i>Chuidian v. Philippine Nat’l Bank</i> ,<br>912 F.2d 1095 (9th Cir. 1990).....                      | 8             |
| <i>Doğan v. Barak</i> ,<br>932 F.3d 888 (9th Cir. 2019).....  | 8             |
| <i>In re Estate of Ferdinand Marcos</i> ,<br>25 F.3d 1467 (9th Cir. 1994).....                        | 8             |
| <i>Haig v. Agee</i> ,<br>453 U.S. 280 (1981).....   | 11            |
| <i>Matar v. Dichter</i> ,<br>563 F.3d 9 (2d Cir. 2009) .....  | 8             |
| <i>Mireskandari v. Mayne</i> ,<br>800 F. App’x 519 (9th Cir. 2020) .....                              | 8             |

|   |               |
|---|---------------|
| <i>Moriah v. Bank of China</i> ,<br>107 F. Supp. 3d 272 (S.D.N.Y. 2015).....  | 9, 13         |
| <i>Rep. of Austria v. Altmann</i> ,<br>541 U.S. 677 (2004) .....  | 9             |
| <i>Samantar v. Yousuf</i> ,<br>560 U.S. 305 (2010) .....  | 3, 14, 15, 16 |
| <i>Siderman de Blake v. Rep. of Argentina</i> ,<br>965 F.2d 699 (9th Cir. 1992).....  | 9             |
| <i>Underhill v. Hernandez</i> ,<br>168 U.S. 250 (1897) .....  | 8             |
| <i>Yousuf v. Samantar</i> ,<br>699 F.3d 763 (4th Cir. 2012).....  | 13            |
| <b>Statutes and Rules</b>   |               |
| 28 U.S.C. § 1603(a)–(b).....  | 14            |
| Cir. R. 35-1 .....  | 14            |
| Fed. R. App. P. 35(a)(2) .....  | 3             |
| Fed. R. App. P. 35(b)(1)(A) .....   | 3, 16         |
| Fed. R. Civ. P. 35(b)(1)(B) .....   | 14            |
| <b>Other Authorities</b>  |               |
| Brief for the United States as Amicus Curiae, <i>CACI Premier<br/>Tech., Inc. v. Shimari</i> , No. 19-648 (U.S. Aug. 26, 2020).....       | 11            |
| Brief for the United States as Amicus Curiae, <i>Mutond v.<br/>Lewis</i> , No. 19-185 (U.S. May 26, 2020) .....                           | 10            |
| Dan Sabbagh, <i>Call for Backdoor Access to WhatsApp as Five<br/>Eyes Nations Meet</i> , The Guardian (July 30, 2019, 3:32<br>p.m.) ..... | 5             |

|   |        |
|---|--------|
| Dipesh Gadher, <i>London Bridge Terror Attack Planned on WhatsApp</i> , Sunday Times (May 12, 2019, 12:01 a.m.).....  | 5      |
| Glenn J. Voelz, <i>Contractors and Intelligence: The Private Sector in the Intelligence Community</i> , 22 Int'l J. Intelligence & CounterIntelligence 586, 588–91 (2009).....          | 10, 11 |
| Gordon Rayner, <i>WhatsApp Accused of Giving Terrorists “A Secret Place to Hide” as It Refuses to Hand Over London Attacker’s Messages</i> , Telegraph (Mar. 27, 2017, 1:54 p.m.) ..... | 5      |
| Hazel Fox & Philippa Webb, <i>The Law of State Immunity</i> (3d ed. 2013) .....   | 13     |
| Hazel Fox, <i>The Law of State Immunity</i> (2d ed. 2008).....  | 9      |
| Lisa L. Turner & Lynn G. Norton, <i>Civilians at the Tip of the Spear</i> , 51 A.F. L. Rev. 1, 8 (2001).....  | 11     |
| National Intelligence, <i>The U.S. Intelligence Community’s Five Year Strategic Human Capital Plan</i> (June 2006) .....  | 10     |
| Ryan Sabey, <i>Tool of Terror: Social Media Giants Will Be Made to Hand over Encrypted WhatsApp Messages in Fight Against Terrorism</i> , The Sun (Sept. 29, 2019, 7:45 a.m.) .....     | 6      |
| Statement of Interest of the United States of America, <i>Matar v. Dichter</i> , No. 05-cv-10270 (S.D.N.Y. Nov. 17, 2006) .....   | 8      |
| Ved P. Nanda et al., 1 <i>Litigation of International Disputes in U.S.</i> (Dec. 2020 update) .....   | 13     |

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.