

THE HONORABLE JAMES L. ROBART

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

STEVEN VANCE, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

No. 2:20-cv-01082-JLR

v.

**DEFENDANT MICROSOFT
CORPORATION'S MOTION FOR
SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

MICROSOFT CORPORATION,

Defendant.

NOTE ON MOTION CALENDAR:
January 14, 2022

ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED

Davis Wright Tremaine LLP

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

INTRODUCTION 1

UNDISPUTED MATERIAL FACTS 3

 A. Flickr and the Yahoo-Created YFCC100M Dataset 3

 B. The IBM-Created DiF Dataset..... 4

 C. Plaintiffs’ Flickr Photos 5

 D. Microsoft Contractor Benjamin Skrainka’s Download of the IBM DiF Dataset..... 6

 E. Microsoft Student Intern Samira Samadi’s Download of the IBM DiF Dataset..... 8

ARGUMENT 10

I. Illinois’ BIPA Statute Does Not—and Cannot Constitutionally—Apply to Microsoft’s Out-of-State Activities. 10

 A. BIPA Does Not Apply Extraterritorially and Microsoft Did Not Engage in Conduct “Primarily and Substantially” in Illinois. 11

 1. The Undisputed Facts Confirm Microsoft’s Conduct Occurred Entirely Outside Illinois 11

 2. Microsoft’s Alleged BIPA Violation Had No Connection to Illinois 13

 3. Plaintiffs’ Illinois Residency Alone Cannot Satisfy Illinois’ Extraterritoriality Doctrine..... 15

 B. Applying BIPA to Microsoft’s Out-of-State Conduct Here Would Violate the Dormant Commerce Clause. 17

 1. Plaintiffs May Not Use BIPA to Regulate Conduct Occurring Entirely Outside of Illinois’ Borders..... 18

 2. BIPA’s Application Here Would Conflict with Washington and New York Biometric Privacy Law. 19

II. The Court Should Grant Summary Judgment on the Unjust Enrichment Claim..... 21

CONCLUSION..... 23

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Federal Cases	
<i>Chinatown Neighborhood Ass'n v. Harris</i> , 794 F.3d 1136 (9th Cir. 2015)	18
<i>Cleary v. Philip Morris Inc.</i> , 656 F.3d 511 (7th Cir. 2011)	22
<i>Cousineau v. Microsoft Corp.</i> , 992 F. Supp. 2d 1116 (W.D. Wash. 2012).....	22
<i>Daniels Sharpsmart, Inc. v. Smith</i> , 889 F.3d 608 (9th Cir. 2018)	17, 18, 19
<i>David K. Lindemuth Co. v. Shannon Fin. Corp.</i> , 637 F. Supp. 991 (N.D. Cal. 1986)	15
<i>Healy v. Beer Institute, Inc.</i> , 491 U.S. 324 (1989).....	18
<i>Hernandez v. Spacelabs Med. Inc.</i> , 343 F.3d 1107 (9th Cir. 2003)	13
<i>Hesketh v. Total Renal Care, Inc.</i> , 2021 WL 5761610 (W.D. Wash. Dec. 3, 2021) (Robart, J.)	10
<i>Iancu v. Brunetti</i> , 139 S. Ct. 2294 (2019).....	11
<i>Matsushita Elec. Indus. Co. v. Zenith Radio Corp.</i> , 475 U.S. 574 (1986).....	10
<i>Mazza v. Am. Honda Co., Inc.</i> , 666 F.3d 581 (9th Cir. 2012)	20
<i>McGoveran v. Amazon Web Services, Inc.</i> , 2021 WL 4502089 (D. Del. Sept. 30, 2021).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Monroy v. Shutterfly</i> , 2017 WL 4099846 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 15, 2017)	16, 17
<i>Nat'l Collegiate Athletic Ass'n v. Miller</i> , 10 F.3d 633 (9th Cir. 1993)	20

1 *Reyn’s Pasta Bella, LLC v. Visa USA, Inc.*,
 442 F.3d 741 (9th Cir. 2006) 3

2

3 *Rivera v. Google*,
 238 F.Supp.3d 1088 (N.D. Ill. 2017) 16

4 *Sam Francis Found. v. Christies, Inc.*,
 784 F.3d 1320 (9th Cir. 2015) 18, 19

5

6 *Super Pawn Jewelry & Loan, LLC v. Am. Envtl. Energy, Inc.*,
 2013 WL 1337303 (N.D. Ill. Mar. 29, 2013)..... 16

7

8 *United States v. Pappadopoulos*,
 64 F.3d 522 (9th Cir. 1995), *abrogated on other grounds by Jones v. United*
 9 *States*, 529 U.S. 848 (2000) 18

10 *Vulcan Golf, LLC v. Google Inc.*,
 552 F. Supp. 2d 752 (N.D. Ill. 2008) 16

11 **State Cases**

12

13 *Corsello v. Verizon New York, Inc.*,
 967 N.E.2d 1177 (N.Y. 2012)..... 22

14 *Landau v. CNA Fin. Corp.*,
 15 886 N.E.2d 405 (Ill. App. 2008) 11

16 *People v. Scheib*,
 390 N.E.2d 872 (Ill. 1979) 11

17 **State Statutes**

18

19 740 ILCS 14 *passim*

20 740 ILCS 14/5(b) 11

21 740 ILCS 14/15(b) *passim*

22 New York City Code § 22-1201 20

23 New York City Code § 22-1202 20

24 RCW 19.375 1, 19

25 RCW 19.375.010(1) 19

26 RCW 19.375.010(4) 19

27 RCW 19.375.020 19

MICROSOFT’S MOTION

Davis Wright Tremaine LLP

1 RCW 19.375.020(1).....19

2 RCW 19.375.101(5).....19

3 **Rules**

4 Fed. R. Civ. P. 23.....23

5 Fed. R. Civ. P. 56(a)10

6 **Constitutional Provisions**

7 U.S. Constitution Commerce Clause17

8 **Other Authorities**

9 Bart Thomee et al., “YFCC100M: The New Data in Multimedia Research,”3

10 Communications of the ACM, 59(2), 2016, at 66,

11 <https://dl.acm.org/doi/pdf/10.1145/2812802>3, 4

12 Creative Commons, About The Licenses, <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/>3, 5, 14

13 Flickr, How to Change Your License on Flickr [https://www.flickrhelp.com/hc/en-](https://www.flickrhelp.com/hc/en-us/articles/4404078674324-Change-Your-Photo-s-License-in-Flickr)

14 [us/articles/4404078674324-Change-Your-Photo-s-License-in-Flickr](https://www.flickrhelp.com/hc/en-us/articles/4404078674324-Change-Your-Photo-s-License-in-Flickr) (accessed

15 Dec. 6, 2021).....3

16 State of Delaware, Department of State: Division of Corporations, Business

17 Search Results for Flickr Inc. and Yahoo, Inc.,

18 <https://icis.corp.delaware.gov/eCorp/EntitySearch/NameSearch.aspx>

19 (accessed Dec. 6, 2021)3

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.