

No. 20-73203

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

**AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS; AMERICAN FEDERATION
OF STATE, COUNTY AND MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES; WASHINGTON
STATE NURSES ASSOCIATION; UNITED NURSES ASSOCIATION OF
CALIFORNIA,**

Petitioners,

v.

**OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH ADMINISTRATION; UNITED
STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR; EUGENE SCALIA, in his official
capacity as Secretary of the United States Department of Labor,**

Respondents.

On Petition for a Writ of Mandamus

**DEPARTMENT OF LABOR'S OPPOSITION TO THE
PETITION FOR A WRIT OF MANDAMUS**

KATE S. O'SCANNLAIN
Solicitor of Labor

EDMUND C. BAIRD
Associate Solicitor for
Occupational Safety and Health

HEATHER R. PHILLIPS
Counsel for Appellate Litigation

JOSEPH G. GILLILAND
Attorney
U.S. Department of Labor
200 Constitution Ave., NW, Rm. S-4004
Washington, DC 20210
(202) 693-5636

December 31, 2020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
INTRODUCTION	1
STATEMENT OF THE CASE	
I. Statutory and Regulatory Framework.....	2
II. Background	
A. OSHA’s Response to Petitioners’ 2009 H1N1-Related Requests.....	5
B. OSHA’s Ongoing Response to COVID-19	10
C. The D.C. Circuit Petition	12
STANDARD OF REVIEW	12
ARGUMENT	13
I. The Petitioners Lack Standing For Their Claim	14
II. The Petition Is Barred by Res Judicata	20
III. The Petitioners Are Not Entitled to a Writ of Mandamus Because the Secretary is Under No Duty to Issue an Infectious Diseases NPRM or Final Standard.....	23
A. The Secretary Possesses Broad Discretion in Setting Safety and Health Standards and in Deciding Rulemaking Priorities	24
B. OSHA Has not Determined that an Infectious Diseases Standard Should Issue	26

IV. The Secretary’s Decision to Place the Infectious Diseases Rulemaking on the Long-Term Agenda and in the Meantime to Address the Hazard of Infectious Diseases by Other Means Was Reasonable	30
--	----

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases	Page(s)
<i>Pub. Citizen Health Research Grp. v. Chao</i> , 314 F.3d 143 (3d Cir. 2002)	29
<i>Pub. Citizen Health Research Grp. v. Auchter</i> , 702 F.2d 1150 (D.C. Cir. 1983).....	29
<i>Am. Diabetes Ass’n v. United States Dep’t of the Army</i> , 938 F.3d 1147 (9th Cir. 2019)	19
<i>Associated Gen. Contractors of Am., San Diego Chapter, Inc. v. Cal. Dep’t of Transp.</i> , 713 F.3d 1187 (9th Cir. 2013)	15
<i>Bldg. & Const. Trades Dep’t, AFL-CIO v. Brock</i> , 838 F.2d 1258 (D.C. Cir. 1988).....	24
<i>Cunningham v. United States</i> , 786 F.2d 1445 (9th Cir. 1986)	23, 24
<i>Donovan v. Royal Logging Co.</i> , 645 F.2d 822 (9th Cir. 1981)	3, 6, 7, 33
<i>Dutta v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Ins. Co.</i> , 895 F.3d 1166 (9th Cir. 2018)	20
<i>Heckler v. Chaney</i> , 470 U.S. 821 (1985).....	25
<i>In re A Community Voice</i> , 878 F.3d 779 (9th Cir. 2017)	13, 30
<i>In re Am. Fed’n of Labor & Cong. of Indus. Orgs.</i> , 2020 WL 3125324 (D.C. Cir. June 11, 2020)	12, 23, 28
<i>In re Barr Labs., Inc.</i> , 930 F.2d 72 (D.C. Cir. 1991).....	29

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.