

No. 21-71180

---

---

IN THE  
**United States Court of Appeals**  
for the Ninth Circuit

---

CENTER FOR FOOD SAFETY AND CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY,  
*Petitioners,*

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, et al.,  
*Respondents.*

---

ON PETITION FOR REVIEW FROM THE UNITED STATES  
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

---

**BASF CORPORATION'S MOTION TO INTERVENE**

John C. Cruden  
Kathryn E. Szmuszkovicz  
David A. Barker  
BEVERIDGE & DIAMOND, P.C.  
1900 N Street, N.W., Suite 100  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
(202) 789-6000  
jcc@bdlaw.com  
kes@bdlaw.com  
dab@bdlaw.com

*Counsel for Proposed Intervenor  
BASF Corporation*

## CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 7.1 and Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 26.1, counsel for Proposed Intervenor BASF Corporation (“BASF”) certifies that BASF Corporation is a Delaware Corporation whose shares are not publicly traded. BASF Corporation is a wholly owned subsidiary of BASF USA Holding LLC, a Delaware limited liability company. BASF USA Holding LLC is a wholly owned subsidiary of BASF Nederland BV, a Dutch limited liability company. BASF Nederland BV is a wholly owned subsidiary of BASF SE (Societas Europaea – “SE”), a publicly traded European company. Further, no publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of BASF Corporation's stock.

August 13, 2021

/s/ Kathryn E. Szmuszkovicz

Kathryn E. Szmuszkovicz  
BEVERIDGE & DIAMOND PC  
1900 N Street, N.W., Suite 100  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
(202) 789-6037  
kes@bdlaw.com

*Counsel for Proposed Intervenor  
BASF Corporation*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION .....	1
II.	BACKGROUND .....	3
A.	Regulatory Framework.....	3
1.	FIFRA’s Comprehensive Regulation Of Pesticides .....	3
2.	ESA And Its Implementation For Pesticides .....	5
B.	The Challenged Registrations .....	6
III.	ARGUMENT.....	7
A.	Allowing BASF To Intervene Serves the Policies Underlying Intervention As Of Right.....	8
1.	The Motion Is Timely .....	9
2.	BASF Has A Significantly Protectable Interest In The Subject Matter Of This Action.....	10
3.	The Disposition of This Action May Impair or Impede BASF’s Ability to Protect Its Interests .....	12
4.	BASF’s Interests Are Not Adequately Represented by EPA Or Other Parties.....	13
B.	Allowing BASF To Intervene Serves the Policies Underlying Permissive Intervention.....	16
IV.	CONCLUSION.....	18

## I. INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to Rule 15(d) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure, BASF Corporation (“BASF”) respectfully moves for leave to intervene on behalf of Respondents in the above-captioned Petition for Review. BASF contacted counsel for the parties and Respondents’ counsel indicated they do not oppose the motion. Petitioners’ counsel indicated that they would reserve their position until after reviewing the motion.

BASF’s direct interest in this action justifies intervention. BASF owns the registrations issued by the United States Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA” or “the Agency”) for herbicide products containing the new active ingredient trifludimoxazin that Petitioners seek to challenge in this action. Petition at 2; Petition Exhibit A at 3. The registrations are federal licenses issued under the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act (“FIFRA”), 7 U.S.C. § 136 *et seq.*, without which BASF cannot distribute and sell herbicide products containing trifludimoxazin, including its Tirexor product.

On May 25, 2021, EPA granted BASF registrations for Tirexor Herbicide Technical, a technical product containing 99.2% trifludimoxazin, and Tirexor Herbicide, an end-use product containing trifludimoxazin. These registrations allow BASF to produce and sell Tirexor for use on agricultural fields and in non-

agricultural settings to control broadleaf and grass weed species. Trifludimoxazin provides growers an important new tool for control of waterhemp and palmer amaranth in crops, including corn and soybean, where PPO-inhibitor-resistant weeds are present.<sup>1</sup> Its unique properties provide effective weed control and help manage increasing challenges posed by herbicide-resistant weeds.<sup>2</sup>

Petitioners ask this Court to find unlawful EPA's May 12, 2021 Registration Decision and the Agency's May 25, 2021 orders granting the trifludimoxazin registrations, to set aside or vacate the registrations, and to stop the use and sale of trifludimoxazin herbicide products authorized by the registrations. Petition at 2.

The requirements for intervention under Rule 15(d) are satisfied. BASF's request is timely, BASF's trifludimoxazin registrations are the registrations Petitioners seek to vacate, and BASF's ability to protect its interests in its registrations would be impaired by an adverse disposition. Finally, as courts have repeatedly held in similar actions, BASF's private interests will not be adequately represented by EPA. In defending its registration decisions, the Agency takes into account broader interests and objectives that diverge from BASF's more specific

---

<sup>1</sup> Memorandum Supporting Decision to Approve Registration for the New Active Ingredient, Trifludimoxazin (May 12, 2021) ("Registration Memorandum"), Petition Exhibit A at 3, 19.

<sup>2</sup> Registration Memorandum at 19.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.