

No. 20-16758

---

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

---

XAVIER BECERRA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY  
GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,

Defendants-Appellants,

v.

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF WHEAT GROWERS, ET AL.,

Plaintiffs-Appellees.

---

On Appeal from the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of  
California, No. 2:17-cv-02401-WBS-EFB (Hon. William B. Shubb)

---

AMICUS BRIEF OF NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL,  
UNITED STEELWORKERS, ALLIANCE OF NURSES FOR HEALTHY  
ENVIRONMENTS, AS YOU SOW, CALIFORNIANS FOR PESTICIDE REFORM,  
CENTER FOR FOOD SAFETY, CLEAN WATER ACTION, ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
FOUNDATION, PESTICIDE ACTION NETWORK NORTH AMERICA, AND  
SAN FRANCISCO BAY PHYSICIANS FOR SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY  
URGING REVERSAL IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS-APPELLANTS

VIVIAN H.W. WANG  
AVINASH KAR (SBN 240190)  
Natural Resources Defense Council  
40 W. 20th St.  
New York, NY 10011  
(212) 727-4477  
[vwang@nrdc.org](mailto:vwang@nrdc.org)  
[akar@nrdc.org](mailto:akar@nrdc.org)

*Counsel for Amici*

## CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Amici Natural Resources Defense Council, United Steelworkers, Alliance of Nurses for Healthy Environments, As You Sow, Californians for Pesticide Reform, Center for Food Safety, Clean Water Action, Environmental Law Foundation, Pesticide Action Network North America, and San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility are nonprofit corporations with no parent corporation and no outstanding stock shares or other securities in the hands of the public. Amici do not have any parent, subsidiary, or affiliate that has issued stock shares or other securities to the public. No publicly held corporation owns any stock in amici.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION .....	1
AMICI CURIAE'S IDENTITY AND INTEREST IN THE CASE .....	3
BACKGROUND.....	7
A. Regulation in the context of evolving scientific knowledge.....	7
B. Proposition 65 and glyphosate.....	10
C. District court proceedings .....	15
ARGUMENT.....	18
I. Courts should be wary of constitutionalizing questions at the core of agencies' scientific expertise, or deciding such questions unnecessarily .....	18
A. Scientific knowledge is constantly evolving and thus subject to "controversy" .....	19
B. Judicial review of the soundness of an agency's scientific judgment does not fit well within a First Amendment framework .....	21
II. A First Amendment "controversy" standard creates perverse incentives to manufacture scientific doubt .....	27
III. The district court erred in discounting IARC's conclusion as an outlier opinion .....	30
A. Understanding risk assessment.....	31
B. EPA's findings on glyphosate do not conflict with IARC's .....	32
CONCLUSION .....	38

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### CASES

<i>Amoco Oil Co. v. EPA</i> , 501 F.2d 722 (D.C. Cir. 1974) .....	23
<i>ASARCO, Inc. v. Occupational Safety &amp; Health Admin.</i> , 746 F.2d 483 (9th Cir. 1984) .....	8
<i>Banzhaf v. FCC</i> , 405 F.2d 1082 (D.C. Cir. 1968) .....	8
<i>Cal. Chamber of Commerce v. Brown</i> , 126 Cal. Rptr. 3d. 214 (Ct. App. 2011) .....	11, 19
<i>Central Hudson Gas &amp; Electric Corp. v. Public Service Commission</i> , 447 U.S. 557 (1980) .....	17
<i>CTIA-The Wireless Ass’n v. City of Berkeley</i> , 928 F.3d 832 (9th Cir. 2019) .....	16
<i>Ethyl Corp. v. EPA</i> , 541 F.2d 1 (D.C. Cir. 1976) .....	7
<i>Grocery Mfrs. Ass’n v. Sorrell</i> , 102 F. Supp. 3d 583 (D. Vt. 2015).....	9
<i>In re Prempro Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 586 F.3d 547 (8th Cir. 2009) .....	27
<i>In re: Roundup Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , No. 16-md-02741-VC (N.D. Cal. filed Mar. 14, 2017) .....	29
<i>Lead Indus. Ass’n v. EPA</i> , 647 F.2d 1130 (D.C. Cir. 1980) .....	19

<i>League of Wilderness Defs. Blue Mountains Biodiversity Project v. Allen</i> , 615 F.3d 1122 (9th Cir. 2010) .....	23
<i>Medtronic, Inc. v. Lohr</i> , 518 U.S. 470 (1996) .....	10
<i>Motor Vehicle Mfrs. Ass’n of U.S. v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.</i> , 463 U.S. 29 (1983) .....	22
<i>N. Am. Bldg. Trades Unions v. OSHA</i> , 878 F.3d 271 (D.C. Cir. 2017) (per curiam) .....	20, 22
<i>Nat’l Elec. Mfrs. Ass’n v. Sorrell</i> , 272 F.3d 104 (2d Cir. 2001) .....	22
<i>Nat’l Inst. of Family &amp; Life Advocates v. Becerra</i> , 138 S. Ct. 2361 (2018) .....	16
<i>NRDC v. EPA</i> , No. 20-70787 (9th Cir. filed Mar. 20, 2020) .....	34
<i>NRDC v. Pritzker</i> , 828 F.3d 1125 (9th Cir. 2016) .....	8
<i>N.Y. State Rest. Ass’n v. N.Y.C. Bd. of Health</i> , 556 F.3d 114 (2d Cir. 2009) .....	9
<i>People ex rel. Lungren v. Superior Court</i> , 926 P.2d 1042 (Cal. 1996) .....	4
<i>Pharm. Care Mgmt. Ass’n v. Rowe</i> , 429 F.3d 294 (1st Cir. 2005) .....	26
<i>Pub. Citizen Health Rsch. Grp. v. Tyson</i> , 796 F.2d 1479 (D.C. Cir. 1986) .....	23

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.