

No. 18-9507

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE TENTH CIRCUIT

SIERRA CLUB,
Petitioner,

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY et al.,
Respondents,

**STATE OF UTAH'S PETITION FOR PANEL REHEARING OR
REHEARING EN BANC**

SEAN D. REYES (7969)
Utah Attorney General
CHRISTIAN C. STEPHENS (9068)
MARINA V. THOMAS (11251)
Assistant Utah Attorneys General
Utah Attorney General's Office
195 North 1950 West, P.O. Box 140873
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114-0873
Telephone: (801) 536-0290
Counsel for Intervenor State of Utah

Table of Contents

FEDERAL RULE OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE 35(B) STATEMENT.....	1
INTRODUCTION	2
ARGUMENT	4
I. The Opinion Directly Conflicts with the Fifth Circuit's Decision Interpreting the Same EPA Order and will Spur Additional Conflicting Decisions	5
A. The Opinion and the Fifth Circuit Decision Conflict in Several Fundamental Ways	5
B. The Opinion's Plain Meaning Analysis Failed to Consider the Impact on Utah's SIP and Fails to Give Effect to all Relevant Provisions of the CAA.....	8
C. The Opinion Will Likely Result in Conflicting Federal and State Judicial Decisions	11
D. The Opinion Imposes Unworkable Burdens on the State Permitting Agency.....	12
II. Panel Rehearing is Necessary Because the Opinion Misapprehended the Requirements of Utah's SIP	14
CONCLUSION	16

Table of Authorities

Cases

<i>Corley v. United States</i> , 556 U.S. 303 (2009)	9
<i>Env't Integrity Project v. U.S. EPA</i> , 960 F.3d 236 (5th Cir. May 29, 2020), <i>superseded</i> , 969 F.3d 529.....	4
<i>Env't Integrity Project v. U.S. EPA</i> , 969 F.3d 529 (5th Cir. Aug. 13, 2020).....	passim
<i>Jake's Fireworks Inc. v. Acosta</i> , 893 F.3d 1248 (10th Cir. 2018)	9
<i>Public Citizen v. U.S. Dept. of Justice</i> , 491 U.S. 440 (1989)	9, 12
<i>Sierra Club v. EPA</i> , Case No. 18-9507 (10th Cir. Feb. 6, 2018).....	4
<i>Sierra Club v. Leavitt</i> , 368 F.3d 1300 (11th Cir. 2004)	6
<i>Sierra Club v. Oklahoma Gas & Electric Co.</i> , 816 F.3d 666 (10th Cir. 2016).....	12
<i>U.S. Sugar Corp. v. EPA</i> , 830 F.3d 579 (D.C. Cir. 2016)	6
<i>U.S. v. EME Homer City Generation, L.P.</i> , 727 F.3d 274 (3rd Cir. 2013).....	6
<i>US Magnesium, LLC v. U.S. EPA</i> , 690 F.3d 1157 (10th Cir. 2012)	10
<i>Utility Air Regulatory Grp. v. EPA</i> , 573 U.S. 302 (2014)	6

Federal Statutes

42 U.S.C. § 7409	2
42 U.S.C. § 7410(a)(1)	2

iii

42 U.S.C. § 7410(a)(2)(C)	2
42 U.S.C. § 7479(1).....	2
42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1).....	11
42 U.S.C. § 7661	2
42 U.S.C. § 7661a(b)(5)(B)	2
42 U.S.C. § 7661c(a)	2
42 U.S.C. § 7661d(a).....	2
42 U.S.C. § 7661d(b)(1)	3
42 U.S.C. § 7661d(b)(2)	3, 14
42 U.S.C. § 7661d(c).....	13
42 U.S.C. § 7661f.....	2

Federal Regulations

40 C.F.R. § 51.166(a)(1)-(2).....	2
40 C.F.R. § 51.166(a)(7).....	2
40 C.F.R. § 70.1(b).....	6

Rules

10th Cir. R. 40.1(A)	14
Fed. R. App. P. 35(b)(1)(B)	1, 5
Fed. R. App. P. 40	1
Fed. R. App. P. 40(a)(2).....	14

State Statutes

Utah Code § 19-1-301.5.....	2
Utah Code § 63-46b-14 (1997)	10
Utah Code §63-46b-16 (1997)	10

State Regulations

Utah Admin. Code R305-7	2
Utah Admin. Code R307-1-2.5.1(a) (1992)	10
Utah Admin. Code R307-401-6(2).....	13
Utah Admin. Code R307-401-6(3).....	13

Federal Register

59 Fed. Reg. 35,036 (July 8, 1994)	10
60 Fed. Reg. 30,192 (June 8, 1995)	2

Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.