

NO. 20-16758

---

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

---

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF WHEAT GROWERS, et al.,  
Plaintiffs/Appellees,

v.

XAVIER BECERRA, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CALIFORNIA, et al.,  
Defendants/Appellants.

---

On Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Eastern District of California  
No. 2:17-cv-02401-WBS-EFB  
Hon. William B. Shubb

---

**BRIEF OF *AMICUS CURIAE*  
UC BERKELEY CENTER FOR  
CONSUMER LAW & ECONOMIC JUSTICE  
IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS-APPELLEES**

---

SETH E. MERMIN  
(Cal Bar No. 189194)  
ELIZA DUGGAN  
(Cal Bar No. 312621)  
CENTER FOR CONSUMER LAW  
AND ECONOMIC JUSTICE  
UC Berkeley School of Law  
225 Bancroft Way  
Berkeley, CA 94720-7200  
Telephone: (510) 393-8254  
[tmermin@law.berkeley.edu](mailto:tmermin@law.berkeley.edu)  
*Counsel for Amici Curiae*

CLAUDIA POLSKY  
(Cal. Bar No. 185505)  
Assistant Clinical Professor of Law  
UC Berkeley School of Law  
225 Bancroft Way  
Berkeley, CA 94720-7200  
Telephone: (510) 642-5398  
[cpolsky@law.berkeley.edu](mailto:cpolsky@law.berkeley.edu)

## **CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

No party to this filing has a for-profit parent corporation, and no publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of the stock of any party to this filing.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTEREST OF <i>AMICUS CURIAE</i> .....	1
INTRODUCTION .....	2
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT .....	7
ARGUMENT.....	9
I. The Glyphosate Disclosure Promotes The Key First Amendment Value Underlying Protection for Commercial Speech: The Free Flow Of Factual Information To Consumers. ....	10
II. The Glyphosate Warning Readily Meets the Lenient Standard That Applies to Compelled Disclosures of Factual and Uncontroversial Commercial Information. ....	11
A. Because the Disclosure Provides Factual and Noncontroversial Information, It Is Subject to Review Under the <i>Zauderer</i> Standard.....	12
1. The warning comprises statements that are wholly factual. ....	13
2. Scientific organizations may come to different conclusions, but that does not mean their statements are not factual — “uncontroversial” need not mean “unanimous.” .....	16
3. Manufacturers of toxic substances, including Monsanto, have a demonstrated history of attempting to create scientific confusion once their products have been identified as hazardous. ....	21
4. There is mounting evidence of Monsanto’s attempts to conceal the dangers of exposure to glyphosate and to generate the “controversy” on which it now relies. ....	24
B. The Disclosure Is Reasonably Related to the Government’s Substantial Interest in Protecting Public Health and Informing Purchasers About the Risks of Glyphosate Exposure. ....	27

..

C. The Proposed Glyphosate Disclosure Is Neither Unjustified Nor Unduly Burdensome. ....	27
CONCLUSION .....	31
CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE.....	32
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE.....	33

...

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### Cases

<i>44 Liquormart, Inc. v. Rhode Island</i> , 517 U.S. 484 (1996) .....	10
<i>American Beverage Association v. San Francisco</i> , 916 F.3d 749 (9th Cir. 2019) .....	13, 32
<i>CTIA - The Wireless Ass’n v. City of Berkeley, California</i> , 928 F.3d 832 (9th Cir.), cert. denied (2019) (CTIA II) .....	passim
<i>Disc. Tobacco City &amp; Lottery, Inc. v. United States</i> , 674 F.3d 509 (6th Cir. 2012) .....	30
<i>First Nat’l Bank v. Bellotti</i> , 435 U.S. 765 (1978) .....	10
<i>Ibanez v. Fla. Dep’t of Bus. &amp; Prof’l Regulation</i> , 512 U.S. 136 (1994) .....	31
<i>In re Roundup Prod. Liab. Litgation</i> , No. 16-CV-0525-VC, 2019 WL 3219360, (N.D. Cal., July 12, 2019) .....	27, 28
<i>In re Roundup Products Liability Litigation</i> , MDL No. 2741, No. 3:19-cv-02224 (N.D. Cal., Feb. 3, 2021) .....	passim
<i>Johnson v. Monsanto Co.</i> , 52 Cal. App. 5th 434 (2020) .....	4, 27, 29
<i>Milavetz, Gallup &amp; Milavetz v. U.S.</i> , 559 U.S. 229 (2010) .....	11
<i>Monsanto Co. v. Office of Env’tl. Health Hazard Assessment</i> , 22 Cal. App. 5th 534, 556 (2018) .....	22
<i>N.Y. State Rest. Ass’n v. N.Y.C. Bd. of Health</i> , 556 F.3d 114 (2d Cir. 2009) .....	30

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.