

No. 20-55631

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

NATIONAL PORK PRODUCERS COUNCIL, ET AL.,

Plaintiffs-Appellant,

v.

KAREN ROSS, ET AL.,

Defendant-Appellee,

THE HUMANE SOCIETY OF THE UNITED STATES, ET AL.,

Intervenor-Defendants-Appellees.

On Appeal from the United States District Court
For the Southern District of California,
No. 3:19-cv-02324-W-AHG (Hon. Thomas J. Whelan)

**BRIEF OF HEALTH CARE WITHOUT HARM, THE NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR
OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH, THE CONSUMER FEDERATION OF
AMERICA, AND FOOD & WATER WATCH AS *AMICI CURIAE* IN SUPPORT OF
APPELLEES**

Ian E. Roberts

SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP
2828 North Harwood St., 18th Fl.
Dallas, TX 75201
Telephone: 1.214.271.5777
Facsimile: 1.214.271.5788
ian.roberts@shearman.com

L. Kieran Kieckhefer

SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP
535 Mission St., 25th Fl.
San Francisco, CA 94105
Telephone: 1.415.616.1100
Facsimile: 1.415.616.1301
kieran.kieckhefer@shearman.com

Matthew G. Berkowitz

Yue (Joy) Wang
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP
1460 El Camino Real, 2nd Fl.
Menlo Park, CA 94025
Telephone: 650.838.3600
Facsimile: 650.838.3699
matt.berkowitz@shearman.com
joy.wang@shearman.com

*Attorneys for Health Care Without Harm, National Council for
Occupational Safety and Health, Consumer Federation of
America, and Food & Water Watch*

CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 26.1, *amicus curiae* Health Care Without Harm states that it is not publicly traded, has no parent company, and no publicly traded company owns 10% or more of its stock.

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 26.1, *amicus curiae* National Council for Occupational Safety and Health states that it is not publicly traded, has no parent company, and no publicly traded company owns 10% or more of its stock.

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 26.1, *amicus curiae* Consumer Federation of America states that it is not publicly traded, has no parent company, and no publicly traded company owns 10% or more of its stock.

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 26.1, *amicus curiae* Food & Water Watch states that it is not publicly traded, has no parent company, and no publicly traded company owns 10% or more of its stock.

Dated: December 7, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP

By: /s/ Matthew G. Berkowitz
Matthew G. Berkowitz

Attorney for Health Care Without Harm, National Council for Occupational Safety and Health, Consumer Federation of America, and Food & Water Watch

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Statement of Compliance with Rule 29	1
Interests of <i>Amici Curiae</i>	1
I. Health Care Without Harm	1
II. National Council for Occupational Safety and Health.....	2
III. Consumer Federation of America	2
IV. Food & Water Watch	4
Introduction	5
Argument.....	7
I. California Is Entitled to Promulgate Non-Discriminatory Standards Affecting Public Health and Safety, as Well as Animal Cruelty, Without Being Second Guessed by Courts on the Efficacy of those Standards in Achieving the Stated Goals.....	7
II. Industrial Pork Production, A Documented Source of Infectious Disease, Poses a Profound Danger to Public Health.....	10
III. Proposition 12 Addresses Legitimate Animal Cruelty Concerns.	16
IV. The Court Should Not Limit States’ Exercise of Police Powers to Protect The Health and Safety of Their Own Citizens.	21
V. Appellants Complain Only of the Effects of Proposition 12 On Their Own Business, Not On the Pork Market.	28
VI. Conclusion.....	28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases	Page(s)
<i>Ass'n des Eleveurs de Canards et d'Oies du Quebec v. Harris</i> , 729 F.3d 937 (9th Cir. 2013)	6, 8, 9
<i>C & A Carbone, Inc. v. Clarkstown</i> , 511 U.S. 383 (1994).....	7
<i>Huron Portland Cement Co. v. Detroit</i> , 362 U.S. 440 (1960).....	8
<i>McKiver v. Murphy-Brown</i> , LLC, No. 19-1019, ---F.3d---, 2020 WL 6787917 (4th Cir. Nov. 19, 2020) (Wilkinson, J., concurring).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>New State Ice Co. v. Liebmann</i> , 285 U.S. 262 (1932) (Brandeis, J. dissenting).....	21, 22
<i>Pac. Nw. Venison Producers v. Smitch</i> , 20 F.3d 1008 (9th Cir. 1994)	6, 9
<i>U.S. v. Lopez</i> , 514 U.S. 549 (1995).....	22
Statutes	
Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25982.....	5
Other Authorities	
<i>About Antibiotic Resistance</i> , Ctrs. For Disease Control & Prevention, https://www.cdc.gov/drugresistance/about.html (last accessed Dec. 2, 2020)	14
Almond Leaf Scorch, UC IPM (Aug. 2017), https://www2.ipm.ucanr.edu/agriculture/almond/Almond-Leaf-Scorch/	27
Am. Hist. Documents 1000-1904, 43 Harv. Classics 66, 79 (C. Eliot ed. 1910)	8

Animal Feeding Operations, U.S. Dep’t Agric.,
[https://www.nrcs.usda.gov/wps/portal/nrcs/main/national/plantsani
mals/livestock/afo/](https://www.nrcs.usda.gov/wps/portal/nrcs/main/national/plantsani

mals/livestock/afo/) (last accessed Dec. 4, 2020)11

Antimicrobial resistance, World Health Org. (Jul. 27, 2017),
[https://www.who.int/news-room/q-a-detail/antimicrobial-
resistance](https://www.who.int/news-room/q-a-detail/antimicrobial-

resistance)14

Dana Cole, Lori Todd, & Steve Wing, *Concentrated Swine Feeding
Operations and Public Health: A Review of Occupational and
Community Health Effects*, 108 *Envtl. Health Perspectives* 685
(2000) available at [https://www.ncbi.nlm.
nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1638284/](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1638284/).....*passim*

Doris Lin, *Learn Why Some Activists Are Avidly Against Eating Veal*,
ThoughtCo. (July 18, 2019), [https://www.thoughtco.com/whats-
wrong-with-veal-127519](https://www.thoughtco.com/whats-

wrong-with-veal-127519)20

Dylan Mathews, *America’s largest pork producer pledged to make its
meat more humane. An investigation says it didn’t.*, Vox (May 8,
2018, 12:30PM ET), <https://tinyurl.com/y5j2hmd3>16

Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 29(a)(2).....1

Food & Water Watch, *Antibiotic Resistance 101* (Mar. 6, 2015)
available at [https://www.foodandwaterwatch.org/
insight/antibiotic-resistance-101](https://www.foodandwaterwatch.org/

insight/antibiotic-resistance-101)13, 14, 15

Food & Water Watch, *Factory Farm Nation: 2020 Edition* (April
2020) available at [https://www.foodandwater watch.org/
insight/factory-farm-nation-2020-edition](https://www.foodandwaterwatch.org/

insight/factory-farm-nation-2020-edition)11, 28

H1N1 Flu, Ctrs. For Disease Control & Prevention (Nov. 25, 2009),
https://www.cdc.gov/h1n1flu/information_h1n1_virus_qa.htm12

Harvard Animal L. & Pol’y Program, *Legislative Analysis of H.R.
4879: the “Protect Interstate Commerce Act of 2018”* at 37-38
(2018) available at [http://hlsalpp.wpengine.com/what-we-do/
projects/king-amendment/](http://hlsalpp.wpengine.com/what-we-do/

projects/king-amendment/)24, 25, 26, 27

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.