

Nos. 21-16506 & 21-16695

---

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

---

EPIC GAMES, INC.,

*Plaintiff, Counter-Defendant–Appellant, Cross-Appellee*

v.

APPLE, INC.,

*Defendant, Counterclaimant–Appellee, Cross-Appellant*

---

On Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Northern District of California  
No. 4:20-cv-05640-YGR-TSH  
The Honorable Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

---

**BRIEF OF THE AMERICAN ANTITRUST INSTITUTE AS AMICUS  
CURIAE IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF, COUNTER-DEFENDANT–  
APPELLANT**

---

LAURA M. ALEXANDER

*Counsel of Record*

RANDY M. STUTZ

AMERICAN ANTITRUST INSTITUTE

1025 Connecticut Avenue, NW

Suite 1000

Washington, DC 20036

(202) 276-4050

lalexander@antitrustinstitute.org

*Counsel for Amicus Curiae*

January 27, 2022

---

## **CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

Pursuant to Appellate Rule 26.1(a), the American Antitrust Institute states that it is a nonprofit, non-stock corporation. It has no parent corporations, and no publicly traded corporations have an ownership interest in it.

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT..... i**

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ..... iii**

**INTEREST OF AMICUS CURIAE..... 1**

**INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT ..... 2**

**ARGUMENT..... 5**

**I. COURTS MUST DEFINE MARKETS CONSISTENT WITH FIRST PRINCIPLES OF ANTITRUST LAW ..... 5**

**A. The District Court’s Opinion Cannot be Squared with First Principles of Antitrust Law Reflected in *Kodak*..... 5**

**B. The District Court Did Not Properly Assess Apple’s Conduct as It Relates to the Source of Apple’s Market Power ..... 10**

**C. A Common Error Underlies the District Court’s Failure to Recognize Distinct Markets in at Least Two Instances ..... 14**

**D. *AmEx* Applies Only to the Narrow Economic Circumstances that Underly Its Departure from Well-established Market Definition Principles..... 21**

**II. UPHOLDING THE DECISION BELOW WOULD PROVIDE A ROADMAP FOR PLATFORMS TO EVADE FEDERAL ANTITRUST LAWS WITH ENORMOUS IMPLICATIONS FOR CONSUMERS, DEVELOPERS, AND MARKETS ..... 29**

**CONCLUSION ..... 31**

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### CASES

<i>American Needle, Inc. v. National Football League</i> , 560 U.S. 183 (2010) .....	3
<i>Apple, Inc. v. Pepper</i> , 139 S.Ct. 1514 (2019) .....	29
<i>Digidyne Corp. v. Data Gen. Corp.</i> , 734 F.2d 1336 (9th Cir. 1984).....	19
<i>Eastman Kodak Co. v. Image Tech. Servs.</i> , 540 U.S. 451 (1992) .....	passim
<i>Eastman Kodak Co. v. Image Tech. Servs.</i> , 903 F.2d 612 (9th Cir. 1990).....	19
<i>Image Tech. Servs. v. Eastman Kodak Co.</i> , 125 F.3d 1195 (9th Cir. 1997).....	11
<i>Jefferson Parish Hosp. Dist. No. 2 v. Hyde</i> , 466 U.S. 2 (1984) .....	2, 17, 19
<i>Leegin Creative Leather Prods., Inc. v. PSKS, Inc.</i> , 551 U.S. 877 (2007) .....	23
<i>Nat'l Soc'y of Prof'l Eng'rs v. United States</i> , 435 U.S. 679 (1978) .....	2
<i>Newcal Industries, Inc. v. IKON Office Solutions</i> , 513 F.3d 1038 (9th Cir. 2008).....	8
<i>Ohio v. American Express</i> , 138 S. Ct. 2274 (2018) .....	passim
<i>Rick-Mik Enters., Inc. v. Equilon Enters. LLC</i> , 532 F.3d 963 (9th Cir. 2008).....	17, 18

<i>Times-Picayune Publishing Co. v. United States</i> , 345 U.S. 594 (1953) .....	11, 25
<i>United States v. Microsoft Corp.</i> , 253 F.3d 34 (D.C. Cir. 2001) (en banc) .....	19
<i>United States v. Sabre Corp.</i> , 452 F. Supp. 3d 97 (D. Del. 2020) .....	24
<u>OTHER AUTHORITIES</u>	
Brief for Petitioner Apple, <i>Apple, Inc. v. Pepper</i> , No. 17-204, 139 S. Ct. 1514 (filed Aug. 10, 2018) .....	26, 27, 28
Daniel J. Solove, <i>The Myth of the Privacy Paradox</i> , 89 GEO. WASH. L. REV. 1 (Jan. 2021) .....	30
Dennis W. Carlton, <i>The Anticompetitive Effects of Vertical Most-Favored-Nation Restraints and the Error of Amex</i> , 2019 Columbia Bus. L. Rev. 93 (2019) .....	22, 24
Donald Turner, <i>Antitrust Policy and the Cellophane Case</i> , 70 Harv. L. Rev. 281 (1956) .....	16
Fed. Trade Comm’n & U.S. Dep’t of Just., Antitrust Div., Horizontal Merger Guidelines (2010) .....	16, 28
Federal Trade Comm’n & U.S. Dep’t of Justice, Commentary on the Horizontal Merger Guidelines (2006) .....	28
Herbert Hovenkamp, <i>Platforms and the Rule of Reason: The American Express Case</i> , 2019 COLUMBIA BUS. L. REV. 35 (2019) .....	22
Jack Kirkwood, <i>Antitrust and Two-Sided Platforms: The Failure of American Express</i> , 41 CARDOZO L. REV. 1805 (2020) .....	22
Jeffrey Harrison, <i>Ohio v. American Express: Misunderstanding Two-Sided Platforms; the Charge Card “Market;” and the Need for Procompetitive Justifications</i> , 70 MERCER L. REV. 437 (2019) .....	22

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.