

**Docket No. 22-35652**

---

**In the United States Court of Appeals  
For the Ninth Circuit**

---

In re: INTEL CORP. CPU MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES  
AND PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION:

JIMAYA GOMEZ, RYAN CLARK, LOUISA FERRER, PAMELA GREEN, CARLO GARCIA,  
BRUCE BODOFSKY, LINDA PHILLIPS, SCHWARTZ EYE ASSOCIATES, P.A., JUBAL MALAY,  
JOSEPH PHILLIPS, KENNETH WOOLSEY, CLAUDE VOGEL, JUSTIN WHIPPO, DAVID  
COPELAND, KOTTEMANN ORTHODONTICS, P.L.L.C., ALLIANCE HEALTHCARE SYSTEM, INC.,  
KEVIN CRAWFORD, EMILIO RODRIGUEZ, AMY STOREY, GEORGE APPLE, KORY JENO,  
ZACHARY RICHARD, CITY OF NEW CASTLE, MARGARITE SAMPSON, CASSANDRA PAYNE,  
ALMA JENNINGS, JAMES BRADSHAW, JORDAN ROBBINS, VICTORIA BELLE DUNN,  
ROBERT KEY, JAMAL ELAKRAH, KATHLEEN GREER, HIBBITS INSURANCE, JERRY PEACOCK,  
CAROL MARZIALE, BLUE PEAKS HOSTING, LLC, MICHAEL NELSON, JACK MEZZELL,  
TITI RICAFORT, ANDREW EAST, BARRY WAYNE BROWNING, MICHAEL STRAUB,  
ZOG, INC., ARTESIA GENERAL HOSPITAL, and DK SYSTEMS, INC.,

*Plaintiffs-Appellants,*

v.

INTEL CORPORATION, a Delaware Corporation,

*Defendant-Appellee.*

---

*Appeal from a Decision of the United States District Court for the District of Oregon, Portland,  
No. 3:18-md-02828-SI · Honorable Michael H. Simon*

---

---

**APPELLANTS' OPENING BRIEF**

---

CHRISTOPHER A. SEEGER  
DIOGENES P. KEKATOS  
CHRISTOPHER L. AYERS  
SEEGER WEISS LLP  
55 Challenger Road, 6th Floor  
Ridgefield Park, New Jersey 07660  
(212) 584-0700 Telephone  
cseeger@seegerweiss.com  
dkekatos@seegerweiss.com  
cayers@seegerweiss.com

ROSEMARY M. RIVAS  
GIBBS LAW GROUP LLP  
1111 Broadway, Suite 2100  
Oakland, California 94607  
(510) 350-9700 Telephone  
rmr@classlawgroup.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs-Appellants*

**Additional Counsel Listed on Inside cover**



COUNSEL PRESS · (213) 680-2300

PRINTED ON RECYCLED PAPER



JENNIFER L. JOOST  
KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER  
& CHECK LLP  
One Sansome Street, Suite 1850  
San Francisco, California 94104  
(415) 400-3000 Telephone  
jjoost@ktmc.com

STUART A. DAVIDSON  
ROBBINS GELLER RUDMAN  
& DOWD LLP  
120 East Palmetto Park Road, Suite 500  
Boca Raton, Florida 33432  
(561) 750-3000 Telephone  
sdavidson@rgrdlaw.com

CHARLES E. SCHAFER  
LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN LLP  
510 Walnut Street, Suite 500  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19106  
(215) 592-1500 Telephone  
cschaffer@lfsblaw.com

STEVE D. LARSON  
JENNIFER S. WAGNER  
STOLL STOLL BERNE LOKTING  
& SHLACHTER P.C.  
209 SW Oak Street, Fifth Floor  
Portland, Oregon 97204  
(503) 227-1600 Telephone  
slarson@stollberne.com  
jwagner@stollberne.com

GAYLE M. BLATT  
CASEY GERRY SCHENK FRANCAVILLA  
BLATT & PENFIELD LLP  
110 Laurel Street  
San Diego, California 92101  
(619) 238-1811 Telephone  
gmb@cglaw.com

ADAM J. LEVITT  
DICELO LEVITT LLC  
Ten North Dearborn Street, Sixth Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60602  
(312) 214-7900 Telephone  
alevitt@dicellolevitt.com

MICHAEL R. CASHMAN  
HELLMUTH & JOHNSON PLLC  
8050 West 78th Street  
Edina, Minnesota 55439  
(952) 941-4005 Telephone  
mcashman@hjlawfirm.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs-Appellants*

## **CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

Plaintiffs-Appellants Alliance Healthcare System, Inc., Artesia General Hospital, Blue Peaks Hosting, LLC, City of New Castle, DK Systems, Inc., Hibbits Insurance, Kottemann Orthodontics, P.L.L.C., Schwartz Eye Associates, P.A., and Zog, Inc. are not publicly traded corporations and no publicly held corporation owns 10% or more of their stock.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	iv
INTRODUCTION .....	1
JURISDICTIONAL STATEMENT .....	4
ISSUES PRESENTED FOR REVIEW .....	4
STATEMENT OF THE CASE .....	5
A. Background of the Litigation .....	5
1. Fundamental Processor Security Requires That Different Users Are “Isolated” from Each Other.....	6
2. Intel Removes Fundamental Security, Thereby Allowing Unauthorized Access .....	8
3. Intel Conceals the Defects .....	10
4. The Defects Uniquely Expose Intel CPUs to Numerous Exploits .....	11
5. Intel Conceals the Exploits .....	12
6. The Intel CPU Exploits Are Genuine, Not Theoretical.....	13
7. Intel’s Mitigations Do Not Genuinely Fix the Defects.....	14
B. Proceedings in the District Court .....	16
1. The District Court Contingently Sustains Several of Plaintiffs’ Claims .....	16
2. On Materially Identical Allegations, the District Court Then Rejects Claims It Had Determined to Be Cognizable .....	18

3.	The District Court Then Upholds Some Claims but Trims Them to Cover Only Seven Plaintiffs Who Purchased Intel-Powered Equipment on or After September 1, 2017.....	19
4.	The District Court Again Changes Course and Dismisses Even the Claims That It Had Pared Down .....	21
	STANDARD OF REVIEW .....	23
	SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT .....	24
	ARGUMENT .....	30
I.	PLAINTIFFS AMPLY PLEADED UNFAIR CONDUCT-BASED CLAIMS .....	30
A.	The District Court’s March 2021 About-Face on Plaintiffs’ Unfair Conduct-Based Claims After Having Previously Held That Those Claims Were Viable Was Marred by Legal and Factual Error .....	31
B.	The District Court’s Subsequent Rejection of Plaintiffs’ Unfair Conduct-Based Claims as Overlapping with Their Omission-Based Claims Also Rested on Legal and Factual Error .....	40
C.	At a Minimum, the District Court Abused Its Discretion in Granting Reconsideration and Dismissing the Unfair Conduct-Based Claims That It Had Pared Down .....	48
II.	PLAINTIFFS AMPLY PLEADED OMISSION-BASED CLAIMS .....	53
A.	Applicable Standards .....	54
B.	Plaintiffs Satisfied the <i>LiMandri</i> Test .....	57
1.	Intel Had Knowledge of the Defects as Early as 2006.....	57
2.	Plaintiffs Did Not Know About the Defects Before January 2018 and Could Not Reasonably Have Discovered Them.....	64

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.