

**Case No. 20-55930**

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

---

R.J. REYNOLDS TOBACCO COMPANY; AMERICAN  
SNUFF COMPANY; AND SANTA FE NATURAL TOBACCO  
COMPANY,

Appellants,

v.

COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES; COUNTY OF LOS  
ANGELES BOARD OF SUPERVISORS; AND HILDA L. SOLIS,  
MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS, SHEILA KUEHL, JANICE HAHN,  
AND KATHRYN BARGER, EACH IN HIS OR HER OFFICIAL  
CAPACITY AS A MEMBER OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS,

Appellees.

---

On Appeal from the United States District Court for the Central  
District of California No. 2:20-cv-4880 (Hon. Dale S. Fischer)

---

**BRIEF OF PUBLIC HEALTH AND MEDICAL  
ORGANIZATIONS AS *AMICI CURIAE* IN SUPPORT OF  
APPELLEES**

---

BYRON RAPHAEL LLP

Jordan Raphael

1055 West 7th Street, Suite 3300, Los Angeles, California 90067

Tel: (213) 291-9800

Fax: (213) 377-5771

Of counsel:

CAMPAIGN FOR TOBACCO-FREE KIDS

Dennis A. Henigan

1400 I St. NW, Suite 1200, Washington, DC, 20005

Tel: (202) 481-9366

Fax: (202) 296-5427

Attorneys for *Amici Curiae* Public Health and Medical  
Organizations

---

## DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

*Amici curiae* are all non-profit organizations committed to advancing the public health. No party to this filing has a parent corporation, and no publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of the stock of any of the parties to this filing.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT .....	ii
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	iv
STATEMENT OF INTEREST OF <i>AMICI CURIAE</i> .....	1
INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT .....	3
ARGUMENT .....	7
I.    The County’s Tobacco Flavors Ordinance Affords County Residents Greater Protection Against the Public Health Harms of Menthol Cigarettes.....	7
A.    Menthol Cigarettes Increase Youth Initiation of Smoking.....	8
B.    Menthol Cigarettes Increase Addiction and Reduce Cessation.....	12
C.    Menthol Cigarettes Have Led to Significant Health Disparities for African Americans. ....	14
II.   The Flavors Ordinance Provides the Residents of LA County Greater Protection against the Health Harms of Continued Sale of Flavored E-Cigarettes.	19
III.  The Flavors Ordinance Provides LA County Residents Greater Protection Against the Health Harms of Flavored Cigars. ....	24
IV.  Appellants’ Account of FDA Activity on Flavored Tobacco Products is Misleading and Should Have No Impact on the Preemption Issue. ....	28
CONCLUSION .....	32

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### Cases

<i>Altria Group, Inc. v. Good</i> , 555 U.S. 70 (2008) .....	31
<i>Am. Acad. Of Pediatric v. FDA</i> , 379 F.Supp. 3d 461, 494 (D.Md. 2019), <i>appeal dismissed as moot, In re Cigar Ass’n of Am.</i> , 812 F. App’x 128 (4 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 2020) .....	31
<i>Nat’l Ass’n of Tobacco Outlets, Inc. v. City of Providence, R.I.</i> , 731 F.3d 71 (1st Cir. 2013) .....	5
<i>Nicopure Labs LLC v. FDA</i> , 944 F.3d 266 (D.C. Cir. 2019) .....	23
<i>R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Co. v. Cnty. of Los Angeles</i> , 471 F.Supp.3d 1010 (C.D. Cal. 2020) .....	5
<i>U.S. Smokeless Tobacco Mfg. Co. LLC v. City of New York</i> , 708 F.3d 428 (2d. Cir. 2013).....	5, 6

### Statutes

15 U.S.C. § 1332(1)(a).....	25
Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act, Pub. L. No. 111-31, 123 Stat. 1776 (2009).....	3
LOS ANGELES COUNTY CODE TITLE 11 .....	19

### Regulations

21 C.F.R. § 1143.1 .....	25
Deeming Tobacco Products to be Subject to the Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act, as Amended by the Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act, 79 Fed. Reg. 23,141 (Apr. 25, 2014) (proposed rule).....	25

Deeming Tobacco Products to be Subject to the Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act, as Amended by the Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act, 81 Fed. Reg. 28,974 (May 10, 2016) (final rule)..... 26, 27, 28

Regulation of Flavors in Tobacco Products, 83 Fed. Reg. 12,294 (proposed Mar. 21, 2018) (to be codified at 21 C.F.R. pt. 1100, 1140, 1143) ..... 4, 8, 12

**Other Authorities**

Andrea C. Villanti et al., *Association of Flavored Tobacco Use With Tobacco Initiation and Subsequent Use Among US Youth and Adults, 2013-2015*, 2(10) J. AM. MED. ASS’N NETWORK OPEN 1 (2019).....14

Andrea S. Gentzke, et al., *Tobacco Product Use Among Middle and High School Student – United States, 2020*, 69(50) MORBIDITY & MORTALITY WKLY. REP. 1881 (Dec. 18, 2020).... 20, 26, 27

B.W. Roper, *A Study of People’s Cigarette Smoking Habits and Attitudes Volume I* (1953)..17

Bridget K. Ambrose et al., *Flavored Tobacco Product Use Among US Youth Aged 12-17 Years, 2013-2014*, 314 J. AM. MED. ASS’N 17, (2015).....4, 27

Campaign for Tobacco-Free Kids et al., *Stopping Menthol, Saving Lives: Ending Big Tobacco’s Predatory Marketing to Black Communities* (Feb. 2021)..... 14, 27

Campaign for Tobacco-Free Kids, *Not Your Grandfather’s Cigar: A New Generation of Cheap and Sweet Cigars Threatens a New Generation of Kids* (2013) .....26

CDC, *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) – People with Certain Medical Conditions* (Mar. 29, 2021).....12

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.