

Nos. 20-70787, 20-70801

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL, et al.,
Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY,
Respondent.

RURAL COALITION, et al.,
Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY,
Respondent.

On Petition for Review of Final Agency Action of the
United States Environmental Protection Agency

**MOTION FOR
PARTIAL REMAND WITHOUT VACATUR**

Of Counsel:

DEVI CHANDRASEKARAN

Jean E. Williams
Acting Assistant Attorney General
Bruce S. Gelber
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

Attorney Advisor
FORREST PITTMAN
Attorney Advisor
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency
Mail Code 2333A
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20460

U.S. Environmental Protection
Agency

BENJAMIN CARLISLE
Senior Attorney
ROBERT WILLIAMS
Senior Trial Attorney
Environment and Natural Resources
Division
U.S. Department of Justice
Post Office Box 7411
Washington, D.C. 20044
(202) 514-9771 (Carlisle)
Benjamin.Carlisle@usdoj.gov
(202) 305-0206 (Williams)
Robert.P.Williams@usdoj.gov

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	ii
GLOSSARY	v
INTRODUCTION	1
BACKGROUND	2
A. Legal Background	2
1. Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act	2
2. Endangered Species Act	4
B. The Glyphosate Interim Decision.....	6
C. Procedural History	9
STANDARD OF REVIEW.....	11
ARGUMENT	12
I. Remand Is Proper to Allow EPA to Address this Court’s Subsequent Decisions and Other Intervening Events.	12
II. Vacatur of the Interim Risk Mitigation Measures Is Not Appropriate.....	18
III. Vacatur of 500+ Individual Glyphosate Product Registrations Is Not Available Relief	21
CONCLUSION	24

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Allied–Signal, Inc. v. U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Comm’n</i> , 988 F.2d 146 (D.C. Cir. 1993)	12, 19
<i>B.J. Alan Co., Inc. v. ICC</i> , 897 F.2d 561 (D.C. Cir. 1990)	14
<i>Cal. Cmty’s. Against Toxics v. EPA</i> , 688 F.3d 989 (9th Cir. 2012).....	12, 13, 14, 19
<i>Ethyl Corp. v. Browner</i> , 989 F.2d 522 (D.C. Cir. 1993)	13, 14
<i>Friends of Santa Clara River v. USACE</i> , 887 F.3d 906 (9th Cir. 2018).....	6
<i>Limnia, Inc. v. U.S. Dep’t of Energy</i> , 857 F.3d 379 (D.C. Cir. 2017)	15
<i>Motor Vehicle Mfrs. Ass’n v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.</i> , 463 U.S. 29 (1983)	13
<i>Nathan Kimmel, Inc. v. DowElanco</i> , 275 F.3d 1199 (9th Cir. 2002).....	3
<i>Nat’l Family Farm Coal. v. EPA</i> , 960 F.3d 1120 (9th Cir. 2020).....	10, 16
<i>Nat’l Family Farm Coal. v. EPA</i> , 966 F.3d 893 (9th Cir. 2020).....	6, 10, 16
<i>Pollinator Stewardship Council v. EPA</i> , 806 F.3d 520 (9th Cir. 2015).....	20

Reckitt Benckiser Inc. v. EPA,
613 F.3d 1131 (D.C. Cir. 2010) 4, 23

SKF USA, Inc. v. United States,
254 F.3d 1022 (Fed. Cir. 2001) 13, 14, 15

Sw. Ctr. for Biological Diversity v. U.S. Forest Serv.,
100 F.3d 1443 (9th Cir. 1996)..... 5

Statutes

7 U.S.C. § 136(bb) 4

7 U.S.C. § 136a(a) 3

7 U.S.C. § 136a(c)(1)(A)-(F) 3

7 U.S.C. § 136a(c)(5) 3

7 U.S.C. § 136a(d)(1)..... 3

7 U.S.C. § 136a(g) 4

7 U.S.C. § 136a(g)(1)(A)(i) 23

7 U.S.C. § 136a(g)(1)(A)(iii) 24

7 U.S.C. § 136a(g)(1)(A)(iii)(I) 19

7 U.S.C. § 136a(g)(1)(A)(v) 23

7 U.S.C. § 136d(b) 4, 5, 23

7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(G) 4

16 U.S.C. § 1536(a)(2)..... 5

16 U.S.C. § 1536(b)(3)..... 6

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.